



DOI: 10.24014/Jush.v29i1.11463

p-ISSN: 1412-0909

e-ISSN: 2407-8247

## A Critical Analysis of The Existence of *Da'if* Hadith (Weak Hadith) in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari*

Habiburrahman Rizapoor,<sup>1</sup> Mohammad Anwar Zafari<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Badakhshan University Afghanistan & Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>Badakhshan University Afghanistan  
habibraghi@gmail.com

### Article Information

Received: November 21, 2020

Revised: December 29, 2020

Accepted: February 22, 2021

### Keywords

*Da'if* Hadith, *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari*, *al-Ṣaḥīḥain*

### Abstract

*This research aims to find out whether all the hadiths narrated in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari are valid and correct or there are also da'if and weak hadiths. In this article, the researcher has used the descriptive and content analysis method by referring to scientific articles, books of principles of hadith. Hadith annotation books and other books in which the subject has been discussed. In this article, the writer discusses the views and arguments of the scholars who claim that there are consensuses that the book of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari is the most correct book after the Qur'an and there is no da'if hadith in it. Similarly, the writer discusses the views of the scholars who argue that all the hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari are not authentic and there are hadiths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari which are not authentic and are da'if. By considering the arguments of both sides, the writer concludes that Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari is the most correct book after the Holy Qur'an, nevertheless, this does not mean that there are no da'if hadiths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari and there are many hadiths that are called da'if by the scholars of hadith. Also, the existence of da'if hadiths in the book of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari does not decrease the scientific ranking and status and level of acceptance of the book and prophetic hadith among the ummah and scholars of Hadith*

### Kata Kunci

*Hadits da'if, Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari, al-Ṣaḥīḥain*

### Abstrak

*Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui apakah semua Hadits yang diriwayatkan dalam Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari itu valid dan benar atau ada juga Hadith da'if dan lemah. Dalam artikel ini, peneliti menggunakan metode deskriptif dan analisis isi dengan mengacu pada artikel ilmiah, kitab-*

*kitab prinsip Hadits, buku penjelasan Hadits, dan buku-buku lain yang subjeknya telah dibahas. Dalam artikel ini penulis membahas tentang pandangan dan dalil para ulama yang menyatakan adanya konsensus bahwa kitab Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari adalah kitab yang paling benar setelah al-Qur'an dan tidak ada Hadits ḍa'if di dalamnya. Demikian pula dengan pandangan para ulama yang berpendapat bahwa semua Hadits Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari itu otentik dan ada Hadits dalam Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari yang tidak otentik dan bersifat ḍa'if. Dengan memperhatikan dalil kedua belah pihak, penulis menyimpulkan bahwa Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari adalah kitab yang paling benar setelah al-Qur'an, namun hal ini tidak berarti bahwa tidak ada Hadits ḍa'if di dalam Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari dan banyak Hadits yang disebut ḍa'if oleh para ulama Hadits. Selain itu, keberadaan Hadits ḍa'if dalam kitab Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari tidak menurunkan peringkat dan status ilmiah serta tingkat penerimaan kitab dan Hadits kenabian di kalangan ummat dan ulama hadits.*

## Introduction

Imam Bukhari's complete name is Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Isma'il bin Ibrahim bin Mughirah bin Bardazbeh al-Ju'fi; he was born in 194 hijrah. He is one of the great scholars of Hadith who combined the science of Hadith, Islamic Jurisprudence, and the worship of Allah. Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal says there is not a great scholar like Muhammad bin Isma'il Bukhari in Khurasan. He has written many books such as *Al-Adab al-Mufrad*, *Al-Tarikh al-Kabir*, *Al-Tarikh al-Awsat*, *Al-Tarikh al-Saghir*, *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari* and many other books. Imam Bukhari passed away when he was 62 years old in 256 hijrah<sup>1</sup>

Bukhari's collection is known as the most authentic collection of Sunnah of the prophet (SAW) however, it is important to realize that this is not a complete collection of all the hadiths of the prophet and there are authentic hadiths that are out of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari. He spent 16 years writing his book, he used to perform ablution and pray two *rak'ah naful* prayer. Also, he was very careful in narrating hadiths and imposed very hard conditions that all narrators and testers must comply with. For example, he thinks that

a narrator must have a strong memory, and be honest, and just.<sup>2</sup>

Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari is believed to be one of the most authoritative books of Hadith, and even many Muslim scholars claim that it is the most authentic book after the Holy Qur'an. Imam al-Bukhari narrated 7397 Hadiths that are *al-Marfu'* and *al-Mawsul* with repeated one and 2602 without repetitions, 1341 *al-mu'alaq* Hadiths with repeated one and 159 without repetition.<sup>3</sup> Imam Bukhari says about his book *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari*: I never add a Hadith in my book but I did a *wuḍu'* before that and prayed two *raka'ah*, also, he says that I have not entered a Hadith in *al-Jami' al-Ṣaḥīḥ* except after I did *Istikharah* and prayed two *raka'ah* prayers and became certain of its validity.<sup>4</sup>

Imam al-'Uqaili said: When al-Bukhari wrote the book of al-Ṣaḥīḥ, he showed it to Ahmad bin Hanbal, Yahya bin Mu'in, Ali bin al-Madiny and others, and they approved it and testified

<sup>2</sup>Collection, H. (n.d.). *Introduction to Sahih al-Bukhari*. Retrieved from Hadith collection: <http://hadithcollection.com/about-hadith-books/sahih-bukhari/background.html>

<sup>3</sup>Abdulmuhsin al-Badur bin Hamd bin Abdulmuhsin bin Abdullah bin Hamd al-Ibad, *Al-Imam al-Bukhari wa Kitabu al-Jami' al-Ṣaḥīḥ* (Madinah al-Munawarah: al-Jami'ah al-Islamiyah, 1431), 41.

<sup>4</sup>Ibid., 39.

<sup>1</sup>Abu Bakr Kafy, *Manhaj al-Imam al-Bukhari fi Tashihul al-Ahadith wa Talilyha* (Beirut: Dar Ibn Hazm, 2000), 45-53.

that all hadiths are correct except four Hadiths. However, al-'Uqaili said about those four hadiths that al-Bukhari is right about them and they are also Ṣaḥīḥ.<sup>5</sup>

Many scholars in the past and nowadays believe that all the Hadiths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari are correct and reliable except for the Hadiths mentioned in the commentaries (*Ta'liqat*) which contains both Ṣaḥīḥ and *ḍa'if* Hadiths. Therefore, Imam Bukhari named his book "*Al-Jami' al-Ṣaḥīḥ al-Musnad min Ahadith-e-rasul Allah wa Sunanihi wa Ayamihi*".<sup>6</sup> Al-Nawawi argues that the most accurate books after the Holy Qur'an are the two: Ṣaḥīḥ Bukhari and Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim, and the *ummah* accepted them as the most accurate books after the Holy Qur'an.<sup>7</sup> Ibn Salah believes that the Hadiths narrated by Imam Bukhari and Muslim can be said to be authentic because the *ummah* has agreed on the authenticity of these two books, nevertheless, there are a small number of Hadiths that have been criticized by some critics such as Dar al-Qutny (385 h), Nasiruddin al-Albani and other scholars which are famous among the experts of Hadith.<sup>8</sup>

One of the contemporary scholars Abdullah Bin Baz thinks that the two books (Bukhari and Muslim) are the greatest and the most correct after the Qur'an that the *Ummah* and the scholars of Hadith accepted them, except for few words that may be narrated mistakenly by some narrators but the main text or *al-matn* is correct and there is not any *ḍa'if Hadith*<sup>9</sup> in al-Bukhari.<sup>10</sup>

<sup>5</sup>Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, *Hady al-Sary Muqdimah Fath al-Bary*, Vol. 1 (Riyad: Dar al-Taibah, n.d), 11.2/380

<sup>6</sup>Ibid., 11.

<sup>7</sup>Abu-Zakariya Muhyiddin Yahya Bin Sharaf al-Nawawy, *Al-Minhaj Sharh Sahih Muslim* (Beirut: Dar Ihya' al-Turath al-'Araby, 1431), 1/14.

<sup>8</sup>Abu 'Amr 'Uthman bin Abdulrahman Ibn Salah, *Marifatul Anwa' al-Hadith* (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1986), 26.

<sup>9</sup>*ḍa'if Hadith*: is a hadith which does not meet the conditions and the criteria of a *al-sahih* or *al-hasan* hadiths (Abu Abdullah Badruddin Muhammad bin Ibrahim bin Sa'id bin Jama'ih al-Kanany al-Shaf'iy al-Hamawy, *Al-Minhal al-Rawi fi Mukhtasar 'Ilm al-Hadith al-Nabawy* (Dimashq: Dar al-Fikr 1406 H), 38.

<sup>10</sup>Al-Imam Ibn Baz, "al-ad'ea' ban shyhyalbkharywmslmbh maahadythd'eyfh" available from internet; accessed on 19 October 2020.

Imam Bukhari narrates Hadiths which its narrators are trustworthy without any dispute, and its *Sanad* is *mutasil* and not *maqtu'*. According to Imam Bukhari's conditions for mentioning hadiths in his book al-Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari, it would be best if a hadith is narrated by two of the companions of the Prophet, but if one of the companions also narrated it correctly, the hadith would be acceptable.<sup>11</sup> There are narrators that both Bukhari and Muslim narrated from, and there are some narrators just al-Bukhari narrated from, and they are around four hundred thirty people, and eighty of them are the narrators who are *al-mutakalim fihym*.<sup>12</sup>

Most of the Hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari are certainly Ṣaḥīḥ, however, there are hadiths that some scholars differ in accepting as Ṣaḥīḥ Hadiths. From the point of view of the scholars who believe in the existence of *ḍa'if* hadith in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari, all the hadiths of the Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari, that's text or chain of the transmission have problems can be checked for authenticity. They argue that believing in the existence of *ḍa'if* Hadith in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari is not a new phenomenon, but in the past, some scholars of hadith believed that there are *ḍa'if* Hadiths in al-Bukhari. For example, al-Imam Dar al-Qutny considers several Hadiths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari's book to be *ḍa'if*, but other scholars strongly oppose his argument and consider his objections to be not true and reliable.<sup>13</sup> For example, al-Imam Ibn Hajar says about the Hadiths that Imam Dar al-Qutny considered *ḍa'if*: that I have written them, verified them, and divided and separated them, but nothing appears of them affects the origin of the book's topic, except in the rare.<sup>14</sup> The above statement of Ibn Hajar about the

<sup>11</sup>Ibid., 13.

<sup>12</sup>Ibid., 18. *Mutakalim Fihy* is a narrator in whom some critics of Hadith science have spoken with a *jarh* that may or may not be effective (Abdul Aziz Mohammed Farah, 'Inayh al-'Ilmyah' bil-Isnad wa 'Ilm al-Jarh wa-Ta'dil (Riyad: Majm'e al-Malik Fahd, 1431H), 7.

<sup>13</sup>Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, *Hady al-Sary Muqadimah Fath al-Bary* (Riyad: Dar al-Taibah, n.d), 2/264.

<sup>14</sup>Ibid., 2/266.

*da'if* Hadiths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari means that the number of these Hadiths is very small and they are mostly in Bukhari's commentaries not in the main parts of the book.

Some contemporary scholars have criticized the book of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari and the Hadiths of the Prophet (SAW) in general. In their criticism, they have gone beyond the predecessor's method and have chosen a specific method and their arguments are based on not believing in the righteousness of all the companions of the prophet. They believe that the Companions, like other narrators, are different in terms of trust, justice, and memory, while the Salaf scholars believed that all the companions are righteous and just. For example, they have made many criticisms of the great companions such as Abu Hurairah, who narrated a big number of Hadiths. As Mahmoud Abu Raiyyah has written a book and named it "Abu Hurairah Sheikh al-Mudhirah" and Mustafa Bohandi has written a book entitled "Akthar Abu Hurairah" in which they have strongly criticized the narrations of Abu Hurairah.<sup>15</sup>

Likewise, some other critics of Hadiths from the orientalist think that hadiths are fabricated because of the political pressures from the people who were in power. Using this method, Hadiths are criticized concerning the political and intellectual conditions of the time of the narration of the Hadiths, rather than as a criterion for memory and whether they are trustworthy or not. With using this method many Hadiths of al-Bukhari which are related to the political incidents are under criticism.<sup>16</sup> For example, some new critics of the prophetic hadiths believe that the hadiths have been magnified, meaning that they have been accepted and collected due to political and intellectual reasons and pressures without properly investigating the truth and correctness of hadiths from the point of view of *matn* and

*sanad*, and therefore a considerable number of them are *da'if*.

Similarly, some critics of hadiths are also of the opinion that whenever a hadith is contrary to the Qur'an or explicit intellect, such a hadith is not acceptable and is rejected, and because of that, they reject many hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari.<sup>17</sup>

The great Islamic scholar Nasiruddin al-Albani says: The number of weak and fabricated Hadiths has reached 5 thousand in *al-Sihah* books, including Bukhari and Muslim. He claims that the reason for this is that the early Hadith writers relied primarily on the narrator's reputation and the extent of his sincerity and people's testimony of his trustworthiness and character. This is a measure despite its importance, as it is not sufficient and hardly reliable, especially after two or more centuries after the death of the prophet.<sup>18</sup>

The Hadiths that have been criticized in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari are divided into six categories by Imam ibn Hajar (852h): (1) Hadiths that's narrators disagree on the increase and decrease of some narrators in the chain of the narration, (2) Hadiths that's narrators are disagreed on changing some narrators in the chain of the narration, (3) Hadiths in which some words are added by a small number of narrators, contrary to the narrations of narrators who are in a large number and have a stronger memory, (4) Hadith in which weak narrators alone mentions a thing, opposed to strong narrators, (5) Hadith whose narrators have been judged by having an illusion, and (6) Hadiths that's narrators have differences in narrating the text so that some mention one word and others mention another word.<sup>19</sup>

The Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari book was criticized by many scholars. For example, Dar al-Qutny wrote a book named *Al-Ilzamat wa al-Tatabu'*, this book is researched by *Muqbil al-Wada'y* which

<sup>15</sup>M. Hud Hud, (2015, April 07). Masralarabia. Retrieved from Naqd Al-Turath :NaqdSahyh Al-Bukhari wa Muslim: <https://masralarabia.net/%D8%A7%D8%B6%D8%>

<sup>16</sup>Ibid.

<sup>17</sup>Ibid.

<sup>18</sup>A. Y. Ruz, (n.d.). aljaml. Retrieved from Al-Ahadith Al-Manhulafy Sahyh Al-Bukhari: <https://aljaml.com/%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%>

<sup>19</sup>Abu Bakr Kafy, *Manhaj al-Imam al-Bukhari fi Tashyihul al-Ahadith wa Taliliha* (Beirut: Dar Ibn Hazm, 2000), 219-220.

was published by *Dar al-Kutub al 'Ilmya* in Beirut. Imam Dar al-Qutny criticized around 200 Hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari, and Imam ibn Hajar wrote a rejection of Dar al-Qutny's arguments of weakening of these hadiths, for example, He said that there are some Hadiths that Dar al-Qutny is right in weakening them and he is not right in weakening most of them. Likewise, some other books discussed the existence of *ḍa'if* hadith in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari such as Hady al-Sary written by Ibn Hajar, and al-Zu'afā written by al-'Uqaili.<sup>20</sup>

Most of the orientalist believe that the majority of the prophetic hadiths are not authentic and are fabricated; the process of the fabrication of hadiths started after the death of the prophet and the first people who fabricated hadiths are the companions of the prophet.<sup>21</sup> For example, Goldziher claims that:

“The Prophet's pious followers have reverently repeated the enlightening sayings of the master and have endeavored to preserve for the edification and instruction of the community everything that he said, both in public and in private... When the rapid succession of conquests led them to distant countries; they handed on these hadiths of the Prophet to those who had not heard them with their ears and after his death, they added many salutary sayings that were thought to be in accord with his sentiments and could, therefore, in their view, legitimately be ascribed to him, or of whose soundness they were in general convinced.”<sup>22</sup>

He mentions the name of Mu'awiyah bin Abu Sufyan and al-Mughirah bin Shu'bah. He tries to prove his allegation by mentioning the sayings of Mu'awiyah bin Abu Sufyan in the summon of Mughirah bin Shu'bah, but none

of Mu'awiyah's sayings indicate officially or unofficially to prove the fabrication of hadith by him or Mughirah. Also, the narration which is mentioned in al-Tibary and quoted by Goldziher about the summon and the saying of Mu'awiyah is narrated by Abu Mikhnaf and according to Zahabi he is not trustworthy and labeled by Scholars of hadith as “a spoiled historian.”<sup>23</sup>

Goldziher also criticizes the authenticity of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari and thinks that Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari is not the most authentic book because his method for narrating hadith is weak as he was focusing more on *Sanad* not much on *matn*. He criticized hadith from different aspects such as politics, science, socio-cultural, etc. he believes that Hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari are correct from the point of view of their *Sanad* and are not checked by other methods. He also thinks that Abdul Malik bin Marwan ordered al-Zuhri who was 10-18 years old to fabricate hadiths. The reason behind his saying is to raise doubt among the Muslims about the authenticity of prophetic hadiths.<sup>24</sup> However, Muhammad Mustafa Azami rejects all the saying of Goldziher and says that Hadith scholars especially Imam Bukhari considered the criticism of Hadith from the point of view of both *sanad* and *matn*.<sup>25</sup>

Another scholar, named Jamal al-Banna, wrote a book in 2008 by the name of “*Tajrid al-Bukhari Wa Muslim Min al-Ahadith Alati La Talzam*” which means the Dismantling of Bukhari and Muslim from the Hadiths that are not needed, which was published by the Da'wat al-Ihya al-Islamy. The author of this book claims that there are Hadiths in Bukhari and Muslim that are not authentic, each of which has different reasons, for example, some of them are in conflict with Qur'anic verses, and others have problems in their

<sup>20</sup>I. Amin, (n.d.). Ibn Amin. Retrieved from Daef al-Bukhari wa Muslim: [http://www.ibnamin.com/daef\\_bukhari\\_muslim.htm](http://www.ibnamin.com/daef_bukhari_muslim.htm)

<sup>21</sup>J. Saeed, & Altyu Alhaji Rabi, “Assessing Goldziher's Claim of Fabrication of Hadith by the Companions of the Prophet,” *Al-Burhan Journal of Qur'an and Sunnah Studies* (2019): 34-51.

<sup>22</sup>Goldziher, *Muslim Studies* (London: S. S. M., & B. C. R. 1971), 10.

<sup>23</sup>J. Saeed & Altyu Alhaji Rabi, “Assessing Goldziher's Claim of Fabrication of Hadith by the Companions of the Prophet,” 34-51.

<sup>24</sup>S. H. Hera, (2020). “Kritik Ignaz Goldziher dan Pembelaan Musthofa al-Azami terhadap Hadis dalam Kitab Shahih al-Bukhari,” *Jurnal Living Hadis* 5, no. 1 (2020): 133-149.

<sup>25</sup>Ibid.

text, and some are Hadiths which are against the (*I'ismah al-naby*) or infallibility of the Prophet. The author also thinks that the Ahl al-sunnah wa al-Jama'ah does not have consensus on the authenticity of all the hadiths of Bukhari, and he has mentioned many examples as evidence of his argument.

This research answers the question whether all the Hadiths of Şahih al-Bukhari are authentic and credible or there are *da'if* and weak hadiths in it? By mentioning the arguments of the hadith scholars on *da'if* Hadiths in the Bukhari book, with mentioning their logic for calling them *da'if*. The researcher uses the content analysis and descriptive method for conducting this research, by referring to books, scientific journal articles and articles on some credible websites. By conducting this research, the researchers aim to collect, analyze the theories of both opponents and proponents of the existence of weak hadiths in Şahih al-Bukhari, and reach a logical conclusion following the principles of hadith science and Islamic law. What distinguishes this research is that this is not based on religious and sectarian prejudice, but is based on the arguments and researches of Salaf and contemporary scholars and existing facts. Attempts have also been made to validate logical and rational arguments and to criticize and reject arguments that are based on prejudice and extremist opinions. In this research, scientific terms that are not understandable to the public have been described in the footnote using credible sources, although each term has been described only once.

### **Bukhari and His Standards for Narrating Hadith in his Book Şahih al-Bukhari**

One of the things that made Bukhari the most authentic book after the Holy Qur'an is the way by which Imam Bukhari narrates Hadiths, his conditions, and his strong standards for getting hadiths from the narrators. Imam Bukhari does not narrate hadith from every scholar of hadith, but he has conditions for narrating Hadiths and whenever

he finds those conditions in a narrator, he will narrate otherwise he would not. For example, the narrator must be trustworthy, the *Hadith's Sanad*<sup>26</sup> (chain of narrators) must be *Mutasil*<sup>27</sup> (connected), the narrator must have met the person he is narrating from, even if the meeting took place once, the narrator must be Muslim, honest, not easygoing, not *Mukhtalit*, have a good intention in narrating hadith and many other conditions.<sup>28</sup> Therefore, if a narrator does not match the above-mentioned conditions the scholar of hadith will check the hadith for authenticity.

The book of al-Bukhari is one of the most correct books of Hadith, and despite that, it is a human effort that is neither perfect nor infallible, and from here we find some of the scholars of Hadiths who have spoken about some Hadiths which are narrated by Bukhari, and they explained reasons for their argument which show that these Hadiths are lower than the rank of Şahih Hadith.<sup>29</sup> For instance, Imam Ibn Hajar says: there are one hundred and ten Hadiths in Şahih al-Bukhari and Muslim among them 80 Hadiths just narrated by al-Bukhari, which are criticized by some scholars of *Hadith* such as Dar al-Qutny and Abu Ali al-Asany.<sup>30</sup>

### **Examples of Hadiths Which Considered *Da'if* by the scholar of Hadiths**

Many scholars of hadith talked about the existence of *da'if* Hadiths in Şahih al-Bukhari and here I will mention some of them:

<sup>26</sup>*Sanad* is the chain of narrators of a hadith connecting to the text of the hadith (A. A. al-Faomy, (2014, 09 10). *Alukah*. Retrieved from Maryfat-ul-Mustalahat-wa-al-rumuz Ynda-al-Muhadythyn : <https://www.alukah.net/sharia/0/76973/>

<sup>27</sup>*Mutasil*: is a hadith that's chain of narrators is connected to the Prophet. Or it is a hadith that's chain of narrators is connected so that each narrator has heard from the narrator above himself (*Tadrib al-Rawy*, Syuty)

<sup>28</sup>Abdulmuhsin bin Hamd bin Abdulmuhsin bin Abdullah bin Hamd al-Ebad al-Badur, *Al-Imam al-Bukhari wa Kitabuhu al-Jam'i al-Sahih* (Madinah al-Munawarah: al-Jam'iah al-Islamiyah,n.d), 143.

<sup>29</sup>Abu Bakr Kafy, *Manhaj al-Imam al-Bukhari fi Tashyihul al-Ahadith wa Taliliha*, 213.

<sup>30</sup>Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, *Hady al-Sary Muqdimah Fath al-Bary*, Vol. 2, 264.

## A. Hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari which Dar al-Qutny (306-385h) Criticized and called *Da'if*

Hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari, about which Imam Dar al-Qutny has consideration and concerns and talked about them in his book “*Al-Ilzamat wa al-Tatabu*” and explained reasons for his concerns. These kinds of hadiths are divided into five categories: (1) Hadiths are cited by both Imam Bukhari and Muslims and they based their arguments on them, (2) Hadiths that both Bukhari and Muslim cited them in the *al-mutab'at*<sup>31</sup> section, (3) Hadiths that each of Bukhari and Muslim have narrated in their books cautiously, (4) Hadiths that each of Bukhari and Muslim have narrated as an *al-mutab'at* and have stated causes for them, and (5) Hadiths that Imam Muslim mentioned in the introduction of his book.<sup>32</sup>

From reading the book of Imam Dar al-Qutny, can be understood that the Hadiths of Bukhari and Muslim, which he has criticized, are not out of three circumstances: the first type is the Hadiths that both Bukhari and Muslim have mentioned in their books with the reason contained in those Hadiths in a way that is understandable to those who specialize in this field. The second type is the Hadiths that were criticized by Dar al-Qutny, but his criticism is not justified and the opinion of Bukhari and Muslim is preferred. The third type is the Hadiths that were criticized by Imam Dar al-Qutny and his criticism is appropriate. For example, the Hadiths criticized in Bukhari and Muslim are 210 Hadiths, and among these, Dar al-Qutny criticism is correct only in 100 Hadiths.<sup>33</sup>

<sup>31</sup>*Al-Mutab'at*: when two or more narrators in one layer narrate one hadith, in *al-mutab'at* the narration of those who are not trustworthy will be accepted, see Muhammad bin Sulaiman bin Sa'ad bin Mas'ud al-Rumi al-Hanafi, *Al-Mukhtasar fi 'Ilm al-Athar* (Riyad: Maktabah al-Rushd, 1407H), 143. Also, it is defined as: when a narrator's narration agreed with another narrator's narration, and he narrate it from his teacher or from someone higher; Nūriddin Atur, *Manhaj al-Naqd fi 'Ulūm al-Hadith* (Syria: Dar al-Fikr, 1981), 418.

<sup>32</sup>Abu Bakr Kafy, *Manhaj al-Imam al-Bukhari fi Tashyhu al-Ahadith wa Taliliha*, 222.

<sup>33</sup>Ibid., 223.

## B. Hadiths of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari which Imam al-Albany (1914-1999) Weakened or Thought Them *Da'if*

Imam al-Albany is one of the great scholars of Hadith in the present era who has left many scientific works in the form of books, articles, and lectures on the Hadiths of the Prophet (SAW) and its sciences. Imam al-Albany is among those who believe in the existence of weak Hadiths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari. He has weakened some of Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari's Hadiths for various reasons, including:

### 1). Existence of Some *Mutakalam Fihym* Narrators in the Chain of the Narration:

When the scholars of hadith use the term *al-Mutakalam fihy* they mean the narrators who are criticized by some scholars of hadith and they have some specific attitudes that being of them is not fair in narration and these attitudes may or may not be effective in making the narrator *da'if*.<sup>34</sup> There are narrators in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari about whom some scholars of Hadith have said things that undermine their strength or makes them *da'if*, even though it is acceptable by the scholars of Hadiths that all the narrations of a *da'if* narrator are not *da'if*, still, it is a weakness of narration which has *al-Mutakalam Fyhim* narrators. One of the examples of the Hadith which Imam al-Albany has called it *da'if* due to a narrator's being *mutakalam fihy* is this *Hadith*:

1. حدثني عبد الله بن منير، سمع أبا النضر، حدثنا عبد الرحمن بن عبد الله يعني ابن دينار، عن أبيه، عن أبي صالح، عن أبي هريرة، عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: «إن العبد ليتكلم بالكلمة من رضوان الله، لا يلقي لها بالاً، يرفعه الله بها درجات، وإن العبد ليتكلم بالكلمة من سخط الله، لا يلقي لها بالاً، يهوي بها في جهنم»<sup>35</sup>

“The Prophet; said, “A slave (of Allah) may utter a word which pleases Allah without

<sup>34</sup>Abdulaziz Muhammad Farih, ‘*Inayh al-'ulama Bil-Isnad wa 'Ilm al-Jarh wa al-Ta'dil* (Riyad: Majmu' al-Matba'ah al-Mushf al-Sharyf, 1431), 7.

<sup>35</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 8, 101; hadith number 6478, chapter of *Hifz al-lisan*.

giving it much importance, and because of that Allah will raise him to degrees (of the reward): a slave (of Allah) may utter a word (carelessly) which displeases Allah without thinking of its gravity and because of that he will be thrown into the Hell-Fire.”

Imam Bukhari narrated this Hadith from Abdulrahman bin Abdullah bin Dinar from his father from Abu Salih from Abu Hurairah. Imam al-Albani calls this Hadith *da'if* because of two reasons: the first is the poor preservation or *Suw' hifz*<sup>36</sup> of Abdulrahman. Even though Imam Bukhari narrated many Hadiths from Abdulrahman, other scholars of Hadith opposed him and spoke of Abdulrahman's poor memory. For example, Yahya Bin Mu'in said: there is *du'uf* or weakness in his Hadith.<sup>37</sup> Similarly, 'Amru bin Ali said: I never heard Abdulrahman bin Mahdy narrates anything from him.<sup>38</sup> Abu Hatem said: he has *Liyn* (softness) and his Hadith can be written and will not be invoked.<sup>39</sup> Also, Dar al-Qutny said: al-Bukhari disagreed with the people in narrating from Abdulrahman, and he is not *matruk*.<sup>40</sup> The second reason for being of this Hadith *da'if* or weak is the disagreement of Imam Malik with Imam Bukhari in narrating it, as Imam Bukhari has narrated this Hadith as *marfu'*,<sup>41</sup> but

<sup>36</sup>*Say' al-hifz*: is a person who cannot be preferred the aspect of his correctness from his mistakes, and it has two kinds: first, If it happens for the narrator in all his life's affairs according to the opinion of some scholars of hadith, he is *al-shad*, and if the bad memorization come to the narrator as an emergency; Either because of his old age, or because of his blindness, or because his books were burned or not exist, and he relied on them, and then when he referred to his memory everything mixed, this kind of narrator called *al-mukhtalat*.

<sup>37</sup>Abdulrahman Aby Hatim, *al-Jarh Wa Ta'dil*, Vol. 5 (Beirut: Dar Ehya' Altrath al-'erby, 1271H), 254.

<sup>38</sup>Abu Ahmad Abdullah bin 'Edy al-Jurjany, *al-Kamal fi al-D'ufa'*, Vol. 4 (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr), 294.

<sup>39</sup>Abdulrahman Aby Hatim, *al-Jarh Wa Ta'dil*, Vol. 5, 254.

<sup>40</sup>Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, *Tahdib al-Tahdib*, Vol. 6 (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1404H), 207. **Matruk**: A hadith can be *matruk* due to a narrator's being accused of lying; Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, *Nazhah al-Nazar fi Tawdih Nukhbh al-Fikr fi Mustalah Ahl al-Athr* (Riyad: Matba'ah Sfy, 1422H), 225.

<sup>41</sup>*Al-Marfu'*: is what the Companion told about what the prophet Mohammad (SAW) said; Abu 'Amr 'Uthman Bin Abdulrahman Ibn al-Salah, *M'erfah Anwa'e 'Ilm al-Hadith* (Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 2002), 117.

Imam Malik has narrated this Hadith as *mawquf*.<sup>42</sup> Similarly, in the book of *al-Muwata* this Hadith is narrated by Abdullah bin Dinar from Abu Salih, who said that Abu Hurairah said: ... and then he mentions the Hadith. It is clear from the above chain of transmission that Abdulrahman did not memorize the Hadith, and therefore, he added to it to and mad the *mawquf* Hadith as *al-marfu'*.<sup>43</sup>

2. حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ، حَدَّثَنَا مَعْنُ بْنُ عَيْسَى، حَدَّثَنَا أَبِي بْنُ عَبَّاسِ بْنِ سَهْلٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ جَدِّهِ، قَالَ: «كَانَ لِلنَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي حَائِطِنَا فَرَسٌ يُقَالُ لَهُ اللَّحِيفُ»، قَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ: «وَقَالَ بَعْضُهُمُ: اللَّحِيفُ».<sup>44</sup>

“In our garden, a horse was belonging to the Prophet (saw) called *al-Luhaif* or *al-Lakhif*.”

Al-Baihaqy narrated it from Ubay bin 'Ebas from his brother Musadiq Bin 'Ebas from his father and he narrated it as a *marfu'* hadith. Al-Albani said: this Hadith is *da'if* because I don't recognize Musadiq Bin 'Ebas and also his brother Ubay Ibn 'Ebas is a *da'if* narrator. Many scholars of Hadith including Bukhari weakened him, for example, he said: *laysa bil qawiy*<sup>45</sup> he is not strong, Sajy said: he is *da'if*, Abu al-Arab mentioned him in *al-Du'afa'*, al-Nasa'iy said: *laysa bil qawiy*, and Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal said: he is *Munkar al-hadith*.<sup>46</sup> Imam Ibn Hajar

<sup>42</sup>*Mawquf*: is a hadith which is narrated from the Companions of the prophet, from their sayings or their deeds, so it stops on them, and does not refer to the prophet; Abu 'Amr 'Uthman Bin Abdulrahman Ibn al-Salah, *Muqadimah Ibn al-Salah* (Syria: Dar al-Fikr, 1976), 46.

<sup>43</sup>al-Albaniy, *al-Silsilah al-da'ifah*, Vol. 3 (Riyad: Dar al-Ma'arif, 1992), 463; Hadith Number 1299.

<sup>44</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 4, 29; hadith number 2855.

<sup>45</sup>*Lays bi- alqawiy* means not the strongest narrator, and he is not at degree of a strong narrator and Bukhari uses this and means that the narrator is *da'if*; Abu Abdullah Muhammad bn Ahmad bn Usman bin Qaimaz Zahabi, *Al-Muqizah fi 'Ilmi-Mustalah-al-Hadith* (Halab: Maktaba al-Matbughat al-Islamia, 1412H), 83.

<sup>46</sup>Alhanafy 'Aluddin Mughaltaiy bin Qulaj bin Abdullah al-Bukjory, *Ikmal Tahdyb al-Kamal fi Asma' al-Rijal*, Vol. 2 (Qahirah: al-Faruq al-Hadithah Lil-Taba'eh wa al-Nashur, 2001), 5. They call *Munkar al-hadith* when a weak or *da'if* narrator oppose narrators who are trustworthy or *thuqah*. Newumaya. (n.d.). *newumaya*. Retrieved from Mustalahat : <http://newumaya.com/Ibidioms.htm>



concluded from the above sayings of the scholars of Hadith and said: *fihi da'if* (there is a weakness in him).<sup>47</sup> Surprisingly, even though the majority of scholars of hadith have weakened or called him *da'if*, Imam Bukhari still narrated a Hadith from him.

3. حَدَّثَنِي إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ الْمُنْذِرِ، حَدَّثَنَا أَنَسُ بْنُ عِيَاضٍ، عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ، عَنْ خُبَيْبِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، عَنْ حَفْصِ بْنِ عَاصِمٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ: أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ: «مَا بَيْنَ بَيْتِي وَمِنْبَرِي رَوْضَةٌ مِنْ رِيَاضِ الْجَنَّةِ، وَمِنْبَرِي عَلَى حَوْضِي».<sup>48</sup>

*“Allah’s Messenger (saw) said, “Between my house and my pulpit there is a garden from amongst the gardens of Paradise, and my pulpit is over my Lake-Fount.”*

In this hadith, the narrator Ibrahim Bin al-Mundir al-Hazimy is a *Mutakalam Fihy* narrator. Imam Ibn Hajar has said about him that he is one of the Imams, Ibn Mu’in knows him as trustworthy and *thuqah*, Ahmad bn Hanbal talked negatively about him (*takalam fihy*) because Abi Daud and Sajy said that: There are *munkar Hadiths* with him. Despite the issues discussed above Imam Bukhari has narrated from him in several places, for example, one of his narrations is in the book of *al-Raqaq*, the chapter of *al-Hâwd* (pool).<sup>49</sup>

4. حَدَّثَنِي يُوسُفُ بْنُ مُوسَى، حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو أُسَامَةَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي عَوْفٌ، عَنْ خَلَّاسٍ، وَمُحَمَّدٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: «مَنْ أَكَلَ نَاسِيًا، وَهُوَ صَائِمٌ، فَلْيَبِمْ صَوْمَهُ، فَإِنَّمَا أَطْعَمَهُ اللَّهُ وَسَقَاهُ»<sup>50</sup>

*“The Prophet (saw) said, “If somebody eats something forgetfully while he is fasting, then he should complete his fast, for Allah has made him eat and drink.”*

<sup>47</sup>Ibn Hajar al-‘Asqalany, *Taqrib al-Tahdib*, Vol. 1 (Syria: Dar al-rash, 1986), 96; number 281.

<sup>48</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 8, 121; hadith number 6588.

<sup>49</sup>Hady al-Sary, 2\296.

<sup>50</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 8, 136; hadith number 6669.

In this hadith, there is a narrator who is also a *Mutaklam Fihy* narrator by the name of Khilas bin ‘Amru al-Hajry. Imam Ibn Hajar says that Ibn Mu’in and Abu Daud and al-‘Ajaly said that he is trustworthy and confidant (*al-thuqah*), al-hakim said that he is not strong (*al-qawy*).<sup>51</sup>

5. حَدَّثَنِي مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عُمَانَ بْنِ كَرَامَةَ، حَدَّثَنَا خَالِدُ بْنُ مَخْلَدٍ، حَدَّثَنَا سُلَيْمَانُ بْنُ بِلَالٍ، حَدَّثَنِي شَرِيكُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَبِي نَمِرٍ، عَنْ عَطَاءٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: «إِنَّ اللَّهَ قَالَ: مَنْ عَادَى لِي وَلِيًّا فَقَدْ آذَنْتُهُ بِالْحَرْبِ، وَمَا تَقَرَّبَ إِلَيَّ عَبْدِي بِشَيْءٍ أَحَبَّ إِلَيَّ مِمَّا افْتَرَضْتُ عَلَيْهِ، وَمَا يَزَالُ عَبْدِي يَتَقَرَّبُ إِلَيَّ بِالنَّوَافِلِ حَتَّى أُحِبَّهُ، فَإِذَا أَحْبَبْتُهُ: كُنْتُ سَمْعَهُ الَّذِي يَسْمَعُ بِهِ، وَبَصَرَهُ الَّذِي يُبْصِرُ بِهِ، وَيَدَهُ الَّتِي يَبْطِشُ بِهَا، وَرِجْلَهُ الَّتِي يَمْشِي بِهَا، وَإِنْ سَأَلَنِي لِأَعْظِيئِهِ، وَلَئِنْ اسْتَعَاذَنِي لِأَعْدِيئِهِ، وَمَا تَرَدَّدْتُ عَنْ شَيْءٍ أَنَا فَاعِلُهُ تَرَدُّدِي عَنْ نَفْسِ الْمُؤْمِنِ، يَكْرَهُ الْمَوْتَ وَأَنَا أَكْرَهُ مَسَاءَتَهُ»<sup>52</sup>

*“Allah’s Messenger (saw) said, “Allah said, ‘I will declare war against him who shows hostility to a pious worshipper of Mine. And the most beloved things with which My slave comes nearer to Me, is what I have enjoined upon him; and My slave keeps on coming closer to Me through performing Nawafil (praying or doing extra deeds besides what is obligatory) till I love him, so I become his sense of hearing with which he hears, and his sense of sight with which he sees, and his hand with which he grips, and his leg with which he walks; and if he asks Me, I will give him, and if he asks My protection (Refuge), I will protect him; (i.e. give him My Refuge) and I do not hesitate to do anything as I hesitate to take the soul of the believer, for he hates death, and I hate to disappoint him.”*

This is a Hadith that has been narrated by Imam Bukhari alone and the owners of the six books of Hadith have not narrated it in their books. Hafiz Ibn Rajab says that this Hadith is one of Şaḥīḥ al-Bukhari’s hadith which was

<sup>51</sup>Hady al-Sary, 2\307.

<sup>52</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 8, 105; hadith number 6502.

narrated by Ibn Karamah alone from Khalid Ibn Mukhalad al-Qatwany, and he is one of the narrators that the scholars are worried about, and have said many things about him. It is also narrated in other ways, none of which are out of the question.<sup>53</sup> Ibn Hajar al-‘Asqalany said about Khalid bin Mukhalad: he has *munkar Hadiths* and also said about this *Hadith: hada hadith gharib jidaan*, the reason that makes this hadith *gharyb* is the *tafarud*.<sup>54</sup> Al-‘Ajaly said that he is *al-thuqah* but has some Shiite believes, Ibn Sa’id said he was very extreme Shiite, similarly Salih said he was accused of being extreme Shiite, Ahmad bin Hanbal said he has some *munkar Hadiths* and Abu Daud said his *Hadiths* can be written but not invoked (*la-yuhtaj bihy*).<sup>55</sup>

On the other hand, some scholars of Hadith have justified these criticisms about Khalid ibn Mukhalad and have given such an answer: As long as a person has no difficulty in receiving a Hadith and conveying it to others and does not invite others to Shi’ism, being of him Shiah does not harm the narration of a Hadith. As for having *Munkar hadith*, it should be said that Imam Bukhari narrated only this Hadith from him, and this is not from his *Manakirs* and is an authentic hadith.<sup>56</sup>

## 2) Existence of Abnormalities (Shudwd)<sup>57</sup> Strangeness (Gharabah), or Oddity (Nakarah) in one of the Textual Words of a Hadith:

<sup>53</sup>Zainuddin Abdulrahman bin Ahmad Ibn Rajab, *Jam’i al-Ulumwa al-Hikam fi Sharhy Khamsin Hadithan min Jawam’e al-Kalym*, Researched by al-Arnawut, Vol. 2 (Beirut: Muasysat al-Risalat, 2001), 330.

<sup>54</sup>*Tafarud* means that One of the narrators narrates a hadith without others. and the scholars of hadith say this “hadith gharyb”; Abu Bakr Kafy, *Manhaj-al-Imam al-Bukhari fi Tashihul al-Ahadith wa Taliliha*, 224.

<sup>55</sup>Hady al-Sary, 2/306.

<sup>56</sup>Abu Bakr Kafy, *Manhaj-al-Imam al-Bukhari fi Tashihul al-Ahadith wa Taliliha*, 233.

<sup>57</sup>*Shad* is a kind of hadith in which a *thuqah* narrates against the narration of other *thuqahs*; Ibrahim Subhy al-Salih, ‘*Ulum-al-Hadith wa Mustalahatu*, Vol. 1 (Beirut: Dar al-‘Ilmi el-Malayn, 1984), 197.

There are several examples of this kind of hadith in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari*, and here are some of them:

1. حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بْنُ عَلِيٍّ، حَدَّثَنَا فَضَيْلُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ، حَدَّثَنَا مُسْلِمٌ بْنُ أَبِي مَرْيَمَ، حَدَّثَنِي عَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنُ جَابِرٍ، عَمَّنْ، سَمِعَ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، قَالَ: لَا عُقُوبَةَ فَوْقَ عَشْرِ ضَرْبَاتٍ إِلَّا فِي حَدٍّ مِنْ حُدُودِ اللَّهِ.<sup>58</sup>

“On the authority of others, that the Prophet (saw) said, “No Punishment exceeds the flogging of the ten stripes, except if one is guilty of a crime necessitating a legal punishment prescribed by Allah.”

Imam al-Albany said: this Hadith is *munkar* with the word of “*al-‘uqwbah*” the reason for this, is a narrator called Fudail bin Sulaiman whom Imam ibn Hajar has said about: “*Saduq Lahu Khta Kathir*” he is honest but has a lot of mistakes and this Hadith is from his mistakes. This Hadith is also narrated by al-Musaib Bin Wadah who is one of the teachers of Abu Hatim and he said about him: “*saduq, kan yukht’e kathirân*” he is honest, however, he made a lot of mistakes, and Dar al-Qutny said: he is *da’if*.<sup>59</sup>

2. حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ الْمُنْذِرِ الْحَزَامِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ فُلَيْحٍ، حَدَّثَنَا أَبِي، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي هَالِلُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ، عَنْ عَطَاءِ بْنِ يَسَارٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، عَنْ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ: «بَيْنَا أَنَا قَائِمٌ إِذَا زَمَرَةً، حَتَّى إِذَا عَرَفْتَهُمْ خَرَجَ رَجُلٌ مِنْ بَيْنِنِي وَبَيْنَهُمْ، فَقَالَ: هَلُمَّ، فَقُلْتُ: أَيْنَ؟ قَالَ: إِلَى النَّارِ وَاللَّهِ، قُلْتُ: وَمَا شَأْنُهُمْ؟ قَالَ: إِنَّهُمْ ارْتَدَوْا بَعْدَكَ عَلَى أَدْبَارِهِمُ الْقَهْقَرِيِّ. ثُمَّ إِذَا زَمَرَةً، حَتَّى إِذَا عَرَفْتَهُمْ خَرَجَ رَجُلٌ مِنْ بَيْنِنِي وَبَيْنَهُمْ، فَقَالَ: هَلُمَّ، قُلْتُ: أَيْنَ؟ قَالَ: إِلَى النَّارِ وَاللَّهِ، قُلْتُ: مَا شَأْنُهُمْ؟ قَالَ: إِنَّهُمْ ارْتَدَوْا بَعْدَكَ عَلَى أَدْبَارِهِمُ الْقَهْقَرِيِّ، فَلَا أَرَاهُ يَخْلُصُ مِنْهُمْ إِلَّا مِثْلُ هَمَلِ النَّعَمِ.»<sup>60</sup>

“The Prophet (saw) said, “While I was sleeping, a group (of my followers were brought close to me), and when I recognized them, a man (an

<sup>58</sup>al-Bukhari, 8/ 174

<sup>59</sup>al-Albaniy, *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-D’eyfah wa al-Mawdu’eah wa Atharuha al-Say’e fi al-Ummah*, Vol. 14 (Riyad: Dar al-Ma’arif, 1992), 1056; hadith number 6959.

<sup>60</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol.8, 121; hadith number 6587.

angel) came out from amongst (us) me and them, he said (to them), 'Come along.' I asked, 'Where?' He said, 'To the (Hell) Fire, by Allah' I asked, 'what is wrong with them' He said, 'They turned apostate as renegades after you left.' Then behold! (Another) group (of my followers) were brought close to me, and when I recognized them, a man (an angel) came out from (me and them) he said (to them); 'Come along.' I asked, "Where?" He said, 'To the (Hell) Fire, by Allah.' I asked, 'what is wrong with them?' He said, 'They turned apostate as renegades after you left. So, I did not see anyone of them escaping except a few who were like camels without a shepherd.'"

Imam al-Albany said: that this Hadith is *ḍa'if* for two reasons: (a) Because of its *sanad*, as there is a narrator called Fulaih Bin Sulaiman, Ibn Hajar said about him: "*Saduq Kathir al-Khata*" his honest but has a lot of mistakes. Similarly, Imam al-Albany said: *Sanad* of this Hadith is *Gharib* and Imam Bukhari narrated it alone, and it is not narrated by the *al-Sihah* books.<sup>61</sup> Likewise, Ibn Mu'in and Abu Hatim, and al-Nasa'iy said: "*Lays Bil-al-Qawy*" he is not strong,<sup>62</sup> and (b) Because of the problems that exist in the *matn* or text of it, which contradicts with more than thirty Hadiths narrated by others. One of the contradictions that exist in this Hadith is adding the phrase "*Bayn Ana Na'im*" when I was sleeping, the addition of this phrase makes this story a dream, while other narration of this Hadith does not include this term.<sup>63</sup> The second addition in this *Hadith* is the phrase "*kharaj rajul min bainy wa bainhim*" a man came out between me and them. This also does not exist in other narrations.<sup>64</sup> The third

addition is that this Hadith has divided those who have turned back from the teaching of the prophet into two parts, which do not exist in other narrations.<sup>65</sup> Likewise, this narration called the angel (*rajul*) or man, while being a man or woman is one of the characteristics of humans and angels are not described as being a man or a woman.<sup>66</sup>

.3

حدثنا محمد بن سنان، قال: حدثنا فليح، ح وحدثني إبراهيم بن المنذر، قال: حدثنا محمد بن فليح، قال: حدثني أبي قال: حدثني هلال بن علي، عن عطاء بن يسار، عن أبي هريرة قال: بينما النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في مجلس يحدث القوم، جاءه أعرابي فقال: متى الساعة؟ فمضى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يحدث، فقال بعض القوم: سمع ما قال فكره ما قال. وقال بعضهم: بل لم يسمع، حتى إذا قضى حديثه قال: «أين - أراه - السائل عن الساعة؟» قال: ها أنا يا رسول الله، قال: «فإذا ضيعت الأمانة فانتظر الساعة»، قال: كيف إضاعتها؟ قال: «إذا وسد الأمر إلى غير أهله فانتظر الساعة»<sup>67</sup>

"While the Prophet (saw) was saying something in a gathering, a Bedouin came and asked him, "When would the Hour (Doomsday) take place?" Allah's Messenger (saw) continued his talk, so some people said that Allah's Messenger (saw) had heard the question, but did not like what that Bedouin had asked. Some of them said that Allah's Messenger (saw) had not heard it. When the Prophet (saw) finished his speech, he said, "Where is the questioner, who enquired about the Hour (Doomsday)?" The Bedouin said, "I am here, O Allah's Apostle." Then the Prophet (saw) said, "When honesty is lost, then wait for the Hour (Doomsday)." The Bedouin said, "How will that be lost?" The Prophet (saw) said, "When the power or authority comes in the hands of unfit persons, then wait for the Hour (Doomsday)."

Imam al-Albany said: this is a weak (*ḍa'if*) narration that al-Bukhari narrated without the rest of the other six books of hadith. This is a *ḍa'if*

<sup>61</sup>**Gharib:** is a hadith which is narrated by one person and it can happen in any place, at any chain of narrators or at any text; Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, *Nuzhat al-Nazar fi Tawzihiy Nukhbat al-Fekar fi Mustalahy Ahly al-Athar* (Dimashq: Matbaghah al-Sabah, 2000), 50.

<sup>62</sup>al-Albany, *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-Da'ifah wa al-Mawdu'eah wa Atharuha al-Say'e fi al-Ummah*, Vol. 14, 1031; hadith number 6945.

<sup>63</sup>Ibid., 1033.

<sup>64</sup>Ibid., 1036.

<sup>65</sup>Ibid.

<sup>66</sup>Ibid., 1034.

<sup>67</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 1, 21; hadith number 59.

hadith because of Falih bin Sulaiman, according to scholars of hadith even he was *saduaq* or truthful but he has a lot of mistakes.<sup>68</sup>

### 3) Inserting an Extra Word in a Hadith Which Is Not Part of It

1. حدثنا يحيى بن بكير، قال: حدثنا الليث، عن خالد، عن سعيد بن أبي هلال، عن نعيم المجر، قال: رقيت مع أبي هريرة على ظهر المسجد، فتوضأ، فقال: إني سمعت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول «إن أمتي يدعون يوم القيامة غرا محجلين من آثار الوضوء، فمن استطاع منكم أن يطيل غرته فليفعل»<sup>69</sup>.

“Once I went up the roof of the mosque, along with Abu Hurairah. He performed ablution and said, “I heard the Prophet (saw) saying, “On the day of resurrection, my followers will be called “al-Ghurr al-Muhajjalun” from the trace of ablution and whoever can increase the area of his radiance should do so (i.e. by performing ablution regularly).”

Imam al-Albany said: the first part of this Hadith has been narrated from the Prophet Muhammad (saw), but according to scholars such as al-Mundiri, Ibn Taimiyah, and Ibn al-Qayim the last sentence which says (Anyone among you who can lengthen the whiteness of his legs and forehead should do so.) is not the word of the Prophet but it is the word of Abu Hurairah and some narrators of the Hadith inserted this part into *marfu’ e Hadith*.<sup>70</sup>

### 3) The Existence of *Idtirab*<sup>71</sup> in *Sanad or Matn* of a Hadith<sup>72</sup>

<sup>68</sup>al-Albany, *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-Da’ifah wa al-Mawdu’eah wa Atharuha al-Say’e fi al-Ummah*, 1038; hadith number 6948.

<sup>69</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 1, 39; hadith number-136.

<sup>70</sup>al-Albany, *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-Da’ifah wa al-Mawdu’eah*, Vol 3, 104; hadith number 1030.

<sup>71</sup>*Al-Mudtarab* is a kind of hadith narration, in which the narration differs, some narrate it in a way, and others narrate in a different way. We call it *al-mudtarab* if they are equal, and if one of the narrations preferred and other was not able to resist with this, in the way its narrators have strong memory, or they accompanied the person from whom the narration narrated for a long time or there were other authentic reasons for preferring it, in this case we will not call this narration a *al-mudtarab*.

<sup>72</sup>*Matn*: It is the narrated speech that the chain of narration ends to it. Al-Faamy (2014, 09 10). *Alukah*. Retrieved from Maryfat-

Imam al-Albany has weakened several Hadiths of Bukhari because there is *Idtirab* at their *sanad* or their *matn*. one of the examples of this, is as below:

1. حدثني بشر بن مرحوم، حدثنا يحيى بن سليم، عن إسماعيل بن أمية، عن سعيد بن أبي سعيد، عن أبي هريرة رضي الله عنه، عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم، قال: «قال الله: ثلاثة أنا خصمهم يوم القيامة: رجل أعطى بي ثم غدر، ورجل باع حراً فأكل ثمنه، ورجل استأجر أجيراً فاستوفى منه ولم يعط أجره وفي رواية لم يوفه أجره»<sup>73</sup>

“The Prophet (saw) said, “Allah says, ‘I will be against three persons on the Day of Resurrection: (1) One who makes a covenant in My Name, but he proves treacherous, (2) One who sells a free person (as a slave) and eats the price, (3) And one who employs a laborer and gets the full work done by him but does not pay him his wages.”

Imam al-Albany said: I was inclined towards the weakness of this Hadith in the book *Irwa’ al-ghalil* and there I mentioned some opinions about it, and then when I realized the existence of *idtirab* of Yahya in narrating of this Hadith from the point of view of *sanad* and *matn*, I became certain in the weakness of this Hadith. *Idtirab* from the point of view of the *sanad* in this Hadith is such that the owners of the six books of Hadith narrate it from Said bin Abu Said al-Maqbari from Abu Hurairah, it is also narrated by Ibn Jarud and Baihaqi. Imam al-Albany said: that I was not sure about ruling on this Hadith because the scholars of hadith called al-Taifiy *da’if* and Nafili trustworthy. As Zahaby quotes from Abu Daud that he says about Nafili who is Abdullah bin Muhammad: I did not see anyone with a better memory than him, Ibn Hajar said: he is *thuqah hafiz*<sup>74</sup> (trustworthy with great memory).

ul-Mustalahat-wa-al-rumuz Ynda-al-Muhadythyn : <https://www.alukah.net/sharia/0/76973/>

<sup>73</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 3, 82; hadith number 2227.

<sup>74</sup>*Thuqah* is a narrator who combines the attributes of justice and *Zabt*. And Hafiz is someone whose knowledge of each class of narrators is more than his ignorance. Some scholars believe this is equal to term “al-muhadith” and some others believe his

Also, he said that: it is very clear that if the matter revolves between the delusion of a narrator who is *thuqah* controversially and the delusion of a narrator who is *thuqah* and *hafiz* which has been agreed upon; the delusion of the first will be clear and acceptable, especially if it is more likely that the narrator is *da'if* from the point of view of his memory. Hence al-Hafiz ibn Hajar said: he is *Saduq* with poor memory. He continues: how is it acceptable to delude a person with a great memory and his teacher has poor memory? It is not correct, rather, it is correct to say: sometimes the teacher mentioned it in the chain of transmission and on this time Abu Jaafar al-Nafili preserved it, and on other occasions, he did not mention it, so al-Nafaili did not memorize it.<sup>75</sup>

As for the text, there is *idtirab* or confusion in two words: The first: he once said: “*lam yu 'etihi*” “He did not give him, which is the narration of al-Bukhari in two places of his book, and in the second narration it has been said: “*wa lam yuwa fihy*” he did not pay him.<sup>76</sup> Another *idtirab* that exists in this Hadith is the sentence “*wa man kunt khasmuh, khasamtuh*” and this is in the narration of Ibn Haban, Ibn Jarud, Ibn Majah, Baihaqy, Abu Ya'la, and al-Tabrany, they narrated this Hadith via a narrator called *Alta'efy*.<sup>77</sup> Similarly, Imam al-Albany said: that there is another *Idtirab* in this Hadith, and that is the existence of two opinions on being and not being of it a Qudsi hadith. According to *al-Jama'ah*, this Hadith is a *Qudsi hadith*. However, Ibn Haban, Ibn Majah, Abu Ya'la, and Tabrany do not agree and said: this is not a Qudsi hadith.<sup>78</sup> Likewise, Imam al-Albany argues that dozens of examples indicate the ignorance of those who blindly prejudice and say that all the Hadiths in Bukhari and Muslim

are authentic and *Ṣaḥiḥ*. One of the examples he mentioned is a Hadith that prophet Muhammad says heaven and hell spoke to their Lord, paradise said: My Lord, why do not enter me except the weak and fallen, and the fire said: I am filled with the arrogant, so Allah almighty said to paradise: أنت رحمتي، وقال للنار: أنت عذابي، أصيب بك من أشياء، ولكل واحدة منكما ملؤها، قال: فأما الجنة، فإن الله لا يظلم من خلقه أحداً، وإنه ينشئ للنار من يشاء، فيلقون فيها، فتقول: هل من مزيد، ثلاثاً، حتى يضع فيها قدمه فتمتلئ، ويرد بعضها إلى بعض، وتقول: قط قط قط<sup>79</sup>

“You are My Mercy,’ and said to Hell, ‘You are My Punishment which I inflict upon whom I wish, and I shall fill both of you.’” The Prophet added, “As for Paradise, (it will be filled with good people) because Allah does not wrong any of his created things, and he creates for hell (fire) whomever he will, and they will be thrown into it, and it will say thrice, ‘Is there any more, till Allah (will put) His Foot over it and it and it will become full and its sides will come close to each other and it will say, ‘Qat! Qat! Qat!’”

In this *Hadith* “*wa inahu yunshi linar*” sentence is a *Shad* narration and this is in fact “*wa yunsh'e lialjnah*,” some of the scholars said: this is an *al-maqlub*, while some others such as Ibn Qaim claim that this hadith is wrong because Allah said that he will fill the hell from the human and jinn, not other creatures, Imam Bulqiny rejected this hadith and said that Allah will not oppress anyone, and creating any creature to fill the hell is a kind of oppression, and Ibn Hajar said: this is an anomaly or *Shudud* at this Hadith.<sup>80</sup>

Likewise, there is a Hadith in Bukhari and Muslim saying that the Prophet (SAW) married Maimunah RA and he was in *ihram*,<sup>81</sup> while Maimunah herself says that the Prophet was not

higher than al-muhadith; Abu Hafz Mahmud bin Ahmad bin Mahmud Tahan al-Naymy, *Taysyir Mustalah al-hadith* (Beirut: Maktabat al-Ma'arif, 2004), 182 & 20.

<sup>75</sup>al-Albany, *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-Da'ifah wa al-Mawdu'eah*, Vol. 14, 591.

<sup>76</sup>Ibid., 591.

<sup>77</sup>Ibid., 591-592.

<sup>78</sup>Ibid., 592.

<sup>79</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 9, 134; hadith number 7449.

<sup>80</sup>al-Albaniy, *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-Sahihah wa shay' min Fiqhiha wa fawa'ediha*, Vol. 6 (Riyad: Maktabah al-Ma'arif, 2002), 93.

<sup>81</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 3, 15; hadith number 1837.

in *ihram* when married her. Also, this Hadith is in line with another narration that the Prophet (SAW) said that a person who is in *ihram* can neither marry himself nor can marry others. Ibn Musayyib was asked what he thinks about this hadith, he replied that Ibn Abbas was wrong and the Maimunah's narration is accurate.<sup>82</sup>

### C. Hadiths of al-Bukhari which Considered *Daif* by Other Scholars

There are some Hadiths in the book of al-Bukhari, which some scholars have called weak and *da'if*, some of which are as below:

The narration of Hamam bin Yahya about three-persons in Bany Israel: leper, blind, and ding.<sup>83</sup> Despite this Hadith is narrated by both Bukhari and Muslim al-'Uqailiy mentioned it in al-Du'afâ and considered it weak saying this is the speech of Ubaid bin Umair and this is not hadith.<sup>84</sup> The reason why al-'Uqailiy weakened this Hadith is that there is a narrator called Hamam bin Yahya and he has weak memory as mentioned by al-Saji, Abu Hatim, and Yazid bin Zurai'. Al-'Uqailiy argues that Hamam narrated this Hadith from his memory and this is not narrated by Ahmad bin Hanbal and by the owners of *kutub al-Sunan* which indicates that this Hadith is weak. The reason why Bukhari and Muslim narrated it because it is a story and does not belong to rulings of shari'ah and they don't have very strict conditions in narrating hadiths related to stories.<sup>85</sup> Similarly, there is a mistake in this Hadith's text and that is replacing the word "*arad-Allah*" Allah wanted to... with the word "*bda- lillah*" It seemed to Allah, some scholars of Hadith believe that the attributing al-Bada 'to Allah is a Jewish belief and according to Islamic teaching it is not fair to

attribute it to Allah.<sup>86</sup>

There is another Hadith that the prophet said: does not love the Ansar except the believers, and does not hate them except the hypocrites.<sup>87</sup> In this Hadith, there is a narrator by the name of A'di bin Thabit who the scholars of Hadith spoken about him. For Example, Ahmad bin Hanbal said: he was trustworthy and *thuqah* but he was Shiite, Imam al-Dar al-Qutny said: he is *thuqah* but he is an extreme Shiite, Ibn Mu'in said: he was an extreme Shiite,<sup>88</sup> and Abu Hatim said: he is *Sadooq* but he was the Imam of a Shiite Masjid and he was their judge.<sup>89</sup> According to scholars a Hadith should not be narrated from a person who is *mubtadi'i* and invite others to join his sect.<sup>90</sup> Also, a scholar of Hadith argues that a *mubtadi'i* is not eligible to be a narrator of Hadith, as Sufyan al-Thawry said: anyone who hears Hadith from a *mubtadi'i* he will not benefit from his narration and anyone who shook hand with a *mubtadi'i* he has invalidated Islam's loins.<sup>91</sup>

Another example can be a Hadith in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari* in which Anas narrates that when the Prophet (SAW) spoke he used to repeat his speech three times and he used to greet them three times whenever he came to a meeting.<sup>92</sup> Al-Zahaby said: this is from the oddity or *al-gharabah* of *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhari*, this hadith narrated from a *thuqah* from Abdul Samad bin Abdul Warith,<sup>93</sup> Abu Hatim Said: he is honest with good Hadiths, Ibn Qany

<sup>82</sup>Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, *Fath al-Bary Sharh Sahih al-Bukhari*, Vol. 9 (Beirut: Dar al-Marifat, 1379 H), 165.

<sup>83</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol 4, 171; hadith number 3464.

<sup>84</sup>Abu Jafar Muhammad bin 'Amr bin Musa bn Hamaad al-Maky al-'Uqailiy, *Al-Du'afa al-Kabir*, Vol. 4 (Beirut: Dar al-Maktabah al-Ilmiyah, 1984), 369.

<sup>85</sup>I. Amin, (n.d.). Ibn Amin. Retrieved from Daef Al-Bukhari wa Muslim: [http://www.ibnamin.com/daef\\_bukhari\\_muslim.htm](http://www.ibnamin.com/daef_bukhari_muslim.htm)

<sup>86</sup>S. al-Hajy, (2020, October 13). Banassa. Retrieved from Naq al-Shaikh al-Albany ly sahyh Al-Bukhari :<https://banassa.com/notmob/50015.html>

<sup>87</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 5, 32; hadith number 3783.

<sup>88</sup>Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, *Thadib al-Thadib*, Vol. 7 (India: Matba'a Dar al-Ma'arif al-Nizamiya, 1326 H), 166.

<sup>89</sup>Ibid., 7/165.

<sup>90</sup>Amin, I. (n.d.). Ibn Amin. Retrieved from Daef Al-Bukhari wa Muslim: [http://www.ibnamin.com/daef\\_bukhari\\_muslim.htm](http://www.ibnamin.com/daef_bukhari_muslim.htm)

<sup>91</sup>Abu Bakar Ahmad bin Ali bin Thabith bin Ahmad bin Mahdy al-Khatib al-Baghdady, *Al-Jam'i li Akhlaq al-Rawy wa Adab al-Samy*, Vol. 1 (Riyad: Maktaba al-Ma'arif, 1431 H), 137-138.

<sup>92</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 1, 30; hadith number 95.

<sup>93</sup>Shamsuddin Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Usman bin Qaymaz al-Zahaby, *Syar A'elam al-Nubla*, Vol. 14 (Beirut: Muasyat al-Risalah, 1985), 153.

said: he was *thuqah* with doing mistakes,<sup>94</sup> Ibn Mu‘in said: he is nothing, al-Nasa’i said: he is not strong, Ibn Haban said: probably doing mistakes, Abu Daud said: I do not narrate his Hadiths, Saji said he is weak, and Ibn Mahdi believed that he is mendacious.<sup>95</sup>

There is another Hadith that Imam Abu Hanifah rejected that, and it is narrated by Anas bin Malik that: a Jewish man crushed a girl’s head between two stones when the girl was asked who did this to you and because she could not speak, people call names and she was saying no until they called the name of the same Jewish man. The girl pointed out by her head, saying yes. After this, the Jewish man was brought to the prophet and he confessed, so the Prophet (SAW) ordered that his head must be crushed between two stones.<sup>96</sup> When this Hadith told Imam Abu Hanifah, he reacted, very strongly and said: This is (*hudyan*) delirium.<sup>97</sup>

Similarly, there is another Hadith which is narrated from Aisha Siddiqah that she used to clean the traces of *janabah* from the cloths of the Prophet (SAW) and he used to go to prayer while there were signs of water in her clothes.<sup>98</sup> Imam Shafi‘i, said: This Hadith is not proven from Aishah, and there is an error from ‘Amr ibn Maimun in narrating the hadith, as this is the opinion of Sulaiman ibn Yasar, rather than the opinion of Aishah.<sup>99</sup>

There is also another Hadith in Bukhari which Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal considered weak. The Prophet said: My *ummah* will be destroyed by this group of Quraysh. The companions asked the Prophet what you would command us to do at that time, he replied that it would be good if the people leave them alone.<sup>100</sup> This Hadith has been mentioned by Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal in his Musnad, but at the end of this narration, Abdullah

ibn Ahmad bin Hanbal said that my father said in the illness in which he passed away, leave this Hadith because it is contrary to other Hadiths of the Prophet that instructs listening to the leader of Muslim’s orders, obeying him, and being patient.<sup>101</sup>

## Conclusion

As a result, considering the past and new scientific theories and researches, it can be said that Şaḥiḥ al-Bukhari is one of the most correct books after the Holy Qur’an and Imam Bukhari has seriously tried and committed to quote and narrate only the authentic hadiths in his book Şaḥiḥ al-Bukhari. For this reason, he has set very difficult and strict conditions for narrating a hadith from others. Despite all that, Imam Bukhari is a human being, and Şaḥiḥ al-Bukhari is a human work, and human work is not free of mistakes. Therefore, it is possible that Imam Bukhari also made mistakes in citing and narrating some weak narrations, and considered them authentic hadiths as stated in the examples. The scholars such as Imam Dar al-Qutny and Imam Nasiruddin al-Albany and other scholars testified that there are *da’if* hadiths in Şaḥiḥ al-Bukhari. Therefore, it can be said that there are a small number of weak hadiths in Bukhari. And the existence of the above hadiths does not reduce the scientific status of Imam Bukhari and his book among the Muslims. Similarly, believing in the existence of weak hadiths in Şaḥiḥ al-Bukhari does not mean denying the hadiths or enmity with the hadiths of the Prophet, but it is an attempt to separate the authentic and correct hadiths from the weak and nonauthentic ones.

## References

Abi Hatim, Abdulrahman. *al-Jarh wa-Ta’dil*. Beirut: Dar al-Ihya’ Altrath Al’erby, 1271.  
al-Albaniy, Abu Abdulrahman Muhammad

<sup>94</sup>Ibn Hajar al-‘Asqalany, *Tahdib al-tahdib*, Vol. 6, 328.

<sup>95</sup>I. Amin, (n.d.). Ibn Amin. Retrieved from *da’if* Al-Bukhari wa Muslim: [http://www.ibnamin.com/daef\\_bukhari\\_muslim.htm](http://www.ibnamin.com/daef_bukhari_muslim.htm)

<sup>96</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 6, 6; hadith number 6884.

<sup>97</sup>Al-Baghdady, *Tarikh Baghdad* (Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 1417 H), 13/387.

<sup>98</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 1, 55; hadith number 229.

<sup>99</sup>al-Shafi’i, *Kitab Al-Um* (Beirut: Dar al-Ma’rifat, 1990), 1/74.

<sup>100</sup>al-Bukhari, Vol. 4, 199; hadith number 3604.

<sup>101</sup>Ibn Hanbal, Ahmad, *Musnad al-Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal* (Beirut: Muasisa al-Risalat, 2001) 13\381-383; hadith number 8006.

- Nasruddin Bin Alhaj Nuh Bin Najaty Bin Adam. *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-Da'ifah wa al-Mawdu'ah wa Atharuha al-Say'e fi al-Ummah*. Riyad: Dar al-Ma'arif, 1992.
- . *Sulsilah al-Ahadith al-Şahihah wa Shay' Min Fiqhiha wa Fawa'ediha*. Riyad: Maktabah al-Ma'arif, 2002.
- Amin, Ibn Amin. "daCif Al-Bukhari wa Muslim" [http://www.ibnamin.com/daef\\_bukhari\\_muslim.htm](http://www.ibnamin.com/daef_bukhari_muslim.htm), Internet. Retrieved n.d.
- Atur, Nūruddin. *Manhaj al-Naqd fi 'Ulumy al-Hadith*. Syria: Dar al-Fikr, 1981.
- Aziz, Muhammad Farih Abdul. *Inayh al- 'Ulama Bil-Isnad wa 'Ilm al-Jarh wa al-Ta'dil*. Riyad: Majm'e al-Malik, 1431.
- al-Imam Ibn Baz. "al-ad'ea' ban Şahih al-Bukhari wa Muslim bihyma ahadith da 'eyfah." <https://binbaz.org.sa/fatwas/2735/%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A7%D8%AF%D8%B9%D8%> Internet. Retrieved, 19 October 2020.
- al-Badur, Abdulmuhsin bin Hamid bin Abdulmuhsin bin Abdullah bin Hamid al-Ebad. *Al-Imam al-Bukhari wa Kitabuhu al-Jam'i al-Şahih*. Madinah al-Munawarah: al-Jami'ah al-Islamiyah, n.d.
- al-Baghdady, Abu Bakar Ahmad bin Ali bin Thabit bin Ahmad bin Mahdy al-Khatib. *al-Jam'i li Akhlaq al-Rawy wa 'Adab al-Samy*. Riyad: Maktabah al-Ma'arif, 1431.
- . *Tarikh Baghdad*. Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1417.
- al-Bukhari, Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Isma'il, *Şahih al-Bukhari*. Beirut: Dar Tawq al-Najah, 1422.
- Collection, H. "Introduction to Şahih al-Bukhari": <http://hadithcollection.com/about-hadith-books/Şahih-bukhari/background.html>, Internet. Reterived n.d.
- Farah, Abdul Aziz Mohammed. *Inayh al-'Ilmiyah' bil-Isnad wa 'Ilm al-Jarh wa Ta'dil*. Riyad: Majm'e al-Malik Fahd, 1431.
- al-Faamy, A. A. Alukah. "Maryfat-ul-Mustalahat-wa-al-rumuz Ynda-al-Muhadythyn": <https://www.alukah.net/sharia/0/76973/>, Internet. Retrieved. 10 November 2014.
- Goldziher. *Muslim Studies*. Trans. London: S. S. M., & B. C. R., 1971.
- al-Hajy, S. Banassa. "Naqd al-Shaikh al-Albany li Şahih al-Bukhari": <https://banassa.com/notmob/50015.html>, Internet. Retrieved 13 October 2020.
- al-Hamawy, Abu Abdullah Badruddin Muhammad bin Ibrahim bin Sa'id bin Jama'eh al-Kanany al-Shafi'i. *al-Minhal al-Rawy fi Mukhtasar 'Ilm al-Hadith al-Nabawy*. Dimashq: Dar al-fikr, 1406.
- al-Hanafi, Muhammad bin Sulaiman bin Sa'ad bin Mas'ud al-Rumi. *Al-Mukhtasar fi 'Ilm al-Athar*. Riyad: Maktabah al-Rushd, 1407.
- al-Hanafi, Alauddin Mughaltaiy bin Qulaj bin Abdullah al-Bukjury. *Ikmal Tahdyb al-Kamal fi Asma' al-Rijal*. Qahirah: al-Faruq al-Hadithah Lil-Taba'eh wa al-Nashur, 2001.
- Hera, S. H. "Kritik Ignaz Goldziher dan Pembelaan Musthofa al-Azami terhadap Hadis dalam Kitab Shahih al-Bukhari." *Jurnal Living Hadis* 5, no.1 (2020): 133-149.
- Hud Hud, M. Masralarabia. Retrieved from Naqd Al-Turath "Naqd Şahih Al-Bukhari wa Muslim": <https://masralarabia.net/%D8%A7%>. Internet. Retrieved 07 April 2015.
- Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalany, Abu Al-Fadul Ahmad bin Ali bin Muhammad bin Ahmad. *Nuzhat al-Nazar fi Tawzihy Nukhbat al-Fekar fi Mustalahy Ahly al-Athar*. Dimashq: Matbaghah al-Sabah, 2000.
- . *Fath al-Bary Sharh Şahih al-Bukhari*. Beirut: Dar al-Ma'rifat, 1379.
- . *Thadib al-Thadib*. India: Matba'ah Dar al-Ma'arif al-Nizamiyah, 1326.
- . *Hady Al-Sary Muqdimah Fath al-Bary*. Riyad: Dar al-Taibah, n.d.
- . *Taqrib al-Tahdib*. Syria: Dar al-Rashid,



- 1986.
- Ibn Hanbal, Ahmad. *Musnad al-Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal*. Beirut: Muasisa al-Risalat, 2001.
- Ibn Rajab, Zainuddin Abdulrahman bin Ahmad. *Jam'ī al-'Ulum wa al-Hikam fī Sharhy Khamsin Hadithan min Jawâm'e al-Kalym*. Researched by al-Arnawut. Beirut: Muasisat al-Risalat, 2001.
- Ibn al-Salah, Abu 'Amr Uthman Bin Abdulrahman. *Marifatu Anwa' al-Hadith*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1986.
- . *Marifatu Anwa' al-Hadith*. Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 2002.
- al-Jurjany, Abu Ahmad Abdullah bin 'Edy. *al-Kamil fi al-Du'afa'*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, n.d.
- Kafy, Abu Bakr. *Manhaj al-Imam al-Bukhari fi Tashihil al-Ahadith wa Taliliha*. Beirut: Dar Ibn Hazm, 2000.
- al-Nawawy, Abu-Zakariya Muhyiddin Yahya Bin Sharaf. *al-Minhaj Sharh Şahih Muslim bin al-Hajaj*. Beirut: Dar Ihya' al-Turath al-'Araby, 1431.
- al-Naymy, Abu Hafz Mahmud bin Ahmad bin Mahmūd Tahan. *Taysyir Mustalah al-Hadith*. Beirut: Maktabat al-Ma'arif, 2004.
- Ruz, A.Y. aljaml "Al-Ahadith Al-Manhulah fy Sahyh Al-Bukhari" <https://aljaml.com/%D8%A7%D9%>, Internet. Reterived n.d.
- Saad, J. & Rabi, A. A. "Assessing Goldziher's Claim of Fabrication of Hadith by the Companions of the Prophet." *Al-Burhān: Journal Of Qur'ān and Sunnah Studies* 3, no. 2 (2019): 34-51.
- al-Salih, Ibrahim Subhy. *'Ulum al-Hadith wa Mustalahatuhu*. Beirut: Dar al-'Ilm Lil Malayin, 1984.
- al-Shafi'i, Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Idris bin al-Abbas bin Uthman bin Shafi'i bin Abdul Mutalib bin Abdul Manaf al-Matlabi al-Quraishy. *Kitab Al-Um*. Beirut: Dar al-Ma'rifat, 1990.
- al-'Uqailiy, Abu Jafar Muhammad bin 'Amr bin Musa bn Hamād al-Maky. *al-Dua'fa al-Kabir*. Beirut: Dar al-Maktabah al-Ilmiyah, 1984.
- al-Zahaby, Shamsuddin Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Uthman bin Qaymaz. *Syar A'elam al-Nubala*. Beirut: Muasisat al-Risalah, 1985.
- . *al-Muqizah fi 'Ilmi Mustalah al-Hadith*. Halab: Maktabah al-Matbughat al-Islamia, 1412.