COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF FEMALE CONSUMER LOYALTY LEVELS IN ONLINE AND CONVENTIONAL STORES OF COSMETIC PRODUCT TYPES

Ikhwani Ratna[1], Hidayati Nasrah[2]
[1,2] Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau, Indonesia
hidayatinasrah@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Progresses in innovation have made it less demanding for individuals to carry out buying and offering exercises. Since with web innovation, individuals can make buying and offering exchanges without assembly in individual. Be that as it may, buying and offering exercises carried out through online media have an impact on client devotion. This inquire about was conducted due to see how the comparison of client dependability in online stores with ordinary stores. The inquire about was conducted by conducting interviews through surveys to clients of online stores and ordinary stores by taking a test of 100 individuals. The samples taken were from women, this was done because the market segmentation of cosmetic products is more targeted at women, and also cosmetic products are more dominated by women. The collected information was at that point analyzed utilizing clear strategies. Based on the comes about of the ponder, it can be concluded that client devotion in customary stores is superior than client devotion in online stores. This could be seen from the comes about of surveys disseminated to respondents where customer dependability in routine stores encompasses a higher score when compared to scores at online stores.

Keyword: *consumer, loyality level, online store, conventional store.*

ABSTRAK

Kemajuan dalam bidang inovasi telah mempermudah individu dalam melakukan aktivitas jual beli. Sebab dengan adanya inovasi internet, individu dapat melakukan transaksi jual beli tanpa harus bertemu langsung. Akan tetapi, aktivitas jual beli yang dilakukan melalui media online berdampak pada loyalitas pelanggan. Penelitian ini dilakukan karena untuk melihat bagaimana perbandingan loyalitas pelanggan pada toko online dengan toko konvensional. Penelitian dilakukan dengan melakukan wawancara melalui survei kepada pelanggan toko online dan toko konvensional dengan mengambil sampel sebanyak 100 orang. Sampel yang diambil adalah dari yang berjenis kelamin wanita, hal ini dilakukan karena segmentasi pasar produk kosmetik lebih ditargetkan pada kalangan wanita, dan juga produk kosmetik lebih didominasi oleh wanita. Data yang terkumpul kemudian dianalisa dengan menggunakan metode yang jelas. Berdasarkan hasil penelitian dapat disimpulkan bahwa loyalitas pelanggan pada toko konvensional lebih baik dibandingkan loyalitas pelanggan pada toko online. Hal ini dapat dilihat dari hasil survei yang dibagikan kepada responden dimana loyalitas pelanggan pada toko konvensional memiliki skor yang lebih tinggi jika dibandingkan dengan skor pada toko online.

Keyword: *konsumen, tingkat loyalitas, toko online, toko konvensional*

INTRODUCTION

Current low-tech technology has become more and more integrated with low-tech. One of the things that stands out to us at this point is the use of technology in trade. Trade technology, in particular, facilitates trade between suppliers and customers without requiring them to communicate in person by using the internet. When there is online trading, there is a more rapid and efficient distribution system, which benefits both the supplier and the customer (A. Supriyadi, 2015)

Utilizing this online technology for distribution means that it is not limited to the production of a single product; rather, it also includes those involved in distribution channels such as retailers and wholesalers, where the distribution channel is the internet (Suyanto, 2003).

Due to the rapid advancement of internet technology, it is now easier for manufacturers and customers to communicate with each other. Customers do not need to go to the store again in order to purchase the desired goods. Furthermore, the manufacturer does not need to provide a place to crush the product's raw materials as well as a place to store its finished goods. As a result of this technological advancement, manufacturers are also able to collaborate more closely in order to market their products online through websites and social media platforms alike. According to a report from CNBC Indonesia, the estimated value of Indonesian people's online shopping throughout 2022 will reach around US$55.97 billion or equivalent to Rp851 trillion. A survey by Populix in July-August 2022 showed that 86% of 1,020 respondents in Indonesia had shopped via social media. Of that number, the most widely used platforms are TikTok Shop, WhatsApp, Facebook and Instagram (cnbcindonesia, 2023)

In addition to the benefits of modern internet technology, there are drawbacks that result from transactions made through online marketplaces. The main point is that there is a growing emotional gulf between buyers and sellers. In the case of traditional shopping, buyers can communicate silently to list the products they intend to purchase; nevertheless, online shopping also results in more rapid communication. In addition, the quality of the products that will be purchased online cannot be guaranteed because the buyer is unable to view the goods that are being purchased quietly and occasionally there is also an online store's purchase order being fulfilled by the seller. The Ministry of Trade has received 3,692 consumer complaints in the period from January to June 2022. As many as 86.1% or 3,181 of them came from the e-commerce sector. The data comes from the records of the Directorate General of Consumer Protection and Business Order (Ditjen PKTN) of the

Ministry of Trade. Complaints in the online store sector include the food and beverage sector, financial services, transportation services, tourism, and electronics/motor vehicles. The types of complaints include purchases of goods that are not in accordance with the agreement or are damaged, goods not received by consumers, unilateral cancellations by business actors, the time of arrival of goods is not as promised, refunds, adding (top up) balances, and the use of platform/social media applications (detik, 2022)

Customers who prefer to shop at traditional brick-and-mortar stores will be able to communicate with the staff members there in a quiet and efficient manner. They can choose products that are more clearly defined, inspect them, and provide after-sale support such as air conditioning units in customer homes or computer software installations. Conversely, customers who purchase goods online will not have the emotional support they need, which will result in them only being able to communicate through phone calls or online platforms. It is not possible to evaluate a product in a slow manner; in the event of a problem, it will take longer to receive a prompt response and no post-sale support (Listianti, 2020)

A weak emotional bond between customers and the product or store is what makes it difficult for customers to be devoted to only one store. Customers will quickly move to another store if there is one that sells goods at a lower price, more people will take advantage of promotions (such as frequent product updates on social media platforms) and sell a wider variety of goods (Fachrurrozi, 2016)

Although there isn't any hard data to support this claim, the authors conducted a pilot study in which they interviewed 15 respondents about their experiences when they trade online or at traditional exchanges. The results indicate that 65 percent of customers are more devoted to traditional brick-and-mortar stores than they are to internet retailers. This is caused by the fact that they have psychological attachments to the tores, such as being at ease with its appearance, being able to communicate with the staff members there or the owners of the store, and having a location close to their home or place of employment. Customers who are not devoted to online stores are usually caused by the abundance of options available, especially on social media platforms, for online stores that offer competitive prices and fast service (Bae, Soonyong & Lee, 2011)

Customers of online stores also frequently experience disappointment when they discover that there is a discrepancy between the services provided; this can negatively impact word-of-mouth advertising for online stores (Sohel, 2020). According to research by (Boulay, 2014), children prefer traditional games more than online ones since they are

more entertaining and engaging. According to research conducted by (Rafiq, Mohamed; Fulford, 2005), customers of online stores are very devoted to them compared to physical stores in the Maya region because of their fair trade practices and willingness to go beyond price alone. As a result, there are differences in the study results between the two studies.

The internet stores that are available in Indonesia can be seen in Table 1.1, but not all of them have their names listed there. Online stores found on social networking platforms like Facebook, Instagram, Path, and others are also known as online stores that are popular among customers who frequently transact online.

Table 1. *Online store* in Indonesia

No	Store names
1	Tokobagus.com (olx)
2	Berniaga.com
3	Tokopedia.com
4	Bukalapak.com
5	Shoope

source: data olahan (2024)

As an association of the global business community, ICSC conducted research and one of the results stated that customers are more likely to make in-person purchases than they are from online retailers. Of those surveyed, 75% stated that this is because they prefer to browse or peruse products in-person before making a purchase (C. dan Supriyadi, 2024). This basically proves that the traditional market's share of revenue has not increased despite the emergence of digital marketing technology. However, this does not diminish the value of traditional marketing because the growth of international trade has continued to increase at a rate of about 30% annually (Dharmamesta, 2008)

The largest growth in international trade is in the petroleum industry, which is driven by computer and travel-related businesses (Ivan, 2020). Based on this latent problem, the authors write a study titled "A Comparison of Customer Satisfaction Levels in Online and Conventional Retail Stores for cosmetic Products.". The significant difference of this study is the emphasis on samples taken from women. Studies show that women are more active in online shopping activities than men. They are often the main decision makers in purchasing household needs, fashion, beauty, and health products. Women have more complex shopping behavior patterns, including considering product details, price

comparisons, customer reviews, and promotions. This makes research on women able to provide deeper insights into online shopping habits.

METHODS

Type of Research

Research method is a way used in research to achieve the research objectives. Research method or often called research methodology is a research design or plan. This design contains a formulation of the object or subject to be studied, data collection techniques, data collection procedures and analysis regarding a particular problem focus (Moleong, 2005). Research methods are "the methods used by researchers in designing, implementing, processing data, and drawing conclusions regarding a particular research problem". The Method used in this research is a descriptive method, with a correlational study type. The approach used in this research is a quantitative approach. Descriptive research is a research method aimed at describing existing phenomena, which are taking place at present or in the past (Anshori, 2015)

The Location of Research

The location of the research was conducted in Pekanbaru city. The reasons for conducting the research in Pekanbaru city include because Pekanbaru city is a big city that has many conventional shops that sell clothing products. In addition, the high population growth of Pekanbaru also affects the economic activity in Pekanbaru city.

Data collection technique

1) **Liblary Research**

   Data collection through library research, namely by reading books or literature or other scientific works and other data sources that are related to writing this research (Kuncoro, 2018)

2) **Field Research**

   Data collection through field research is done by providing a list of questions (questionnaires) to respondents to answer, then the answers to each question are scored using the Likert Scale. The Likert Scale is used to measure the opinions, attitudes and perceptions of a person or group of people about a social phenomenon.

The variables measured are described into variable indicators. Then the indicators are used as a starting point for compiling items that can be questions or statements (Djaali, 2010). The Likert scale used is the scale (1, 2, 3, 4, 5) with general criteria for the scores used for the answers are:

Strongly agree, score = 5

Agree, score = 4

Neutral, score = 3

Disagree, score = 2

Strongly disagree, score = 1

Sampling Method

The population in this study were customers who had made purchases of products via the internet and conventional stores and each had made more than three purchases at one store. Given the very large population in this study, the sampling used Purposive Sampling (Narbuko, Chalil, 2014)

The sample size in this study was calculated based on the opinion of Roscoe (1975) in (Sekaran, 2010) which explains that the sample size should be above 30 and less than 500, so the researcher in this case determined that the sample size used was 100 respondents. Respondents will be divided into two, 100 respondents received a questionnaire about loyalty to online clothing product stores and 100 respondents received a questionnaire about loyalty to conventional clothing product stores, which is because the characteristics of the customers of the two stores are different (Schramm-Klein, 2010) and to avoid testing effects on respondents.

Data Analysis Method

The data analysis technique used in this study is descriptive data analysis. (Yanti, 2012) stated that descriptive analysis aims to systematically describe the facts or characteristics of a particular population or a particular field factually and accurately. Descriptive analysis in this study was carried out using frequency distribution tabulation and histogram techniques, and was supplemented with narrative explanations (Koentjaraningrat, 2014). The steps for data analysis are as follows.

1. Instruments that have been filled out by respondents are checked for completeness. Incomplete instruments are considered not eligible for analysis.

2. A code book is created as an effort to guide researchers to convert qualitative data into quantitative (numerical).

3. Compiling Data view and Variable view as the main rules of the numeric data system from all variables.

4. Inputting data, from the instrument to the main table of research data.

5. Descriptive data analysis

6. Creating a frequency distribution table, histogram, and explanations as needed

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Data Analysis

Data analysis is an activity carried out by researchers in revealing the meaning of data that has been obtained from the research process that has been carried out (Suharso, 2014). Data analysis in this study is an effort to investigate in depth the data that researchers have successfully obtained during the research, so that the meaning and actual conditions of what will be studied will be known. The data analysis process is carried out in accordance with the procedures that have been set out in the previous chapter.

Data Selection

Data selection is carried out after the data has been successfully collected with the aim of being able to be processed further. In this data selection, it is discussed whether the questionnaire to be distributed is complete or not, how to fill in the answers and the questionnaire (Bungin, 2014). From the results of the completion, it was concluded that all questionnaires met the provisions set so that they could be processed further in the next stage. The results of these activities can be seen in the following table:

Tabel 3. Data Selection Results

RESEARCH VARIABLE	Data Source	Number of questionnaires			
		Spread out	Collected	Processed	Unprocessed
Online store customers	Questionnaire	100	100	100	0
Convensional Store Costumers	Questionnaire	100	100	100	0

Source: Processed Data

Based on table 4.9 above, it can be seen that the distributed questionnaires can be collected again, so that activities can be carried out in the next stage, namely data tabulation.

Questionnaire Measurement Results

Respondents' responses to the variable of online store customer loyalty level. Based on the results of the respondents' answers for each indicator of the level of customer loyalty of conventional stores and the level of customer loyalty of online stores above, to see the results of the overall average score, you can see the following recapitulation of the distribution of answers from respondents :

Tabel 4. Recapitulation of Respondent Distribution Independent Variable Level of Online Store Customer Loyalty

No	Indicator	Number of Respondents	Score	Category
1	Shopping Frecuency	100	390	Good
2	Online Shopping Place	100	381	Good
3	Online Shopping Suggestiona	100	405	Very Good
4	Suggestions at the same place	100	380	Good
5	Subcribtion online stores	100	391	Good
Total Score		**1947**		
Category		**Good**		

Source: Results of data processing and survey results in 2024

From the recapitulation table above based on the respondents' responses from the previously determined indicators, it can be concluded that all indicators and question items responded to by respondents obtained a total score of 1947 categorized as good. This means that the level of customer loyalty of online stores in Pekanbaru is good. This result is measured by the level of customer loyalty of online stores of respondents from the categories assessed including the frequency owned in the good category, shopping places in the good category, online shopping suggestions in the very good category, shopping suggestions at the same store in the good category and having a subscription online store in the good category.

Respondents' responses to the variable of customer loyalty level of conventional clothing stores in Pekanbaru City.

The loyalty of conventional clothing store customers is something that is needed to meet daily needs. With adequate loyalty of conventional store customers, conventional clothing stores will be able to increase their productivity.

Based on the results of respondents' answers for each indicator of the level of customer loyalty in conventional stores, to see the results of the overall average score, you can see the following recapitulation of the distribution of answers from respondents.

Tabel 5. Recapitulation of Respondent Distribution Independent Variable: Customer Loyalty Level of Conventional Stores

No	Indicator	Number of Respondents	Score	Category
1	Shopping Frequency	100	414	Very Good
2	Shopping Place	100	399	Good
3	Shopping suggestion at conventional stores	100	421	Very Good
4	Suggestion at the same place	100	425	Good
5	Frequent conventional stores	100	428	Good
Total Score		**2087**		
Category		**Good**		

Source: Results of data processing and survey results in 2024

From the recapitulation table above based on the respondents' responses from the previously determined indicators, it can be concluded that all indicators and question items responded to by respondents obtained a total score of 2087 categorized as good. This means that the level of customer loyalty of conventional stores in Pekanbaru is good. This result is measured by the level of customer loyalty of conventional stores of respondents from the categories assessed including the frequency owned in the good category, shopping places in the good category, conventional shopping suggestions in the very good category, shopping suggestions at the same store in the good category and having a subscription conventional store in the good category.

Decription

Based on the survey results that have been presented above, there are several things that need to be discussed as an important part of the research results conducted:

1. Comparison of Customer Loyalty of Online Stores and Conventional Stores

Judging from the results of the questionnaire that has been filled out by the respondents, it can be concluded that conventional customers have better loyalty compared to customers in online stores. Based on the results of data processing from the questionnaire distributed to respondents, it can be seen that the level of customer loyalty in online stores is 1947 which is in the good category, while customer loyalty in conventional stores is 2087 which is in the good category. Although both are in the good category, the number of values on the conventional customer questionnaire is higher than the customer questionnaire in online stores. When viewed from the indicators that are compiled, it also illustrates the same thing, because of the 5 indicators that are compiled also show the same thing.

From the shopping frequency indicator compiled in the questionnaire, the number of online store customer loyalty values is 390 which is smaller than the value of conventional store customer loyalty of 414. So it can be concluded that conventional store customer loyalty is better than online stores when viewed from the frequency indicator. From the shopping place indicator compiled in the questionnaire, the total value of online store customer loyalty is 381 which is smaller than the value of conventional store customer loyalty of 399. So it can be concluded that conventional store customer loyalty is better than online stores when viewed from the shopping place indicator.

From the shopping suggestion indicator compiled in the questionnaire, the total value of online store customer loyalty is 405 which is smaller than the value of conventional store customer loyalty of 421. So it can be concluded that conventional store customer loyalty is better than online stores when viewed from the shopping suggestion indicator.

From the shopping suggestion indicator compiled in the questionnaire, the total value of online store customer loyalty is 380 which is smaller than the value of conventional store customer loyalty of 425. So it can be concluded that conventional store customer loyalty is better than online stores when viewed from the shopping suggestion indicator.

From the subscription place indicator compiled in the questionnaire, the total value of online store customer loyalty is 391 which is smaller than the value of conventional store

customer loyalty of 428. So it can be concluded that conventional store customer loyalty is better than online stores when viewed from the subscription place indicator.

2. Reasons why customers prefer to shop at conventional stores compared to online stores.

Based on the results of interviews conducted with several respondents who prefer to shop at conventional stores compared to online stores, because in conventional stores customers can directly see the products they buy and can assess the goods in terms of quality. Based on their experience, the respondents who were interviewed had bought goods at online stores that did not match the description of the goods advertised. So there was disappointment from respondents who made purchases at online stores (Julina, 2012).

In addition, this is also the reason customers prefer to shop at conventional stores because of the direct interaction between buyers and sellers. With direct interaction, a better emotional relationship will be formed compared to online store customers who do not interact directly (Schramm-Klein, 2010). This is also in accordance with the research of shy 2013 (Shy, 2013) which states that with Customers who are accustomed to shopping at conventional stores (stores that have buildings / Brick and Mortar stores) will be in direct contact with store employees, can choose products more clearly, touch products and convey complaints more easily to store employees and provide after-sales services such as product installation if it is an electronic item such as AC in the customer's home or software installation on a computer, while customers who buy products at online stores do not have a strong emotional bond (emotional closeness) because they do not meet in person and only talk via computer or cellphone. Unable to touch the product directly, if there is a complaint it will be more difficult to get a quick response and do not have after-sales service (Yang & Yang, 2024).

Based on the results of the tests that have been carried out, there are several analyses that can be carried out from both the seller and buyer sides, including the following:

From the Buyer's Side

a. Physical and Sensory Experience

   Consumers can see, touch, and try products directly before buying, such as clothes, shoes, or electronic equipment.There is emotional satisfaction due to direct interaction with the product.

b. Trust in Products

Conventional stores allow consumers to ensure product quality directly on the spot.Reduced risk of getting goods that do not match expectations or descriptions.

c. Instant Transactions

Buyers get products directly without waiting for delivery.There is no risk of delays or damage to goods during the shipping process.

d. Social Interaction and Convenience

Shopping activities in conventional stores are often considered entertainment or family recreational activities.Direct interaction with sellers can help in price negotiations or getting product recommendations.

e. Payment Security

There is no concern about online fraud or payment data leaks.Payments are made in cash or through methods that are believed to be more secure.

f. Local Brand Trust

Conventional stores, especially those that have been known for a long time in the community, have a better reputation and are more trusted by consumers.

From the trader's Side

a. Customer Relationships

Sellers can build personal relationships and customer loyalty through direct service. Customers are more likely to return if they are satisfied with the interaction provided.

b. Product Quality Control

Sellers can ensure that the products displayed are in good condition. There is no risk of large returns as is often the case with online stores.

c. Minimized Risk of Returns

Buyers who have seen the goods directly will return them less often, reducing seller losses.

d. Not Dependent on Logistics and Technology

Sellers in conventional stores do not need to rely on logistics or marketplace systems.The payment system can be simpler without additional costs from digital platforms.

e. Impulsive Consumers

Many consumers tend to buy more items when they see an attractive product directly. Sellers can more easily create attractive promotions in physical stores.

f. Wider Target Market

Not all consumers are tech-savvy or comfortable shopping online. Conventional stores still reach more traditional segments of society.

CONCLUSION

Based on the inquire about that has been conducted on respondents related to the comparison of client dependability in online stores and routine stores in Pekanbaru City, a few things can be concluded as takes after:

1. Based on the survey conveyed to respondents, it can be concluded that client dependability in ordinary stores is at 2087 which can be categorized as great. This implies that clients in ordinary stores are faithful sufficient to return to shop at routine stores. In case client dependability increments, the powerlessness of client bunches from competitor assaults can be decreased. This can be an marker related to future benefit since client devotion can specifically be deciphered as future deals.

2. Based on the survey dispersed to respondents, it can be concluded that client devotion in online stores is at 1947 which can be categorized as great. This implies that clients in online stores are faithful sufficient to return to shop at online stores. In case client devotion in online stores increments, the helplessness of client groups from competitor assaults can be decreased. Typically an pointer related to future benefit since client devotion can straightforwardly be translated as future deals.

3. Based on the investigate comes about, it can be concluded that client dependability in customary stores is way better when compared to client devotion in online stores. This will be seen from the comes about of the survey dispersed to respondents where customer dependability in customary stores features a higher score when compared to the score in online stores. This could moreover cruel that clients still favor to shop at customary stores compared to shopping at online stores.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Anshori, M. (2015). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif. *Airlangga University Perss, 2*.

Bae, Soonyong & Lee, T. (2011). Gender Differences in Consumers' Perception of Online Consumer Reviews. *Electron Commer Res, 11*.

Boulay, J. de F. (2014). When Children Express Their Preferences Regarding Sales

Channels: Online or Offline or Online and Offline? *International Journal of Retail and Distribution Managemen*, *42*.

Bungin, B. (2014). Metodologi Penelitian Sosial. *Surabaya: Airlangga University Press*.

Dharmamesta, B. S. dan T. H. (2008). Manajemen Pemasaran: Analisa Perilaku Konsumen. *BPFE.Yogyakarta*.

Djaali. (2010). Skala Likert. *Pustaka Utama : Jakarta*.

Fachrurrozi, A. (2016). Analisis Perilaku Berbelanja Online Konsumen Muslim dalam Perspektif Gender Di Provinsi Riau. *Marwah*, *XV No.1 Ju*.

Https://finance.detik.com. (2022). *artikel finance*.

Https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/tech. (2023). *warga RI habiskan uang 851 T untuk belanja online*.

Ivan, M. dan. (2020). Virtual Store Belum Gantikan Brick and Mortar. *Majalah Marketing*, *3*.

Julina. (2012). Analisis Perilaku Konsumen Perempuan Terhadap Kesehatan Reproduksi dan Perilaku Penggunaan Pembalut. *Marwah*, *Vol 11*, *No*.

Koentjaraningrat. (2014). Metode-Metode Penelitian Masyarakat,. *Gramedia Jakarta*.

Kuncoro, M. (2018). Metode Kuantitatif Teori dan Aplikasi untuk Bisnis dan Ekonomi. *IPD STIM YKPN, Yogjakarta*.

Listianti, E. S. (2020). Analisis e-costumer Loyalty (Studi Pada e-commerce Shopee Indonesia). *Tesis Universitas Negeri Jakarta*.

Moleong, L. . (2005). Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif. *Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung*.

Narbuko, Chalil, A. A. (2014). Metodologi Penelitian. *Penerbit Bumi Askara, Jakarta*.

Rafiq, Mohamed; Fulford, H. (2005). Loyalty Transfer from Online to Offline Stores In UK Grocery Industry. *International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management*, *33*.

Schramm-Klein. (2010). Internet vs Bricks-and-Mortar Store-Analysing The Influence of Shopping Motive on Retail Channel Choice Among Internet Users. *Journal of Customer Behaviour*, *6*.

Sekaran. (2010). Research Methods for Business: A Skill Building Approach. *John Wiley and Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chicester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, United Kingdom*.

Shy, O. (2013). Windows Shopping. *Workng Papers Federal Reserve Bank of Boston*.

Sohel, A. (2020). Perspectives Service Failures and Customer Defection: A Closer Look at Toko online ping Experiences. *Journal Managing Service Quality*, *12*.

Suharso, P. (2014). Model Analisis Kuantitatif. *Indeks, Jakarta.*

Supriyadi, A. (2015). Efisiensi Saluran Distribusi Produk Mebel : Studi Kasus pada perusahaan mebel ukir di jepara. *Jurnal Penelitian Hasil Hutan*, *15*.

Supriyadi, C. dan. (2024). Sudah Tepatkah Penggunaan Teknologi dalam Bisnis Anda? *Majalah Marketing, 1.*

Suyanto, M. (2003). Strategi Periklanan Pada E-Commerce Perusahaan Top Dunia. *Andi Offset Yogyakarta.*

Yang, D. L., & Yang, N. (2024). Unveiling the path to employee performance excellence: visionary leadership behavior, vision commitment and organization resource support. *Leadership and Organization Development Journal*, *45*(7), 1142–1157. https://doi.org/10.1108/LODJ-05-2023-0247

Yanti, B. (2012). Journal of Customer Behaviour. *Jelajah Nusa : Tangerang.*