



Biblical Intertextual Strategies in “*The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*” —An Analysis of Presentation Forms in Contemporary Qur’anic Exegesis



Aan Andesra^{1*} & Reno Yulianda¹

¹Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia

*Corresponding author: aanandesra@gmail.com

Abstract

Cross-scriptural exegesis, a classical yet not fully normalized practice, has become central to contemporary Qur’anic studies. Seyyed Hossein Nasr et al.’s *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary* exemplifies this shift by creating intertextual dialogue across scriptures to emphasize narrative and theological continuity. This study examines how the Bible in *The Study Quran* especially regarding Qur’an 12:23–42, which covers feminine temptation and the prisoners’ dreams is presented not just narratively but through a systematic, scholarly approach. The researcher applies Julia Kristeva’s theory of intertextuality and Mikhail Bakhtin’s dialogic theory (heteroglossia and carnivalesque), using a qualitative-textual method based on library sources. The findings reveal that intertextuality in the verses encompasses narrative (Q. 12:23–35, 36–42), legal (Q. 12:25, 36), and semiotic (Q. 12:36, 41) dimensions. The intertextual models include references (Q. 12:36), explanations (Q. 12:23), comparisons (Q. 12:23, 25, 35–38, 41, 42), and critiques (Q. 12:37–40). These forms create an analytical-comparative work aligned with its dialogical purpose, while upholding the Qur’an’s hierarchical authority over the Bible within a theological framework. From a dialogic view, the multiple voices the Qur’an (proton), the exegete (neutron), and the Bible (electron) reflect a carnivalesque dynamic.

Abstrak

Fenomena tafsir lintas kitab merupakan praktik klasik yang belum sepenuhnya dinormalisasikan, tetapi kini menjadi jantung diskursus studi al-Qur’an kontemporer. Karya Seyyed Hossein Nasr dkk., *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, merefleksikan pergeseran ini dengan membangun dialog intertekstual lintas kitab guna menyoroti kesinambungan naratif dan teologis. Penelitian ini bertujuan menelaah bagaimana Bibel dalam *The Study Quran*, khususnya pada QS. Yūsuf: 23–42 yang berkaitan dengan kisah godaan perempuan dan tafsir mimpi narapidana tidak sekadar dikutip secara naratif, tetapi dihadirkan melalui strategi ilmiah yang sistematis. Dalam konteks ini, peneliti menggunakan teori intertekstualitas Julia Kristeva (intrinsik) dan teori dialogis Mikhail Bakhtin (heteroglossia dan carnivalesque). Adapun metode yang digunakan ialah kualitatif-tekstual dengan memanfaatkan sumber-sumber kepustakaan. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa ragam bentuk interteks terkait tema ayat memuat kisah (QS. Yūsuf: 23-35 dan 36-42), hukum (QS. Yūsuf: 25 dan 36), dan semiotik (QS. Yūsuf: 36 dan 41). Terkait model intertekstual memuat rujukan (QS. Yūsuf: 36), penjelasan (QS. Yūsuf: 23), perbandingan (QS. Yūsuf: 23, 25, 35, 36, 37, 38, 41, dan 42), dan kritik (QS. Yūsuf: 37-40). Ragam bentuk interteks tersebut menjadikannya sebagai bentuk yang bersifat analitis-komparatif, hal ini senada dengan tujuan pengaplikasian dalam rangka membangun dialog, walau dalam konsep teologi tetap memuat hirarki otentisitas al-Qur’ān dibanding Bibel. Jika dilihat dalamacamata dialogis menunjukkan keberagaman bentuk suara proton (al-Qur’ān), suara neutron (mufasir), dan suara elektron (Bibel) dapat menggambarkan karnivalistik.

Keywords:

Inter-scriptural exegesis; *The Study Quran*; intertextuality; dialogism; Bible; comparative interpretation

Kata kunci:

Tafsir lintas kitab; *The Study Quran*; intertekstualitas; dialogisme; Alkitab; penafsiran komparatif

Article History:

Received: 11-08-2025 | Revised: 16-09-2025, 21-10-2025 | Accepted: 23-10-2025



Introduction

The study of intertextuality within Quranic textual analysis has garnered increasing attention since orientalist scholars-initiated research into tafsir studies¹. This ongoing period, characterized by more diverse and complex forms of intertextuality, has produced a range of interpretive works that engage in cross-examinations of other Abrahamic traditions, particularly between the Quran and the Bible. Such approaches have been incorporated into various interpretations. Objectively, these efforts hold significance not only from a historical perspective but also in fostering dialogic and more inclusive understandings, as evidenced in the development of several tafsir works, including Tafsir al-Biqā'i² and Tafsir Qur'an³, as well as Western contributions such as *The Message of the Quran*⁴ and *Quran: A Reformist Translation*⁵. The incorporation of Biblical references in tafsir studies, when considered within the broader historical development of tafsir, has been extensively practiced by Muslim scholars (mufasssirs). Historical records indicate that as early as the first and second centuries Hijri, Biblical references began to be integrated into the Muslim scholarly tradition.⁶

Initially, this approach was met with skepticism by early mufasssirs, as the theological nature of tafsir rendered cross-textual studies between sacred scriptures susceptible to polemics and concerns regarding doctrinal conflicts⁷. A primary source of controversy in its early application was the autonomous authority of the Quran as a revealed text, which was often regarded as possessing the same hierarchical status as other sacred texts and subjected to historical-critical analysis⁸. Various perspectives on the use of intertextuality—commonly referred to as *isrā'iliyyāt*—in Quranic tafsir have predominantly resulted in the rejection of its application. Ibn Taimiyyah addressed this debate by proposing three classifications⁹. When employed within the parameters of Islamic law, the use of intertextual *isrā'iliyyāt* in Quranic interpretation is considered acceptable. Nevertheless, debates concerning its legitimacy continue into the contemporary period, shaped by both intellectual traditions and contextual factors. One notable contemporary work exemplifying this application is *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, edited by Seyyed Hossein Nasr and his team—Caner K.

¹ In Western Islamic scholarship, Qur'anic exegesis has received limited attention despite its extensive literature. Professor Gatje's work represents a renewed effort to explore the diverse interpretive traditions of Muslims across different historical and intellectual contexts. See, Issa J. Boullata, "Book Reviews of The Qur'an and Its Exegesis: Selected Texts with Classical and Modern Muslim Interpretations By Helmut Gatje," *The Muslim World* 67, no. 4 (1977): 308, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-1913.1977.tb03334.x>.

² Burhan al-Din Abi al-Hasan Ibrahim Ibn Umar al-Biqā'i, *Nazdm al-Durar fi Tanasub al-Ayat wa al-Suwar* (Dar al-Kitab al-Ilmiyah, 1995).

³ Zainuddin Hamidy and Fachruddin HS, *Tafsir Qur'an* (Widjaya, 1968).

⁴ Muhammad Asad, *The Message of the Qur'an* (Dar al-Andalus, 1980).

⁵ Edip Yuksel et al, *The Quran: A Reformist Translation* (Brainbow Press, 2011).

⁶ Abu Jamin Rohan, *Pembicaraan Di Sekitaran Bible Dan Qur'an Dalam Segi Isi Dan Riwayat Penulisannya* (PT Bulan Bintang, 1984), 12–13.

⁷ In the Judeo-Christian tradition, religious polemics in the Bible have been widely written about. Some scholars argue that the nature of a holy book is indeed very polemical. The term "polemical" according to Mun'im Sirry means that scriptural texts portray other religions negatively, which includes criticism of other religious communities, either explicitly or implicitly. See, Mun'im Sirry, *Polemik Kitab Suci: Tafsir Reformasi Atas Kritik al-Qur'an Terhadap Agama Lain* (PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2013), xviii–xix.

⁸ Abraham Geiger is considered the first scholar to apply a critical historical approach to the Quran, because in his dissertation entitled *as Muhammed aus den Judentum aufgenommen*, he determined that the influence of the Quran on Judaism in several ways. See, Ibn Warraq, *The Origins of Koran* (Prometheus Books, 1998), 170.

⁹ Ibn Taimiyyah, *Muqaddimah Fi Ushul al-Tafsir* (Dar al-Maktabah al-Hidayah, 1980), 100.

Dagli, Maria Massi Dakake, Joseph E. B. Lumbard, and Mohammed Rustom (hereinafter referred to as TSQ).

The author posits that the application of Biblical referentiality within the field of tafsir is grounded in a specific historical and intellectual context that informs its utilization. Historically, the study of intertextuality between the Quran and the Bible has been marked by ongoing debates and polemics between the traditionalist and orientalist schools, often framed around questions of authenticity. In the specific case of tafsir al-Qur'an al-Sab' (TSQ), the use of Biblical references reflects an emphasis on religious plurality, particularly in Western contexts such as New York, and is further influenced by contemporary circumstances that encourage such application. Nevertheless, mufasssirun (Quranic exegetes) tend to maintain certain boundaries by privileging interpretations grounded in the traditionalist perspective. This approach serves as a mediating effort, bridging the traditionalist and orientalist schools through the integration of Biblical referentiality alongside classical traditionalist tafsir literature. Consequently, this balanced methodology holds significant academic value in the modern era.

Studies concerning the intertextual presence of the Bible within the field of tafsir—including the work TSQ—have predominantly approached the subject from specific perspectives. First, some research focuses on the intertextual products of scholars who incorporate the Bible in tafsir, exemplified by the works of Lenni Lestari¹⁰, Sikha Amalia¹¹, and Muhammad Azka Fazaka Rifah¹². Second, other studies consider TSQ itself as the primary object of analysis, as seen in the research of Khumaerah Luluk¹³, Zikri Riza¹⁴, and Mukhammad Hubbab Nauval¹⁵. However, scholarly attention to the examination of biblical intertexts within tafsir—particularly in relation to TSQ—remains limited, especially regarding the specific modes of biblical presentation in tafsir texts. This study aims to address this gap by conducting an atomistic analysis of the forms in which the Bible is presented within an interpretive work. Such an approach reflects a sensitivity to the perspective that the intertextual engagement with the Bible in tafsir not only holds historical significance but also performs a vital dialogical function, thereby expanding interpretive horizons and fostering a more inclusive understanding.

This study employs a qualitative-textual methodology through library research, which emphasizes the examination of written sources¹⁶. The data utilized in this research are categorized into two types: primary and secondary. The primary data consist of *The Study Qur'an: A New Translation and Commentary* by Seyyed Hossein Nasr and his team, with the

¹⁰ Lenni Lestari, 'Abraham Geiger dan Kajian Al-Qur'an: Telaah Metodologi atas Buku Judaism and Islam', *Jurnal Suhuf* 7, no. 1 (2014): 41–60.

¹¹ Sikha Amalia Sandia Pitaloka, 'Bibel Sebagai Sumber Tafsir: Telaah Tafsir The Message of The Quran' (masters, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2023), <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/58304/>.

¹² M. Azka Fazaka Rifah, 'Alkitab Sebagai Sumber Tafsir: Ibrahim bin 'Umar al-Biqā' dan Tafsir Perintah Penyembelihan Anak Ibrahim dalam Q.S. al-Saffat [37]: 99-113' (masters, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2023), <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/64060/>.

¹³ Khumaerah Luluk, 'Hermeneutika Tradisional Sayyed Hossein Nasr Dalam The Study Quran A New Translation and Commentary' (other, IAIN Salatiga, 2019), <http://e-repository.perpus.iainsalatiga.ac.id/>.

¹⁴ Zikri Riza, 'Corak Tafsir Esoterik dalam The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary (2015) Karya Seyyed Hossein Nasr et.al.' (master Thesis, Pascasarjana UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2022), <https://repository.uinjkt.ac.id/dspace/handle/123456789/60081>.

¹⁵ M. Hubbab Nauval, 'Neo-Tradisionalisme Sayyed Hossein Nasr dan Implikasinya Terhadap Penafsiran Ayat-ayat Ethico-Legal (Studi atas Buku The Study Quran A New Translation and Commentary)' (skripsi, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2021), <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/45317/>.

¹⁶ Mestika Zed, *Metode Penelitian Kepustakaan* (Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 2008), 1.

objective of elucidating the intertextual presence of the Bible within the interpretation of the Qur'an. Specifically, the analysis focuses on verses from QS. Yūsuf (12): 23-42, which pertain to the themes of female temptation and the interpretation of prisoners' dreams. Secondary data are derived from various written materials, including books, journals, and research reports relevant to the study's thematic focus. The data collection and analysis integrate Julia Kristeva's theory of intertextuality (intrinsic) to examine the internal manifestations of the Bible, alongside Mikhail Bakhtin's theory of dialogism (heteroglossia and carnivalesque) to trace the dynamic interplay of voices within *The Study Qur'an*. This dual theoretical framework not only foregrounds the biblical text but also facilitates a dialogic engagement across scriptural traditions. Two principal research questions guide this inquiry: first, what editorial strategies does *The Study Qur'an* employ in incorporating biblical narratives into Qur'anic exegesis? Second, does the biblical voice function authoritatively or dialogically within this tafsir? Addressing these questions is essential to demonstrate that the Bible's presence in *The Study Qur'an* is not merely narrative quotation but is strategically integrated within a scholarly interpretive framework.

Results and Discussion

Sayyed Hossein Nasr and The Study Quran: a New Translation and Commentary

Seyyed Hossein Nasr was born in Tehran, Iran, on April 7, 1933, into a distinguished and educated family. His father was among the first educators to study Persian poetry and ethical teachings, including the verses of Sa'di and Hafez, as well as philosophy¹⁷. Nasr commenced his formal education in Tehran, focusing on traditional disciplines such as philosophy, kalam, fiqh, and Sufism. He subsequently continued his studies in Qum under 'Allāmah Ṭabāṭabā'i, concentrating on philosophy, theology, and Qur'anic memorization. At the age of twelve, he relocated to the United States and attended The Peddie School in New Jersey (1945–1949), where he studied science and Western culture. He then pursued physics and theoretical mathematics at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), earning a Bachelor of Science degree with distinction in 1954. Nasr further advanced his academic career at Harvard University, obtaining a Master of Science degree in 1956 and completing his Ph.D. in 1958. His doctoral dissertation, entitled *Conception of Nature in Islamic Thought and Methods Used for Its Study by the Ikhwān al-Ṣafā, al-Bīrūnī, and Ibn Sīnā*, was subsequently published in 1964 as *An Introduction to Islamic Cosmological Doctrines*¹⁸. Throughout his career, Nasr has authored numerous significant works addressing esoteric traditions, Sufism, philosophy, and science, in addition to contributing to the translation and interpretation of the Qur'an, serving as editor-in-chief of *The Study Quran* (TSQ).

TSQ project has a documented history of development beginning in 2006, precisely nine years prior to its publication. The publisher, HarperOne (formerly HarpenSanFrancisco), initiated the project by inviting Seyyed Hossein Nasr to serve as editor-in-chief, tasking him with leading the writing and research efforts. This initiative was conceived as a special project intended to complement Nasr's earlier work, *The HarperCollins Study Bible*¹⁹. During the

¹⁷ Aan Rumana, *Seyyed Hossein Nasr* (Dian Rakyat, 2013), 13.

¹⁸ Hery Sucipto, *Ensiklopedi Tokoh Islam: Dari Abu Bakr Sampai Nasr Dan Qardhawi* (Mizan, 2003), 323.

¹⁹ Seyyed Hossein Nasr et al., *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary* (Harper One, 2015), xl.

course of this extensive undertaking, Nasr assembled a team of Muslim scholars who shared his intellectual vision, spirituality, and commitment to traditionalism. This team included three general editors—Caner Karacay Dagli, Maria Massi Dakake, and Joseph Edward Barbour Lumbard—as well as assistant editor Mohammed Rustom. The primary objective of the project is to provide a comprehensive English-language interpretation of the Quran that is both accessible and relatable to a broad audience, including Muslims and non-Muslims alike. Additionally, the work addresses academic needs by offering a multidisciplinary approach to understanding the al-Qur'ān²⁰, while maintaining adherence to traditionalist interpretations within a contemporary framework. This approach aims to illuminate traditionalist perspectives within Western scholarly discourse and incorporates features such as the application of Biblical references.

Intrinsic Elements in The Study Quran: a New Translation and Commentary

Intertextual analysis serves to uncover the relational meaning between texts, particularly the Qur'an and the Bible, by tracing their integration of themes and messages. Within Qur'anic studies, this practice parallels the classical concept of *isrā'īliyyāt*, which emerged during the Companions' era. At that time, parallels between the Qur'an and earlier scriptures prompted some Companions to consult Jewish and Christian converts—such as Ka'b al-Aḥbār and Wahb ibn Munabbih—for broader narrative insights. Although such reports expanded interpretive understanding, the Companions maintained caution, following the Prophet's instruction neither to affirm nor to reject the traditions of *ahl al-kitāb*²¹.

The Companions approached *isrā'īliyyāt* selectively, grounding interpretation in verified historical context and avoiding inquiries into matters of doctrine or law. This cautious method distinguished historical exegesis from *isrā'īliyyāt*-based narratives. However, in the *tābi'īn* period, the use of *isrā'īliyyāt* became less regulated, with diminishing concern for authenticity or critical evaluation²². This development blurred the distinction between historical and *isrā'īliyyāt*-based interpretation, prompting scholarly debate over its legitimacy in Qur'anic exegesis. Most scholars ultimately rejected the use of *isrā'īliyyāt* as a reliable interpretive source. Ibn Taimiyyah commented on the debate by offering three forms of classification²³, where if its application is in accordance with Islamic law then the presence of *isrā'īliyyāt* in the study of interpretation is acceptable.

In looking at the Bibles presented as an interpretive reference, researchers used Julia Kristeva's theory²⁴ contained in two of her theses, namely *Word, Dialogue, and Novel*, and *the Bounded Text* contained in the book *Desire in Language: a Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*. Julia Kristeva—in her intertextual theory—understands that every text is a mosaic of

²⁰ Hossein Nasr et al., *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, xlv.

²¹ Wildan Taufiq et al., *Penafsiran Ayat-Ayat Israiliyyat dalam Al-Qur'an dan Tafsirnya*, n.d., 93–94.

²² Afrizal Nur, 'Dekonstruksi Isrā'īliyyat dalam Tafsir Al-Mishbah', *An-Nida'* 39, no. 1 (2014): 38, 1, <https://doi.org/10.24014/an-nida.v39i1.863>.

²³ Ibn Taimiyyah, *Muqaddimah Fi Ushul al-Tafsir* (Dar al-Maktabah al-Hidayah, 1980), 100.

²⁴ Born in 1941, Julia Kristeva is a key post-structuralist figure in semiotics, known for her “revolutionary semiotics” that challenges patriarchal thought through balanced masculine–feminine symbolism. Her major contributions to intertextual theory appear in *Word, Dialogue, and Novel* and *The Bounded Text*, compiled in *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*. See, Dadan Rusmana, *Filsafat Semiotika; Paradigma, Teori, Dan Metode Interpretasi Tanda Dari Semiotika Struktural Hingga Dekonstruksi Praktis* (Pustaka Setia, 2014), 319.

quotations, where each text undergoes absorption and transformation from other texts, so that a text has a relationship with other texts²⁵ his includes Qur'anic interpretive texts that undergo absorption and transformation of a *hypogram*, forming what is termed a transformation text. Intertextual theory involves both extrinsic and intrinsic analyses; the latter is evident when Biblical narratives function as dialogical counterparts to Qur'anic interpretation. In the case of QS. Yūsuf:23–42, this dialog extends beyond narrative similarity, reflecting a creative process that generates new meanings. The intrinsic intertextual forms in this context can be categorized as follows:

Verse Theme in Biblical Referential

I. Story

The classification of the story with Biblical references in *TSQ* focuses on QS. Yūsuf: 23-35 related to the phenomenon of the temptation of a woman named Zulaikha, in interpreting the verse, *TSQ* cites the Bible, especially the Book of Genesis 39: 7-20 to explicitly explain the efforts of Zulaikha in tempting Joseph²⁶. The Biblical references presented contain the main act of seduction and escape²⁷. This explains how Zulaikha who began to be interested, and seduced and forced Joseph to sleep with her, but the temptation did not shake Joseph until Joseph spontaneously fled until it gave birth to slander for not fulfilling Zulaikha's desire. The slander made Joseph end up in prison.

Furthermore, the phenomenon in which the prophet Joseph interpreted the dreams of two prisoners is explained in QS. Yūsuf: 36-42. In interpreting these verses, *TSQ* cites the Bible, especially the Book of Genesis 40: 1-3, and 6-19 to provide an overview of the interpretation of dreams (the cup bearer and the king's bread maker) of prisoners²⁸. The Bible references presented contain symbolic dreams whose meanings require interpretation²⁹. This section portrays Prophet Joseph interpreting the dreams of two imprisoned royal servants—the cupbearer and the baker. As narrated in *Genesis* 40:1-3 and 6–19, the passage describes their confinement, the revelation of their dreams, and Joseph's insightful interpretations. The cupbearer's dream signified his reinstatement to royal service, while the baker's dream foreshadowed his execution as punishment for wrongdoing against the king, reflecting a moral contrast between redemption and judgment.

Table 1:
The intertextual relationship of Joseph's story

Al-Qur'an	Bible	Commentary TSQ	Relation Intertextual
------------------	--------------	-----------------------	------------------------------

²⁵ Julia Kristeva, *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art* (Columbia University Press, 1980), 66.

²⁶ Hossein Nasr et al., *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 597–600.

²⁷ Cyril Olivia Wairisal, 'Allah Si Pahlawan Kesiangan: Menemukan Pemaknaan Baru Dalam Kejadian 39:1-23 Menggunakan Metode Seeing Through Melalui Lensa Teodisea Menurut Philip Yancey', *Wacana Teologika: Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Teologi Duta Wacana* 1, no. 1 (2024): 33–35, 1.

²⁸ Hossein Nasr et al., *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 600–602.

²⁹ Nili Shupak, 'A Fresh Look at the Dreams of the Officials and of Pharaoh in the Story of Joseph (Genesis 40–41) in the Light of Egyptian Dreams', *Journal of the Ancient Near Eastern Society* 30, no. 1 (2006): 110–12.

QS. Yūsuf (12): 23-35	Genesis 39: 7-20	Zulaikha's failed attempt to seduce Yusuf led her to falsely accuse him, a slander that ultimately caused his imprisonment.	The main actions of seduction and escape
QS. Yūsuf (12): 36-42	Genesis 40: 1-3 and 6-19	The cupbearer's dream foretells his restoration to royal service, while the baker's dream portends his death as punishment.	Symbolic dreams that have meaning and therefore require interpretation

In the classification of story, the passage illustrates TSQ's intertextual approach by linking QS. Yūsuf: 23–42 with Genesis 39–40. Through these Biblical references, TSQ contextualizes Joseph's temptation and dream interpretation within the Abrahamic narrative continuum while critically clarifying distortions in the Biblical account to affirm the Qur'an's distinct theological perspective.

2. The law

In this section, the Biblical references in TSQ contain the construct of truth (justice). In this classification, it is contained in QS. Yūsuf: 25, the verse contains the concept of sexual slander and court evidence created by Potiphar's wife, featuring an element of investigation in the form of physical evidence of the tearing of Joseph's shirt at the back. Here TSQ uses the Genesis 39: 11-19 to explicitly explain Potiphar's wife's manipulation in distorting the facts and reinforce how the decision was made based on empirical evidence, an interpretation in line with the works of al-Bayḍāwī, Maybudī, and al-Ālūsī³⁰. The phenomenon of decision-making—in the author's opinion—being based on empirical evidence in the form of torn clothes without further investigation, in Islamic fiqh itself is similar to the law of *Qaḍf*, namely accusations without evidence, and Yusuf's position as a victim of injustice.

Furthermore, Biblical references in TSQ also contain indications of law-making and justice, in this section contained in QS. Yūsuf: 36, the verse contains the concept of indications of law-making and justice. In the Islamic perspective, dream interpretation cannot be categorized as an absolute source of law, but it may be used as an indication in decision-making. On the other hand, TSQ interpreted by using the Bibel in the Book of Genesis 40: 6-8 to explain how trust arose in Joseph because of his personality so that the final conclusion was that Joseph's dreams had a very high percentage to be trusted in interpreting and making decisions. The Biblical interpretation is also supported by al-Rāzī's argument that³¹. The interpretation of dreams themselves in relation to this phenomenon—according to the author—in the perspective of the Quran has to do with God's justice in determining human destiny.

Table 2:

Intertextual relations related to the establishment of law in the story of Joseph

Al-Qur'an	Bible	Commentary TSQ	Relation Intertextual
QS. Yūsuf (12): 25	Genesis 39: 11-19	Potiphar's wife manipulated the facts and reinforced her case by presenting decisions based on empirical evidence.	The concept of sexual slander and manipulation of court evidence

³⁰ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 598.

³¹ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 600–601.

QS. Yūsuf (12): 36	Genesis 40: 6-8	The concept of trust arose in Yusuf due to his personality, leading to the conclusion that Yusuf's dreams had a very high percentage of credibility in interpreting and making decisions.	Indications of law enforcement and justice
--------------------	-----------------	---	--

In the classification of the law, TSQ employs Biblical references to frame Qur'anic notions of truth and justice. By linking QS. Yūsuf:25 and 36 with Genesis 39 and 40, TSQ highlights themes of false accusation, empirical evidence, and divine justice, aligning with classical tafsirs while reaffirming Joseph's moral integrity within a theologically grounded legal perspective.

3. Semiotics

In this section, the Biblical references in TSQ contain semiotic information in the form of wine and bread, this sign is found in QS. Yūsuf: 36 and 41, in the verse there is a symbolic wine and bread, the symbols symbolize wine as salvation and bread as death. TSQ interprets by quoting the Bibel in Genesis 40:9-11 and 16-17³² to explain the claim of the symbolic object. The interpretation of the symbols, TSQ uses the Bibles in the Book of Genesis 40: 12-13 and 18-19³³ to give an interpretation of the symbols of wine and bread as signs of salvation and death. This interpretation is also supported by classical *mufassirs* such as al-Nasafi, al-Kalbī, and Maybudī.

Table 3:

Intertextual relations related to the signs of bread and wine

Al-Qur'an	Bible	Commentary TSQ	Relation Intertextual
QS. Yūsuf (12): 36 and 41	Genesis 40: 9-11, 16-17, 12-13 and 18-19	The prisoners' dreams, including the act of squeezing grapes, symbolically revealed their future fates as interpreted by Joseph.	The symbolism of wine represents salvation, and the symbolism of bread represents death.

In the classification of semiotics, TSQ employs Biblical intertextuality to decode the semiotic symbols of wine and bread in QS. Yūsuf:36 and 41. Drawing from Genesis 40:9–19, TSQ interprets wine as a sign of deliverance and bread as a sign of death, thereby illustrating the shared symbolic framework between Qur'anic and Biblical narratives.

Intertextuality Model

1. Reference

In this classification, the form of Biblical citation used by TSQ is limited to the addition of information or textual similarities where the narratives found in the Quran also have similarities to the narratives found in the Bibles. In this classification, TSQ presents the form of citation in full with book, chapter, and verse, and is indicated by the word "see". In QS. Yūsuf: 23-42 is recorded as having a form of *reference* in QS. Yūsuf: 36 and cited twice, including the Book of Genesis 40: 9-11, and 16-17³⁴ which explains the form of dreams experienced by two prisoners when presenting their dreams to Joseph. The narrative has similarities with the Quran although it is not explicitly described.

³² Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 600–601.

³³ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 602.

³⁴ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 600–601.

Table 4:
Intertextual relations related to narrative similarities in two sacred texts

Al-Qur'an	Bible	Commentary TSQ	Relation Intertextual
QS. Yūsuf (12): 36	Genesis 40: 9-11, and 16-17	Loading a dream presentation by both inmates about squeezing grapes for a baker.	Both sacred texts share a similar narrative in describing the dreams of two prisoners that were presented to Joseph, although the Qur'an provides a general explanation while the Bible provides a detailed explanation.

In the classification of references, *TSQ* has a form of presentation that can be immediately recognized by the reader because it has clear signs. This form—in the author's opinion—emphasizes the addition of information or textual similarities where the narratives contained in the Quran also have similarities to the narratives contained in the Bibel, in this case limited to narrative similarities and does not involve polemical aspects of the meaning of the two sacred texts.

2. Explanation

The *explanation* classification contains further explanation of the intertext model in providing a deeper understanding carried out by *TSQ*. In QS. Yūsuf: 23-42, this classification is contained in QS. Yūsuf: 23, regarding the verse, *TSQ* provides a more comprehensive interpretation by quoting 4 Biblical verses, 10 traditionalist commentaries, as well as *bil qur'ān* interpretation. In *TSQ*'s interpretation before explaining the meaning of the verse, the author describes how the "lure him" aspect of the verse came about, citing Genesis 39: 7 that it was the effect of Joseph's good looks that was described as "half of beauty". This factor caused Potiphar's wife (al-Azis), Zulaikha, to fall in love and lose control of herself and her personal lust, so she dared to "lure him". This opinion is also reinforced by similarities in the thoughts of traditionalist *mufasssirs*, namely Umar Ibn Kathir, and al-Rāzī³⁵.

The temptation was rejected by Joseph on the pretext of loyalty to al-Azis because in return he had been given honor and placed in a decent residence, this opinion is supported by quoting Genesis 39: 8-10, and reinforced by the opinions of traditionalist *mufasssirs* such as al-Kalbī, al-Qurṭubī, and al-Ṭabrisī *al-Qur'ān*. Regarding the proper abode, *TSQ* uses *bil qur'ān* interpretation linked to verse 21 which is also in line with the thoughts of traditionalist *mufasssir* al-Nasafī, and Zamakhsharī³⁶, and in the phrase "and has made beautiful my accommodation"—translated by the Ministry of Religious Affairs as "He has treated me well"—where it is addressed to Allah, *TSQ* interprets it as a form of grateful praise to Allah for His enjoyment of Yusuf and automatically as a form of impropriety to betray Allah, This opinion is also supported by the traditionalist commentaries of al-Baghawī, al-Kalbī, and al-Qusyayrī³⁷.

³⁵ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 597–98.

³⁶ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 598.

³⁷ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 598.

Table 5:
Intertextual relations related to comprehensive understanding

Al-Qur'an	Bible	Commentary TSQ	Relation Intertextual
QS. Yūsuf (12): 23	Genesis 39: 7-10	The verse portrays Zulaikha's temptation driven by Yusuf's beauty, while al-'Azīz's favor toward Yusuf becomes the basis for his firm rejection.	Zulaikha's lustful pursuit of Yusuf was rejected by him out of loyalty to al-'Azīz.

In the classification of explanations, *TSQ* provides a detailed explanation that does not contradict the Quran, especially between the relationship between the Quran and the Bibel, which is presented selectively with the aim of quoting Bibel that is in line with the discussion of the verse and is supported by many traditionalist tafsir works in providing a comprehensive understanding.

3. Comparative

In this classification, the form of Bibel citation used by *TSQ* is intended to provide an overview of the same theme but in different perspectives both in the Quran and in the Bibel to compare by looking at the differences and similarities of each perspective. This classification is marked with the word "*c*" which stands for the term "*confer*" or "*compare*". In QS. Yūsuf: 23-42, there are 30 verses in the Bibel that are included in this classification. The first is related to the phenomenon of female temptation in QS. Yūsuf: 23, in relation to the verse, *TSQ* uses 4 Biblical verses³⁸ in Genesis 39:7, a comparison that *TSQ* deduces to be "*half of beauty*" which is meant to be Joseph's good looks. While the Quranic narrative is limited to words of sexual invitation, the Biblical narrative is more complex with descriptions of lustful desire and sexual invitation. In addition, both have similarities which are the effects of Joseph's good looks that caused Zulaikha to be tempted. Then it continues by interpreting in Genesis 39: 8-10, the comparison that exists in the Quranic narrative declares al-Aziz's good treatment of Joseph, while the Biblical narrative explains the form of trust of all power given by al-Aziz to Joseph except Potiphar's own wife. In addition, both have similarities that emphasize that Joseph could not betray Potiphar for everything that had been entrusted except al-Aziz's own wife.

In the next verse, there is a Biblical quote in QS. Yūsuf: 25, regarding the verse, *TSQ* uses 9 Biblical verses³⁹ in Genesis 39:11-12, the comparison is that in the Quranic narrative, Potiphar's wife pulled Joseph's shirt from behind—to prevent him from escaping—until it was torn, while in the Biblical narrative, Potiphar's wife held Joseph's shirt while making sexual advances until Joseph ran out and left his shirt in Potiphar's wife's hands (it is not clear whether she left the shirt intact or tore it). In addition, they have similarities in that Potiphar's wife grabbed Joseph's shirt to prevent him from running away. It then goes on to interpret in Genesis 39:13-19. The comparison in the Quranic narrative explains the narrative told to Potiphar for Joseph's actions that were manipulated as if Potiphar's wife was the victim with the aim of arousing Potiphar's anger, while in the Biblical narrative it is explained as a form of Potiphar's wife's declaration to the whole house for the actions taken by Joseph to Potiphar's wife with empirical evidence in the form of Joseph's

³⁸ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 597–98.

³⁹ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 598.

abandoned clothes and complaints to Potiphar in order to arouse his anger. In addition, both have similarities in the form of Potiphar's wife's manipulation as revenge for the non-fulfillment of sexual desires.

In the next verse, there is a Biblical quote in QS. Yūsuf: 35, regarding the verse, *TSQ* uses 1 Biblical verse in Genesis 39:20⁴⁰. The comparison in the Quranic narrative explains the decision to imprison Joseph for a time was a temporary measure until the rumors about what transpired between Joseph and Potiphar's wife had subsided, while the Biblical narrative explains the decision to imprison Joseph as a result of the slander of Potiphar's wife. In addition, both have similarities in the form of decision-making to imprison Joseph.

Table 6:
Comparison of the phenomenon of female temptation

No.	Sacred Text	Comparative	
		Difference	Equality
1.	QS. Yūsuf (12): 23	1. Words that constitute sexual solicitation 2. Potiphar's declaration of his good treatment of Joseph.	1. The effect of Yusuf's good looks. 2. Joseph's refusal to betray Potiphar's trust.
	Genesis 39: 7-10	1. Views on sexual desire and sexual advances 2. The form of trust in all the authority that Potiphar gave to Joseph	
2.	QS. Yūsuf (12): 25	1. Pulling Yusuf's shirt from behind until it tore 2. The narrative presented to Potiphar was manipulated to make Potiphar's wife appear to be the victim, with the aim of provoking Potiphar's anger.	1. Potiphar's wife grabbed/pulled Joseph's clothes to prevent him from running away. 2. Potiphar's wife's manipulation as revenge for her sexual desires not being fulfilled
	Genesis 39: 11-19	1. Holding Joseph's clothes while making sexual advances until Joseph ran away and left his clothes in Potiphar's wife's hands. 2. Potiphar's wife's declaration to the household with the evidence of Joseph's abandoned garment and her accusation to Potiphar to arouse his anger.	
3.	QS. Yūsuf (12): 35	The decision was made to imprison Joseph temporarily until the rumors between Joseph and Potiphar's wife subsided.	The decision to imprison Yusuf.
	Genesis 39: 20	The decision to imprison Joseph was the result of Potiphar's wife's slander.	

The second is related to the phenomenon of interpretation of prisoners' dreams in QS. Yūsuf: 36, regarding the verse, *TSQ* used 6 Biblical verses⁴¹ in Genesis 40:1-3, the comparison in the Quranic narrative is limited to the mention of two young entities in prison, while the Biblical narrative explicitly explains that the two entities are the king's wine steward and baker and that they were imprisoned for making a mistake. In addition, both have similarities that besides Joseph there are two young entities in prison. Next in Genesis 40:6-8. The comparison that exists after presenting the dreams of two entities/prisoners to Joseph in the Quranic narrative is that the two prisoners considered

⁴⁰ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 600.

⁴¹ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 601.

Joseph as a good person and asked him to interpret their dreams, while in the Biblical narrative that Joseph himself had the initiative to help interpret their dreams. In addition, both have similarities in that Joseph is believed to be able to interpret their dreams, and that trust is a sign of Joseph's good personality.

In the next verse, there is a Biblical quote in QS. Yūsuf: 37-38, in relation to the verse, *TSQ* uses 1 Biblical verse in Genesis 40:8⁴². The comparison in the Quranic narrative explains the analogy of before the food comes to show that the ability to interpret dreams can be done quickly and accurately, this shows the power of God in which Joseph is able to interpret dreams before they become actualized, while in the Biblical narrative does not mention the analogy of food, but only emphasizes that the interpretation of dreams is only the authority of God and Joseph took the initiative to ask them to present it. In addition, both have in common that the ability to interpret dreams is only the authority and knowledge of God who knows its meaning.

In the next verse, there is a Biblical quote in QS. Yūsuf: 41, regarding the verse, *TSQ* uses 4 Biblical verses⁴³ in Genesis 40:12-13 and Genesis 40:18-19. The comparison in the Quranic narrative is limited to showing the fate where the wine-servant returns to his old profession, and the baker's servant will suffer a tragic fate, while the Biblical narrative is described in detail regarding the three carang, the three baskets, delivering the carang into Pharaoh's hands and the birds eating the bread in the baskets as well as determining the future fate of the two prisoners. In addition, both have similarities in that they are products of the interpretation of the dreams that have been presented by the two prisoners.

In the next verse, there is a Biblical quote in QS. Yūsuf: 42, regarding the verse, *TSQ* uses 2 Biblical verses⁴⁴ in Genesis 40:14-15. The comparison in the Quranic narrative of Joseph's words to the wine carrier to inform his master of Joseph's condition, while in the Biblical narrative it is explained in a complex way in the form of Joseph's conversation with the wine carrier to tell Pharaoh about his entity and the reason for Joseph's unworthiness to be in prison. In addition, both have similarities regarding Joseph's words to the butler because he would survive to tell the master/king/ruler at that time about Joseph's condition.

Table 7:
Comparison of dream interpretation phenomena between two prisoners

No. Sacred Text	Comparative	
	Difference	Equality
1. QS. Yūsuf (12): 36	1. Limited to the mention of two youth entities who were sent to prison 2. Two prisoners assessed Joseph as a good person and asked him to interpret their dreams.	1. There are two other young men in prison besides Joseph. 2. Joseph was believed to be able to interpret their dreams, and that belief was a sign of
Genesis 40: 1-3 and 6-8	1. An explicit description that the two entities were the king's wine steward and baker, who were imprisoned for making a mistake.	

⁴² Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 601.

⁴³ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 602.

⁴⁴ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 602.

		2. Yusuf took the initiative to help interpret their dreams.	Joseph's good character.
2.	QS. Yūsuf (12): 37-38	There is an analogy from before the food arrived to show that the ability to interpret dreams can be done quickly and accurately.	The ability to interpret dreams is only the authority and knowledge of God, who knows their meaning.
	Genesis 40: 8	The Bible narrative does not mention food analogies, but only emphasizes that dream interpretation is God's prerogative and that Joseph took the initiative to ask them to present it.	
3.	QS. Yūsuf (12): 41	Limited to showing the fate in which the wine steward returns to his old profession, and the baker's servant will suffer a tragic fate.	Contains products from interpretations of dreams presented by two inmates.
	Genesis 40: 12-13 and 18-19	Describe in detail the symbols of the three branches, the three baskets, the delivery of the branches to Pharaoh, the birds eating the bread in the baskets, and the determination of the future fate of the two prisoners.	
4.	QS. Yūsuf (12): 42	Limited to Joseph's words to the cupbearer to inform his master about Joseph's situation.	Joseph's words to the cupbearer were because he would be saved to tell his master/king/ruler about Joseph's situation.
	Genesis 40: 14-15	Joseph's conversation with the cupbearer to tell Pharaoh about his case and the reason why Joseph was unworthy to be in prison.	

In the classification of intertextual model comparisons built by *TSQ*, the form of presentation can be immediately realized by the reader because it has clear signs. This form—according to the author—has its own value, where *TSQ* seeks to present different perspectives in both the Quran and the Bible to compare by looking at the differences and similarities from each perspective.

3. Criticism

The classification of criticism is a longer presentation of a theme that contains a narrative of contradiction between the Quranic narrative and the Biblical narrative. In *TSQ*, the classification of criticism is highlighted in a subtle way, where *TSQ* gives a form of criticism with an analytical-comparative form rather than a polemical one that may be quite difficult to recognize as a classification of criticism, regarding QS. Yūsuf: 23-42 if analyzed, the classification of criticism is contained in the phenomenon of interpretation of prisoners' dreams, especially in QS. Yūsuf: 37-40.

The verse has a theme related to the origin of dream interpretation where both in QS. Yūsuf: 37 and the Book of Genesis 40: 8 have in common that the meaning of dreams is only the authority and knowledge of Allah Swt. Particularly in the Biblical narrative, it seems that Joseph has wisdom and abilities (knowledge), as evidenced by the absence of claims that the knowledge was given specifically or as a form of revelation. Here, *TSQ*, who is an expert in the world of Sufism and spirituality, subtly criticizes that the Biblical narrative in describing Yusuf's entity is not total and perfect. The missing aspect in the Biblical narrative is completed by the Quran regarding Yusuf's prophetic mission. In QS. Yūsuf: 37-38, which does not only answer the meaning of the dreams of the two prisoners—as explained in QS. Yūsuf: 41 (which also cites Genesis 40: 12-13 and 18-19)—here Yusuf takes the time to preach tawhid, at starting with teaching about tawhid where Yusuf

emphasizes that *he* has abandoned the teachings of the Egyptian people who worship idols, this opinion is reinforced by the harmony of arguments al-Bayḍāwī's⁴⁵. Continuing with connecting himself (Yusuf) with previous ancestors such as Abraham, Ishaq, and Ya'qub which is a sign of connection to the teaching of monotheism of the prophetic line and emphasizes to stay away from shirk.

In QS. Yūsuf: 39-40 explains the basis of prophecy—which has already explained the importance of prophecy in verse 38—that is, the origin of divinity. The verse starts with a question regarding the best choice between multi-theism or mono-theism, here *TSQ* responds to the question that the existence of multi-theism causes disorder while mono-theism allows for order and beauty in the cosmos. This opinion is integrated with QS. al-Anbiyā: 22 and also resonates with ar-Rāzī's traditionalist tafsir product. The purpose of verse 39 is "*establishing the necessity, both logical and ontological, of God's Oneness*" by finalizing the basis of monotheism in terms of logic and belief. It continues in QS. Yūsuf: 40 draws attention to the importance and command to worship Allah, which is similar to QS. al-Isrā': 23, the worship of idol names has a position that does not have any value, this opinion is integrated with QS. al-A'rāf: 71, and an-Najm: 23, and claims that mono-theism/worship of Allah is the true religion⁴⁶. Here it is clear that in the Quranic narrative, *TSQ*'s interpretive perspective that the entity of Yusuf has more spiritual value compared to the Biblical narrative, this is evidenced by Yusuf's awareness that the origin of the ability to interpret dreams is a revelation from Allah, in contrast to the Biblical narrative which assesses this ability as a talent or knowledge, on the other hand in the Quranic narrative there is an effort in Yusuf's prophetic mission that is missing in the Biblical narrative.

Table 8:

Intertextual relations related to the Qur'an's criticism of the Bible

Al-Qur'an	Bible	Commentary TSQ	Relation Intertextual
QS. Yūsuf (12): 37-40	Genesis 40: 8	It subtly criticizes that the Qur'anic narrative describes Joseph as having more spiritual value than the biblical narrative. This is evident in Joseph's awareness that his ability to interpret dreams was a revelation from Allah SWT. in contrast to the biblical narrative, which considers this ability to be a talent or knowledge. On the other hand, the Qur'anic narrative includes Yusuf's prophetic mission, which is missing from the biblical narrative.	The origin of the meaning of dreams is only the authority and knowledge of Allah SWT, but in the Bible, the narrative that is constructed appears to be that Joseph had wisdom and ability.

In the classification of criticism, *TSQ* provides a comprehensive explanation framed within an academic window, as evidenced by the many citations of traditionalist interpretations to provide and complement more explicit explanations that are missing in the Biblical narrative. In this section, *TSQ* provides a subtle critique that is presented in an analytical-comparative form, reasoning in a non-polemical manner—in my opinion—so that the main goal of the vision and mission of this monumental project can be accepted in the West and indeed this work is

⁴⁵ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 601.

⁴⁶ Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 601–2.

intended for Muslims and non-Muslims as consumers, and still establishes a hierarchy of authenticity of the Quran higher than the Bibel.

Dialogical Referential Integration in The Study Quran: a New Translation and Commentary

In the intrinsic elements outlined in *TSQ* when presenting its application that absorbs and transforms various existing elements. In looking at the variety of elements and the form of their relationships, researchers use the theory of Mikhail Bakhtin⁴⁷ who initiated the Polyphonic or Dialogic theory described in his essay *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. This dialogic critique is inspired by concerns over the discourse of polyphonic heterogeneity and the subversive function of the carnival aspect of prose narrative. According to Mikhail Bakhtin, dialog is a product of difference and has the effect of potentially expanding the cross-cultural capacities of the *other* and the *self*. In Mikhail Bakhtin's dialogical theory, the *other* is a unitary part in forming awareness of the self, the relationship between the two builds self-awareness and is not independent, but *co-being*, this will be a consequential process so that *answerability* (responding to each other) is born⁴⁸. There are two methodologies offered by Mikhail Bakhtin, namely *heteroglossia* and *carnavalesque*. This theory is used with the aim of seeing the diversity of voices, both between the voice of the Quran, the voice of the Bibel, and the voice of traditionalist *mufassirs* in *TSQ* which reflects a dialogical and open approach.

1. *Heteroglossia*: Multivoiced Interpretation in *TSQ*

In Mikhail Bakhtin's terms, *heteroglossia* can be referred to as the *primacy of context over text*, in this genre it describes a concept in which a text contains many voices, perspectives, and influences that intersect with each other (dialog) in different language levels⁴⁹. *TSQ* contains a variety of voices, which can simply be classified into proton/positive voices (Quran), neutron/neutral voices (traditionalist *mufassirs*) and electron/negative voices (Bible).

The proton voice is the voice of God, which has a very high linguistic level, so it has historically posed a challenge to produce a narrative equivalent to the Quran but to no avail⁵⁰. It is not uncommon that to understand the content in the sound of protons requires qualified knowledge. Furthermore, the neutron voice is the voice of human thought that tries to understand the content contained in the sound of protons, because there is a very distant caste in the linguistic aspects of the sound of protons, so in the contemporary era today the production of meaning for the sound of protons is very varied⁵¹ and adapted to

⁴⁷ Mikhail M. Bakhtin (1895–1975) was a Russian theorist of materialist formalism whose ideas on post-structuralism and the novel laid the foundation for dialogism, later compiled in *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. See, Mikhail Mikhaelovic Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist (University of Texas Press, 1981), 14., Gregory Castle, *The Blackwell Guide to Literary Theory* (Blackwell Publishing, Malden), 196.

⁴⁸ Fadlil Munawwar Manshur, 'Teori Dialogisme Bakhtin dan Konsep-Konsep Metodologisnya', *SASDAYA: Gadjah Mada Journal of Humanities* 1, no. 2 (2017): 239, 2, <https://doi.org/10.22146/sasdayajournal.27785>.

⁴⁹ Mikhail Mikhaelovic Bakhtin, *Rebels and His World* (Indiana University Press, 1968), 3.

⁵⁰ The Qur'an's linguistic dimension, as emphasized in QS. al-Baqarah:23, asserts its inimitable status through the challenge to produce a comparable surah. This *i'jāz* illustrates the Qur'an's unmatched eloquence, silencing its critics—a theme reinforced in related verses such as QS. 10:38, 11:13, and 17:88. See, Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 18–19.

⁵¹ Nasr Hamid Abu Zayd, *Tekstualitas Al-Qur'an Kritik Terhadap Ulumul Qur'an*. Terjemah Khoirudin Nahdliyyin (LKis, 2001), 295–96.

the linguistics of the neutron voice. Then the electron sound is the voice of ex-god where in the *golden age* it is also the voice of god and is specific to certain communities and periods, but over time the sound has been distorted so that it loses its originality⁵².

The diversity of these voices based on *heteroglossia* can be seen that the proton voice (Quran) is the main character that has a rich linguistic level, as well as a language level with a different caste from any language, both the neutron voice (traditionalist *mufasssirs*) and the electron voice (Bibel), so that it is able to integrate messages consistently and is not distorted by erroneous interpretations.

2. Carnavalesque Intertextual Voices in TSQ

This stage is the process of dissolving the authority of the text, which is a way of behavior that treats this part of the world as belonging to all entities so that a free form of dialogue can be established, without involving hierarchy, or dogma in it, resulting in carnival behavior as a beautiful show. In the context of TSQ, it contains various characters (parties) with plural voices that show a beautiful performance. Simply put, TSQ contains voices that will be classified into proton/positive voices (Quran), neutron/neutral voices (traditionalist *mufasssirs*) and electron/negative voices (Bibel).

The proton voice is described as the voice of God, in which the Quran has an authoritative position. This voice is a means of physical form as a link between the supernatural and physical worlds contained in the form of messages⁵³, the neutron voice is described as a neutral voice where this voice has a role in translating and interpreting the meanings and messages contained in the proton voice. While the electron voice is described as the voice of ex-god where it is also the voice of god but distorted so that it loses its originality⁵⁴, a normative understanding contained in the narrative of the Quran refers to the completion of the previous holy books, namely the Torah and the Gospel, but both sacred texts have lost their entity and accurate evidence of their existence is abstract, this general perspective-for conservative Muslims-while still respecting that the Bibel as evidence of a valid religious tradition regardless of its distorted side⁵⁵. The three voices have different worlds and perspectives, in TSQ the different voices are dialogued to understand each other⁵⁶.

In the process, the proton voice is the main object that contains the content of the meaning contained in the voice of God, followed by the neutron voice—which has many variations of meaning—which is tasked with finding and producing the content of the proton voice to be accepted by the audience, in the neutron voice has its own methodology and peculiarities in finding the content of the proton voice, even including

⁵² Gabriel Said Reynold, 'Bible'. in *Medieval Islamic Civilization: An Encyclopedia*, Edited by J. W. Meri (Routledge, 2006), 107.

⁵³ Lutfiana Dwi Mayasari et al., 'God and Man In The Qur'an : Semantics Of The Qur'anic Weltanschauung : Struktur Dasar Weltanschauung Al Quran Dan Ontologis Antara Tuhan Manusia', *Fakta: Forum Aktual Ahwal Al-Syakhshiyah* 1, no. 1 (2023): 28, <https://doi.org/10.28926/fakta.v1i1.768>.

⁵⁴ Said Reynold, 'Bible'. in *Medieval Islamic Civilization: An Encyclopedia*, Edited by J. W. Meri, 107.

⁵⁵ Abdullah Saeed, *Pengantar Studi Al-Qur'an. Terjemah Shulkhah Dan Sahiron Syamsuddin* (Baitul Hikmah Press, 2016), 214.

⁵⁶ In interpreting QS. al-Mā'idah:48, Seyyed Hossein Nasr emphasizes the Qur'an as a confirmation of previous revelations, affirming their divine origin. The verse, addressing all Abrahamic traditions, highlights that each community possesses its own divinely ordained rituals and laws, unified by shared spiritual truths. It further conveys that religious plurality reflects divine wisdom intended to nurture humanity's moral and spiritual growth. See, Hossein Nasr et al, *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*, 300–301.

the electron voice to help interpret the proton voice, which in fact contains contradictory/polemical between the proton and electron voices. The process creates a beautiful show, where all voices mix and voice themselves in a dialog, the diversity of forms between the proton voice (Qur'ān), the neutron voice (traditionalist *mufassirs*), and the electron voice (Bibel) can illustrate *carnavalesque* in TSQ. This genre also contains the concept of Polyphony, where a text has different voices and is directed into a single perspective⁵⁷. TSQ contains many voices, including the proton voice (Quran), the neutron voice (traditionalist *mufassirs*), and the electron voice (Bible). Neutron voices and electron voices have an important role in constructing the composition of proton voices as the main character.

Conclusion

The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary inherently exhibits intertextuality through its incorporation of biblical references, particularly in relation to QS Yusuf: 23–42. These intertextual connections can be categorized into several classifications: (1) Narrative, which pertains to the historicity of the Prophet Yusuf and Zulaikha's temptation, supported by quotations from Genesis 39:7–20, as well as the interpretation of the prisoners' dreams, referencing Genesis 40:1–3 and 6–19; (2) Legal aspects, as seen in QS Yusuf: 25 with citations from Genesis 39:11–19, and QS Yusuf: 36 with references to Genesis 40:6–8; and (3) Semiotics, evident in QS Yusuf: 36 and 41, which include quotations from Genesis 40:9–11, 12–13, 16–17, and 18–19. Furthermore, this intertextual framework encompasses (1) Reference, exemplified in QS Yusuf: 36; (2) Explanation, as in QS Yusuf: 23; (3) Comparison, found throughout QS Yusuf: 23, 25, 35–38, 41, and 42; and (4) Criticism, particularly in QS Yusuf: 37–40.

The biblical references in TSQ primarily serve as analytical comparative texts that facilitate dialogue, illustrating the diversity of elements and relational forms through heteroglossia. This is manifested in the voices of the proton (the Qur'an), which functions as the central source of meaning; the neutron (traditional *mufassir*), representing the continuity of classical interpretation; and the electron (the Bible), acting as a historical dialogical interlocutor. Together, these three voices exemplify the concept of carnivalism, thereby producing a dynamic and engaging interpretive performance. This multiplicity of voices embodies the notion of polyphony, wherein the text incorporates diverse perspectives that converge toward a unified interpretation affirming the originality of the Qur'an. This study contributes a systematic analysis of the Bible's application within TSQ, offering an intertextual and reflective space that broadens the interpretive horizon of the verses and fosters a dialogical engagement between academic traditions. Nonetheless, the study's scope is limited to a single surah or phenomenon and does not encompass the entirety of the text. Consequently, future research should undertake a more comprehensive comparative analysis across multiple surahs or tafsir works to evaluate the potential for replicating polyphonic and dialogical models within contemporary tafsir scholarship.

⁵⁷ Andrew Robinson, *Power, Resistance and Conflict in the Contemporary World: Social Movements, Networks and Hierarchies*. (Routledge, 2009), 1.

References

- Asad, Muhammad. *The Message of the Qur'an*. Dar al-Andalus, 1980.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail Mikhaelovic. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. University of Texas Press, 1981.
- Castle, Gregory. *The Blackwell Guide to Literary Theory*. Blackwell Publishing, Malden.
- Fazaka Rif'ah, M. Azka. 'Alkitab Sebagai Sumber Tafsir: Ibrahim bin 'Umar al-Biq'a'l dan Tafsir Perintah Penyembelihan Anak Ibrahim dalam Q.S. al-Saffat [37]: 99-113'. Masters, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2023. <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/64060/>.
- Hamid Abu Zayd, Nasr. *Tekstualitas Al-Qur'an Kritik Terhadap Ulumul Qur'an*. Terjemah Khoirudin Nahdliyyin. LKiS, 2001.
- Hamidy, Zainuddin, and Fachruddin HS. *Tafsir Qur'an*. Widjaya, 1968.
- Hossein Nasr, Seyyed, Canner K. Dagli, Maria Massi Dakake, Joseph E. B. Lumbard, and Mohammad Rustom. *The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary*. Harper One, 2015.
- Ibn Umar al-Biq'a'l, Burhan al-Din Abi al-Hasan Ibrahim. *Nazdm Al-Durar Fi Tanasub al-Ayat Wa al-Suwar*. Dar al-Kitab al-Ilmiyah, 1995.
- J. Boullata, Issa. 'Book Reviews of The Qur'an and Its Exegesis: Selected Texts with Classical and Modern Muslim Interpretations By Helmut Gatje'. *The Muslim World* 67, no. 4 (1977). <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-1913.1977.tb03334.x>.
- Kristeva, Julia. *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*. Columbia University Press, 1980.
- Lestari, Lenni. 'Abraham Geiger dan Kajian Al-Qur'an: Telaah Metodologi atas Buku Judaism and Islam'. *Jurnal Suhuf* 7, no. 1 (2014): 41–60.
- Luluk, Khumaerah. 'Hermeneutika Tradisional Sayyed Hossein Nasr Dalam The Study Quran A New Translation and Commentary'. Other, IAIN Salatiga, 2019. <http://e-repository.perpus.iainsalatiga.ac.id/>.
- Manshur, Fadlil Munawwar. 'Teori Dialogisme Bakhtin dan Konsep-Konsep Metodologisnya'. *SASDAYA: Gajah Mada Journal of Humanities* 1, no. 2 (2017): 2. <https://doi.org/10.22146/sasdayajournal.27785>.
- Mayasari, Lutfiana Dwi, Aisyatul Azizah, and Amanda Carolina Dara Aprilia. 'God and Man In The Qur'an: Semantics Of The Qur'anic Weltanschauung: Struktur Dasar Weltanschauung Al Quran Dan Ontologis Antara Tuhan Manusia'. *Fakta: Forum Aktual Ahwal Al-Syakhsyah* 1, no. 1 (2023): 22–29. <https://doi.org/10.28926/fakta.v1i1.768>.
- Mikhaelovic Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Rebels and His World*. Indiana University Press, 1968.
- Nauval, M. Hubbab. 'Neo-Tradisionalisme Sayyed Hossein Nasr dan Implikasinya Terhadap Penafsiran Ayat-ayat Ethico-Legal (Studi atas Buku The Study Quran A New Translation and Commentary)'. Skripsi, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2021. <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/45317/>.

- Nur, Afrizal. 'Dekonstruksi Isra'iliyat dalam Tafsir Al-Mishbah'. *An-Nida'* 39, no. 1 (2014): 1. <https://doi.org/10.24014/an-nida.v39i1.863>.
- Riza, Zikri. 'Corak Tafsir Esoterik dalam The Study Quran: A New Translation and Commentary (2015) Karya Seyyed Hossein Nasr et.al.' masterThesis, Pascasarjana UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2022. <https://repository.uinjkt.ac.id/dspace/handle/123456789/60081>.
- Robinson, Andrew. *Power, Resistance and Conflict in the Contemporary World: Social Movements, Networks and Hierarchies*. Routledge, 2009.
- Rohan, Abu Jamin. *Pembicaraan Di Sekitaran Bible Dan Qur'an Dalam Segi Isi Dan Riwayat Penulisannya*. PT Bulan Bintang, 1984.
- Rumana, Aan. *Seyyed Hossein Nasr*. Dian Rakyat, 2013.
- Rusmana, Dadan. *Filsafat Semiotika; Paradigma, Teori, Dan Metode Interpretasi Tanda Dari Semiotika Struktural Hingga Dekonstruksi Praktis*. Pustaka Setia, 2014.
- Saeed, Abdullah. *Pengantar Studi Al-Qur'an. Terjemah Shulkhah Dan Sahiron Syamsuddin*. Baitul Hikmah Press, 2016.
- Said Reynold, Gabriel. 'Bible'. in *Medieval Islamic Civilization: An Encyclopedia*, Edited by J. W. Meri. Routledge, 2006.
- Sandia Pitaloka, Sikha Amalia. 'Bibel Sebagai Sumber Tafsir: Telaah Tafsir The Message of The Quran'. Masters, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2023. <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/58304/>.
- Shupak, Nili. 'A Fresh Look at the Dreams of the Officials and of Pharaoh in the Story of Joseph (Genesis 40–41) in the Light of Egyptian Dreams'. *Journal of the Ancient Near Eastern Society* 30, no. 1 (2006).
- Sirry, Mun'im. *Polemik Kitab Suci: Tafsir Reformasi Atas Kritik al-Qur'an Terhadap Agama Lain*. PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2013.
- Sucipto, Hery. *Ensiklopedi Tokoh Islam: Dari Abu Bakr Sampai Nasr Dan Qardhawi*. Mizan, 2003.
- Taimiyyah, Ibn. *Muqaddimah Fi Ushul Al-Tafsir*. Dar al-Maktabah al-Hidayah, 1980.
- Taufiq, Wildan, Asep Suryana, Eni Zulaiha, M Taufiq Rahman, and Asep Iwan Setiawan. *Penafsiran Ayat-Ayat Israiliyyat dalam Al-Qur'an dan Tafsirnya*. n.d.
- Wairisal, Cyril Olivia. 'Allah Si Pahlawan Kesiangan: Menemukan Pemaknaan Baru Dalam Kejadian 39:1-23 Menggunakan Metode Seeing Through Melalui Lensa Teodisea Menurut Philip Yancey'. *Wacana Teologika: Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Teologi Duta Wacana* 1, no. 1 (2024): 1.
- Warraq, Ibn. *The Origins of Koran*. Prometheus Books, 1998.
- Yuksel, Edip, Layth Saleh al-Shaiban, and Martha Schulte-Nafeh. *Quran: A Reformist Translation*. Brainbow Press, 2011.
- Zed, Mestika. *Metode Penelitian Kepustakaan*. Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 2008.