Teaching Writing of Recount Text by Using Picture and Picture Media with Cooperative Learning Model: An Experimental Study for Islamic Senior High School Students in Indonesian Context

Bukhori
bukhori@uin-suska.ac.id
Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau

Khairunnisa Fazira
Nisafazira060599@gmail.com
Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau

Abstract

This research aimed to determine whether there was a significant difference in writing ability between students taught using picture and picture media and those taught without it, within a cooperative learning model at an Islamic Senior High School in Pekanbaru, Indonesia. The study employed a quasi-experimental design with a non-equivalent control group to ensure a robust comparison between the two teaching methods. Two groups, an experimental class and a control class, were selected using cluster random sampling from the research population. Data collection was conducted through standardized writing tests, which provided a quantitative measure of the students' writing abilities before and after the intervention. The data was then analyzed using an independent sample t-test, a statistical method that compares the means of two independent groups to determine whether there is a statistically significant difference between them. The results of the analysis indicated that the use of picture and picture media within a cooperative learning model had a positive influence on students' writing abilities, particularly in recount text. Specifically, students in the experimental class, who were taught using picture and picture media, showed a marked improvement in their writing skills compared to those in the control class, who were taught without this media. This improvement highlights the effectiveness of incorporating visual aids and cooperative learning strategies in enhancing students' writing performance. Based on these findings, it is suggested that English teachers consider adopting picture and picture media within a cooperative learning framework when teaching writing, especially for recount texts.

Keywords: Picture and Picture Media, Cooperative Learning Model, Writing Ability, Recount texts.

Introduction

Writing is widely recognized as one of the most challenging language skills to master. It is an essential component for educational success, yet it remains one of the most complex skills to develop and refine (Tillema, 2012). Many students struggle to write in English. They often encounter obstacles when deciding on a topic and completing writing assignments, primarily because they run out of ideas (Virdyna, 2016). Even when students have ideas, they frequently struggle to transform these ideas into coherent and logically structured

paragraphs. This challenge highlights the intricate nature of writing, which requires not only creativity but also a firm grasp of organizational and conceptual skills.

English teachers play a crucial role in addressing these difficulties and facilitating students' development in writing. To effectively support their students, English teachers must employ appropriate strategies and methodologies that enhance students' creativity in writing. They need to assist students in understanding fundamental writing concepts and provide targeted support to help them overcome specific challenges. This involves creating an engaging and supportive learning environment, utilizing diverse instructional techniques, and offering constructive feedback to guide students through the writing process. By adopting innovative teaching approaches and fostering a positive learning atmosphere, English teachers can significantly improve students' writing abilities. They can help students generate ideas more freely, structure their thoughts coherently, and develop the confidence needed to tackle writing tasks successfully. Ultimately, the role of the English teacher is pivotal in transforming writing from a daunting task into an achievable and rewarding skill for students.

The use and selection of appropriate media are critical components of the educational process because they significantly enhance student engagement and participation in the teaching and learning environment (Anwar, 2016). Employing various media as instructional strategies can transform the learning experience, making it more dynamic and interactive. One effective strategy is the use of picture and picture media within a cooperative learning framework, which involves utilizing images as instructional tools (Wahyudi et.al., 2021).

Pictures serve multiple educational purposes. Firstly, they help prevent misunderstandings by enabling students to visually connect questions and concepts to the images presented. This visual association plays a crucial role in aiding students' comprehension of the material and understanding the intended meaning (French, 1983 in Sholihah, 2009). Secondly, pictures capture students' interest and attention by invoking their natural curiosity. The visual appeal of images can draw students into the lesson, making them more inclined to participate actively. Lastly, incorporating pictures into the learning process can make the experience more enjoyable and engaging for students, which can lead to better retention of information and a more positive attitude towards learning (Sarifah & Apsari, 2020).

By carefully selecting and integrating appropriate media, educators can create a more conducive learning environment that not only facilitates comprehension but also motivates and excites students. The use of picture and picture media in particular, as part of cooperative learning, exemplifies how visual tools can enhance educational outcomes. This approach not only supports the development of language skills but also fosters a collaborative and interactive classroom atmosphere, ultimately contributing to more effective and enjoyable learning experiences.

Specifically, the use of picture and picture media as a type of cooperative learning offers numerous benefits that can significantly enhance the educational process (Mulyani, Solihat, & Hanifah, 2018). This approach allows teachers to more easily assess the abilities of each student, providing a clear understanding of their individual strengths and areas for improvement. By utilizing images as instructional tools, teachers can create opportunities for students to engage in logical and systematic thinking, as they analyze and interpret the

visual content presented. Moreover, picture and picture media encourage students to consider multiple perspectives during discussions. By giving students the freedom to express their viewpoints and argue based on the images shown, this method fosters critical thinking and promotes a deeper understanding of the subject matter. This open-ended approach not only stimulates intellectual curiosity but also enhances students' ability to articulate their thoughts coherently.

Additionally, integrating picture and picture media into cooperative learning can significantly boost students' motivation to learn. The visual appeal of images captures students' interest and makes the learning process more enjoyable and engaging. As a result, students are more likely to participate actively and stay engaged throughout the lesson. Furthermore, this method involves students in classroom planning and management, creating a collaborative learning environment. By actively participating in the learning process, students develop a sense of ownership and responsibility for their education. This collaborative approach not only improves academic outcomes but also fosters important life skills such as teamwork, communication, and problem-solving. In summary, the use of picture and picture media in cooperative learning provides a multifaceted approach to education that supports individual assessment, logical and systematic thinking, critical analysis, increased motivation, and collaborative classroom management. This method represents an effective pedagogical strategy that can significantly enhance the overall learning experience for students.

Investigating the use of picture-and-picture media in the teaching and learning process has been a focus of many researchers. Studies have examined the effectiveness of this method in various educational contexts, with a substantial body of evidence supporting its benefits. For instance, Yuliastanti and Zuhdi (2014) and Hayati (2023) explored the general effectiveness of picture-and-picture media in the teaching and learning process. Meanwhile, numerous researchers have specifically focused on its application in teaching English. Notable studies by Prabowo (2022), Fauziah and Prasetyo (2022), Anggraeni (2022), Hidayatullah (2022), Wahyuni, Chamidah, and Mustofa (2021), Tarigan, Panjaitan, Simbolon, and Damani (2021), Mohibu and Ismail (2021), Sarifah and Apsari (2020), Mulyani, Solihat, and Hanifah (2018), and Naing (2018) have all demonstrated positive impacts on students' writing skills. In addition, the effectiveness of picture-and-picture media has been investigated in teaching Bahasa Indonesia, as evidenced by the research of Rosidah, Humaeroh, and Setiabudi (2024). Furthermore, Putri and Taufina (2020) and Susanti and Kusmariyani (2017) examined its use in teaching science, further broadening the scope of this instructional method's applicability.

Although these studies collectively highlight the positive impact of picture-and-picture media on students' academic achievement, particularly in enhancing writing skills, they often do not focus on specific genres of text. Additionally, integrated Islamic schools (*Sekolah Islam Terpadu*) have not been prominently featured as research sites. This gap indicates a need for further investigation into the effectiveness of picture-and-picture media in teaching specific text genres, such as recount texts, within different educational contexts, including integrated Islamic schools.

Therefore, the present study aims to explore this new angle by examining the effect of picture-and-picture media on students' ability to write recount texts at an integrated Islamic senior high school in Pekanbaru, Indonesia. By focusing on a specific genre and a unique

educational setting, this research seeks to provide a deeper understanding of the applicability and benefits of picture-and-picture media in diverse teaching environments. This study will contribute valuable insights into the potential of this instructional method to enhance writing skills and overall student achievement in a broader range of contexts.

Methodology

This research design was quasi experimental with a non-equivalent control group design. It aims to examine whether there is a causal relationship between the use of picture and picture and students' writing ability of recount text. This design employs two groups comprising experimental and control group. The experimental group obtained the treatment (using picture and picture) and control group learned English without any treatment. It can be seen in the table below.

Table 1
Quasi-Experiment Design

Group	Pre-Test	Treatment	Post-Test
Experimental	X1	T	Y1
Control Class	X2	-	Y2

This experimental research was conducted at one of integrated Islamic senior high schools in Pekanbaru. Two classes of grade ten students chosen purposefully as the research sample. It is pictured in the following table.

Table 2
Sample of the Research

No	Class	Students
1	X Tahfidz	24
2	X Bilingual	23
Total		48

This study was held in eight meetings each class; one meeting pre-test, six meeting treatment, and one meeting post-test. Experimental class treated by using picture and picture strategies as a type of cooperative learning. The procedures were adopted from Mohibu and Ismail (2021) as follows:
a. The teacher conveys the competence to be achieved
b. The teacher presents the materials and must be succeed in giving motivation to some students who might still not be ready.
c. the teacher presents the material that using the pictures of activities related to recount text.
d. The teacher appoints/ invites the students to alternately install/sort into a logical sequence.
e. The teacher asks the reason/ rationale for the sequence of images.
f. The teacher starts embed the concept/ material in accordance with the competence to be achieved.
g. The teacher concludes the material.

Unlike experimental class, the control class was no specific treatment. They study similar materials (recount text) with usual teaching strategies used by the English teacher.

The test was used to measure the students' writing ability of recount text. The test consisted of pre-test given before the treatment and post-test given after doing the treatment. This research used content validity to know the validity of writing ability test. The test was validated by experts in which the test was qualified to be used in this research. In assessing and giving the score of the students' writing, there were two raters who were experts in assessing writing recount text. The score given by rater 1 was compared with the scores that given from rater 2. The average score of two raters were used as final score in this research.

Referring to the current study design, non-equivalent control group design, N-Gain score of pre-test scores and post-test score of experimental class and control class were calculated by using the following formula:

Table 3
The Formula for Calculating N-Gain Score

$$\text{N-Gain Score} = \frac{\text{Post-Test Score} - \text{Pre-Test Score}}{\text{*Ideal Score} - \text{Pre-Test Score}}$$

*Ideal score means the maximum value that can be obtained

Then, the mean of N-Gain scores (%) were categorized based on the following table.

Table 4
The Category of N-Gain Score Effectiveness

Percentage (%)	Explanation
< 40	Not effective
40-55	Less effective
56-75	Effective enough
>76	Effective

Source: Hake (1998)

Finally, N-gain scores were analyzed by using independent sample t-test which calculated by SPSS version 16.0. The researcher used independent sample t-test to compare the mean score on some continuous variable for two different groups of subjects since the data was normal distribution. It is used to examine whether there is significant difference or there is no significant difference between two groups in this study (Pallant, 2010).

To interpret the result of analysis, the researchers referred to research hypotheses. The null hypothesis (H_0) is accepted if significant value > 0.05 or there is no significant different of students writing ability of recount text between the students taught by using picture and picture media and without using picture and picture media. Alternative hypothesis (H_a) is accepted if significant value < 0.05 or there is significant different of students' writing ability of recount text between the students taught by using picture and picture media and without using picture and picture media.

Results and Discussion

The results of data analysis indicated that there was a significant difference of students' writing ability between experimental class and control class. This is shown in the table below.

Table 5
Independent Sample T-Test Analysis

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		t-test for Equality of Means					95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
		F	Sig.	T	Df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	Lower	Upper
NGain_Percent	Equal variances assumed	1.235	.272	2.179	45	.035	9.01857	4.13869	.68282	17.35433
	Equal variances not assumed			2.187	44.272	.034	9.01857	4.12332	.71002	17.32713

The table presents important statistical results regarding the comparison of students' writing abilities in recount texts between the experimental and control classes. The significance value for Levene's Test for Equality of Variances was 0.272, which is greater than the 0.05 threshold. This result indicates that the variances in N-gain percentages between the experimental and control classes were similar and homogenous. Consequently, the assumption of equal variances was met, allowing for the use of an independent sample t-test under the equal variances assumed model.

Further analysis using the independent sample t-test provided a significant (2-tailed) score of 0.035, which is less than the 0.05 threshold. This finding indicates a statistically significant difference in the writing abilities of students between the experimental class and the control class. In other words, the instructional method involving picture-and-picture media in cooperative learning had a measurable impact on improving students' writing skills in recount texts compared to the traditional teaching methods used in the control class.

The homogeneity of variances confirmed by Levene's Test ensures that the differences observed are attributable to the treatment rather than variability within the sample groups. The significant difference highlighted by the independent sample t-test underscores the effectiveness of the picture-and-picture media approach in enhancing students' writing abilities. This statistical evidence aligns with previous findings that innovative and interactive teaching methods can lead to better educational outcomes.

The different ability of writing recount text of students between experimental dan control class is reflected on mean of gain score from each group. It presents in the table 6 below.

Table 6
The group statistic of N-Gain

		Descriptives		Statistic	Std. Error
N Gain_Percent	Class Experiment	Mean		46.1188	3.12722
	Control	Mean		37.1003	2.68743

Table 6 shows the comparative analysis of the mean N-Gain scores, highlighting the differing tendencies in students' ability to write recount texts. The N-Gain score, which measures the effectiveness of instructional methods, is notably higher in the experimental class compared to the control class. Specifically, the experimental class, which utilized picture-and-picture media in a cooperative learning setting, achieved a mean N-Gain score of 46.1188 or 46%. According to the effectiveness category of N-Gain scores, this result indicates that the use of picture-and-picture media was categorized as less effective for improving students' writing ability in recount texts. In contrast, the control class, which did not use picture-and-picture media, had a mean N-Gain score of 37.1003 or 37%. This lower score suggests that traditional teaching methods without the integration of visual media and cooperative learning were not effective in enhancing students' writing abilities. The comparative data underscores a significant, albeit modest, difference in favor of the experimental class. The findings imply that while picture-and-picture media in a cooperative learning model did have a positive impact on students' writing abilities, the improvement was limited. This categorization as less effective suggests that there is room for further enhancement in the instructional approach. Factors such as the implementation duration, the complexity of the media, and the integration process might influence the overall effectiveness and should be considered for future studies.

Specifically, the effectiveness of using picture and picture in teaching writing of recount text can be described from the differences of pre-test and post-post of both experimental and control groups. The students' writing ability before and after treatment obtained from experimental class are presented in the following table.

Table 7
The Classification of Students' Pre-test and Post-test of Experimental Class

No	Categories	Score	Pre-test		Post-test	
			Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percentage
1	Very Good	80-100	-	-	7	29.1%
2	Good	66-79	-	-	17	70.9%
3	Enough	56-65	14	58.4%	-	-
4	Less	40-55	10	41.6%	-	-
5	Fail	30-39	-	-	-	-
	Total		24	100 %	24	100%

The table illustrates the diversity in students' ability to write recount texts before and after the introduction of picture-and-picture media within a cooperative learning framework. The pre-test results reveal that no students fell into the very good, good, or fail categories. Instead, 14 students (58.4%) were categorized as having enough proficiency, and 10 students (41.6%) were classified as less proficient. In stark contrast, the post-test results demonstrate a significant improvement: 7 students (29.1%) achieved a very good rating, and 17 students (70.9%) reached the good category. Notably, no students were categorized as enough, less, or failing in the post-test. This data clearly indicates a marked improvement in students' writing abilities following the implementation of picture-and-picture media in cooperative learning. The shift from no students in the very good and good categories in the pre-test to a substantial number in these categories in the post-test underscores the effectiveness of this teaching strategy. The absence of students in the less and fail categories post-treatment further highlights the positive impact of this method.

The significant enhancement in students' performance suggests that the use of visual aids and collaborative learning not only engages students more effectively but also supports the development of their writing skills. The picture-and-picture media approach appears to facilitate better idea organization, creativity, and overall writing proficiency. This method's ability to transform students' abilities from basic to advanced levels underscores its potential as a powerful tool in educational settings. Consequently, incorporating picture-and-picture media in cooperative learning environments can be considered a highly effective strategy for teaching writing, particularly in fostering significant improvements in students' recount text writing skills.

In another side, the students' writing score of pre-test and post-test of control class are presented in the table 5.

Table 8
The Classification of Students' Pre-test and Post-test of Control Class

No	Categories	Score	Pre-test		Post-test	
			Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percentage
1	Very Good	80-100	-	-	2	8.6%
2	Good	66-79	2	8.6%	19	82.4%
3	Enough	56-65	8	34.7%	2	8.6%
4	Less	40-55	13	56.4%	-	-
5	Fail	30-39	-	-	-	-
	Total		23	100 %	23	100%

The table shows the improvement in students' ability to write recount texts in the control class. The pre-test results indicate that no students fell into the very good or fail categories. Instead, 2 students (8.6%) were categorized as enough, 8 students (34.7%) as satisfactory, and 13 students (56.4%) as less proficient. In contrast, the post-test results show a noticeable shift: 2 students (8.6%) achieved a very good rating, 19 students (82.4%) reached the satisfactory category, and 2 students (8.6%) remained in the enough category. Notably, no students were categorized as less proficient or failing. This data suggests that teaching recount text writing without using picture-and-picture media in a cooperative learning model

still had a positive impact on students' writing skills. However, the method was not as effective as anticipated, considering the relatively low number of students achieving the highest proficiency levels. The absence of students in the less and fail categories in the post-test implies some degree of improvement, but the overall effectiveness of the traditional teaching method remains limited compared to more interactive and visual approaches. This highlights the potential for more innovative methods, such as picture-and-picture media, to further enhance students' writing abilities.

The findings of this research demonstrated a significant improvement in students' ability to write recount texts after being taught using the picture-and-picture media within a cooperative learning model. This positive impact highlights the effectiveness of this approach in enhancing students' writing skills. The improvement aligns with the results of numerous studies, confirming the broad applicability and benefits of picture-and-picture media in cooperative learning. For instance, Prabowo (2022) found that picture and picture method could be applied in learning materials such as narrative text, poetry, negotiation text, and recount text with different steps. In other words, picture and picture method could be applied in various learning materials and also with various learning steps. Similarly, Fauziah and Prasetyo (2022) found that there is an influence of picture and pictures model in narrative text learning on students' writing ability. This result states that there is an influence of Picture and Pictures Models in Narrative Text Learning. Anggraeni (2022) reported that the implementation of picture and picture media received positive response from the teacher and students in controlling students' activities, make students comfortable take part in online learning, and meaningful. Hidayatullah (2022) noted that picture and picture models could improve students' writing skills in writing narrative text. Wahyuni, Chamidah, and Mustofa (2021) highlighted that the use of the picture and picture strategy is effective in teaching writing. The study by Tarigan et al. (2021) supported these findings, showing that picture and picture method can improve students writing skills and classroom situation. Earlier research by Sarifah and Apsari (2020) further confirmed picture and picture could improve students' writing skill. Mulyani, Solihat, and Hanifah (2018) demonstrated that there is influence of using of picture and picture type in cooperative model of students' narration essay writing skills. Naing (2018) found that the use of Picture and Picture Model in writing activity could improve the students' writing skills in recount text exactly in making good content and organization.

This finding reinforces the concept of using picture-and-picture media within cooperative learning as a highly effective tool for teaching writing. It provides several key benefits that enhance both teaching and learning experiences. Firstly, picture-and-picture media allow teachers to easily assess the abilities of each student. By visually engaging with the material, teachers can quickly identify students' strengths and areas for improvement. Secondly, this method trains students to think logically and systematically, as they must interpret and sequence images to form coherent narratives or arguments. This structured approach fosters critical thinking and organizational skills. Additionally, picture-and-picture media help students learn to view topics from multiple perspectives. By encouraging them to argue different viewpoints based on the images presented, students develop a deeper understanding of the subject matter. This method also enhances students' learning motivation. The visual and interactive nature of picture-and-picture media captures students' interest, making learning more engaging and enjoyable. Furthermore, involving students in classroom planning and management through this media promotes a sense of ownership and responsibility in their learning process. This active participation not only improves their

engagement but also helps develop important social and collaborative skills (Mulyani, Solihat, & Hanifah, 2018).

Conclusion

The research convincingly demonstrated that integrating picture-and-picture media as part of cooperative learning is effective across various types of schools, students, and educational materials. Notably, there was a significant improvement in students' writing abilities, particularly in crafting recount texts. This was evidenced by an increase in the number of students achieving good and very good ratings compared to their abilities prior to the intervention. However, the study had some limitations, particularly a lack of student self-reflection data during the treatment phase. Collecting this information would have provided valuable insights into the students' perspectives and validated the researchers' claims that the observed improvements were indeed a result of the treatment. To address these shortcomings, future research should incorporate qualitative methods to explore the effectiveness of using picture-and-picture media in teaching writing. Employing various data collection techniques such as observations, interviews, and student journals will offer a more comprehensive understanding of the treatment's impact. This mixed-method approach will not only strengthen the validity of the findings but also provide deeper insights into how students perceive and engage with the learning process, ultimately leading to more effective educational strategies.

References

Anggraeni, A. (2022). Teaching Writing Descriptive Text Using Picture and Picture Method through Padlet Application. *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education) Volume 5, No. 4, pp. 828-836*

Anwar, C. (2016). Role Play and Show and Tell in Grade 5 Students' Speaking Skills. *EduLite: Journal of English Education, Literature, and Culture. Vol. 1 No. 1 pp. 69–77.* https://doi.org/10.30659/e.1.1.76-102

Fauziah, D., Prasetyo, A. (2022) The Effect of Picture and Pictures Model in Teaching Narrative Text. *Lingua Educationist: International Journal of Language Education. Volume 1 Number 1, p. 25-32*

Hake, R.R. (1998). Interactive-Engagement Versus Traditional Methods: A Six-ThousandStudentSurvey of Mechanics Test Data for Introductory Physics Courses. *American Journal of Physics, 66(1): 64-74*

Hayati, R. (2023). Prima, W. Model Kooperatif Tipe Picture and Picture dalam Pembelajaran. *DE_JOURNAL (Dharmas Education Journal). Vol. 4. No 2, 505-512*

Hidayatullah, M. H. (2022). Improving Students' Writing Skill in Writing Narrative Text through Picture and Picture Method. *JOEY: Journal of English Ibrahimy*, Vol. 1 No. 1, 35–41.

Mohibu, Y., & Ismail, H. (2021). The Application of the Cooperative Learning Model (Picture And Picture) to Improve the Students' Reading Skill. *Langua: Journal of Linguistics, Literature, and Language Education, 4(2), 6–17.* http://jurnal.stkipkieraha.ac.id/index.php/langua/article/view/209

Mulyani, L., Solihat, D., & Hanifah, I. (2018). The Influence of Picture and Picture Model on Indonesian Writing Skills. *Indonesian Journal of Learning and Instruction*, *1(2)*. https://doi.org/10.25134/ijli.v1i2.1488

Naing, I. R. (2018). *The Effectiveness of Picture and Picture Model in Improving the Students' Writing Skills (An Experimental Research at 8th Grade Students of SMPN 2 Pangkajene)*. Unpublished Undergraduate Thesis: Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar

Pallant, J. (2010). *SPSS Survival Manual : A Step by Step Guide to Data Analysis Using SPSS*. Sydney: George Allen & Unwin.

Prabowo, A. (2022). *The Implementation of Picture and Picture Method for Teaching Writing to Senior High School Student*. Unpublished Undergraduate Thesis. Widya Dharma University Klaten

Putri, A., & Taufina, T. (2020). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Menggunakan Model Cooperative Tipe Picture and Picture di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 4(3), 644–648. https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v4i3.415

Rosidah, L., Humaeroh, I., Setiabudi, D. I. (2024). Penerapan Model Picture and Picture untuk Meningkatkan Keaktifan Keterampilan Berbicara dalam Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Kelas III Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. *JURNAL BASICEDU Volume 8 Nomor 2 pp. 1046 – 1054*

Sarifah, N. T., & Apsari, Y. (2020). The Use of Picture and Picture Technique in Improving Student Writing Skill. *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education), Vol. 3 No. 6.* https://doi.org/10.22460/project.v3i6.p664-669

Sholihah, H. (2009). *Teaching English Vocabulary Using Pictures to the Fifth Grade Students of SDN Tugu Jebres No. 120 Surakarta*. Unpiblished Undergraduate Thesis. Surakarya: Sebelas Maret University.

Susanti, P. A., Kusmariyani, N. N. (2017). Penerapan Model Picture And Picture Berbasis Pendekatan Saintifik Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Pengetahuan IPA. *Jurnal Ilmiah Sekolah Dasar. Vol.1 No. 2. pp. 99-106*

Tarigan, N. W. P., Panjaitan, E. E., Simbolon, P., Damani, J. P. (2021). Improving Students' Writing Skills by Using Picture and Picture Method at Junior High School. *IDEAS: Journal of Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature. Volume 9, Number 2, pp. 749 – 767*

Tillema, M. (2012). *Writing in First and Second Language: Empirical Studies on Text Quality and Writing Processes*. Utrecht, Nederlands: LOT

Virdyna, N. K. (2016). Teaching Writing Skill by Using Brainwriting Strategy. *OKARA: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, *Vol. 10 No. 1* https://doi.org/10.19105/ojbs.v10i1.812

Wahyudi, G., Ramadhan, S., & Arief, D. (2021). Development of Picture and Picture Model-Based Thematic Teaching Materials in Elementary Schools. *Basicedu Journal, Vol.5 No. 2, 966-973*. https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v5i2.814

Wahyuni, S., Chamidah, D., Mustofa, B. (2021). Using the Picture and Picture Learning Strategy in Learning Writing Skill at Islamic State Junior High School 5 of Bojonegoro. *Abjadia : International Journal of Education, Vol. 6 No. 2, pp. 211-220*

Yuliastanti, D., Zuhdi, U. (2014). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Picture and Picture untuk Meningkat Hasil Belajar pada Pembelajaran Tematik di Sekolah Dasar. *JPGSD.Volume 02 Nomor 02, pp. 1-10.*