

# A Critical Study of Iskandar Zulkarnain's Thought on 'The Ahmadiyah Movement in Indonesia' from the Phenomenological Perspective of Edmund Husserl

DOI: [10.24014/an-nida.v47i1.21799](https://doi.org/10.24014/an-nida.v47i1.21799)

**Arman Budiman**

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta

Email: [armanbudiman103@gmail.com](mailto:armanbudiman103@gmail.com)

**Abstract:** Studying the Ahmadiyah movement in Indonesia through the work of Iskandar Zulkarnain, according to researchers, requires a reassessment of the figure to determine whether the history is truly discussed without any intervention from any party or the opposite. This is crucial as it will determine the historical accuracy and reveal whether Ahmadiyah has contributed to the development of Islamic scholarly studies, especially in Indonesia. The method used in this research is library research. The data collection technique relevant to this study is documentary research, which involves various literature related to the thoughts or concepts of the figure under examination. The results of this research conclude that the Ahmadiyah movement entered Indonesia with the departure of three Indonesian youths to India. These three youths were Abu Bakar Ayyub, Ahmad Nuruddin, and Zaini Dahlan, all from Padang Panjang, West Sumatra. In his research on the Ahmadiyah movement in Indonesia, Iskandar Zulkarnain truly used two tools offered by Edmund Husserl, namely *epoche* and *eidetic*. Iskandar successfully suspended his initial knowledge to obtain valid information from the Ahmadiyah community, as evidenced by Iskandar Zulkarnain's research. Many historical facts support that Ahmadiyah is appreciated by Muslim intellectuals in the homeland. Through the Islamic works written by Indonesian figures, it can be traced that there are indications that their ideas are inspired by the literature of Ahmadiyah figures, especially in the narrative of comparative religion and Christology. With this evidence, it can be concluded that Ahmadiyah's ideas are visualized in many intellectual works by Indonesian Muslim figures.

**Keywords:** Religious Research; Indonesian Ahmadiyah Movement; Iskandar Zulkarnain.

**Abstrak:** Mengkaji gerakan Ahmadiyah di Indonesia melalui karya Iskandar Zulkarnain menurut peneliti perlu adanya tinjauan ulang terhadap tokoh (peneliti), apakah benar-benar mengulas sejarah tanpa adanya intervensi dari kalangan manapun atau malah sebaliknya. Hal ini sangat penting, sebab akan menentukan kebenaran sejarah dan pengungkapan apakah Ahmadiyah memiliki kontribusi dalam perkembangan pengkajian keilmuan Islam khususnya Indonesia. Metode yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah penelitian (*library research*). Teknik pengumpulan data yang relevan dengan penelitian ini adalah studi dokumentasi, studi dokumentasi mengarah kepada berbagai macam literatur yang berhubungan dengan pemikiran atau konsep tokoh yang dikaji. Hasil dari penelitian ini menyimpulkan bahwa gerakan Ahmadiyah masuk ke Indonesia dimulai dengan berangkatnya tiga orang pemuda Indonesia ke India. Ketiga pemuda itu adalah Abu bakar Ayyub, Ahmad Nuruddin dan Zaini Dahlan, ketiganya berasal dari Sumatera Barat Padang Panjang. Dalam penelitiannya tentang gerakan Ahmadiyah di Indonesia Iskandar Zulkarnain benar-benar menggunakan dua alat yang ditawarkan oleh Edmund Husserl, baik itu *epoche* dan *eidetic*. Iskandar berhasil menanggalkan pengetahuan awalnya demi mendapatkan informasi yang valid dari jemaah Ahmadiyah, terbukti melalui riset Iskandar Zulkarnain, banyak fakta-fakta sejarah yang mendukung Ahmadiyah diminati oleh intelektual muslim tanah air. Melalui karya keislaman yang ditulis oleh tokoh asal Indonesia, dapat dilacak adanya indikasi bahwa ide karya mereka terinspirasi dari literatur milik tokoh Ahmadiyah, terutama dalam narasi perbandingan agama dan kristologi. Cukup dengan bukti ini, bahwa ide Ahmadiyah tervisualisasikan dalam banyak karya intelektual muslim asal Indonesia.

**Kata Kunci:** Penelitian Keagamaan; Gerakan Ahmadiyah Indonesia; Iskandar Zulkarnain.

## INTRODUCTION

Ahmadiyya as a religious movement was born in India at the end of the 19th century against the backdrop of the decline of Muslims residing in the country, both religious, political, economic, social, and other spheres of life, especially after the outbreak of the Indian revolution in 1857 which ended in a British victory. So, Ahmadiyya's birth country was made one of the most important British colonies in Asia.<sup>1</sup> The rise of the Ahmadiyya movement in India grew rapidly and became a new mecca in the Islamic world globally. The Islamic institutional movement's expansion mission then spread its wings to Indonesia. Regarding the Indonesian Islamic renewal movement, figures and teachers in Sumatra appeared for almost all Indonesian Islamic reformers, namely Shaykh Ahmad Khatib from Minangkabau. In contrast, it appeared in Java, including Kiai Haji Ahmad Dahlan with the Muhammadiyah organization (1912), Haji Samanhudi with his Islamic Sarekat (trade) (1911), and Haji Abdul Halim, founder of the Ulema union (1913).<sup>2</sup>

Regardless of the pros and cons regarding the Ahmadiyya doctrine initiated by Mirza Gulam Ahmad, which can be said to be liberal. In this article, the author is interested in researching Iskandar Zulkarnain's work; why Iskandar Zulkarnain? Among researchers who study Ahmadiyya, almost all the contents of the study contradict the presence of Ahmadiyah in Indonesia, in contrast to Iskandar Zulkarnain's work, which seems to defend their presence, even though he is not part of the organization, so the author is interested in seeing Iskandar Zulkarnain's attitude using the phenomenological perspective of Edmund Husserl, in theory, called epochs, Is the figure abandoning his old knowledge to achieve objective research?, from this problem the author draws several formulations of the problem as follows: What is the contribution of the Ahmadiyya movement from Iskandar Zulkarnain's research model to the Modern Islamic Movement in Indonesia? What are Iskandar Zulkarnain's most important findings on the influence of Ahmadiyah in Indonesian Islamic research? What is Edmund Husserl's Phenomenological perspective on Iskandar Zulkarnain's attitude as a researcher who is not part of the Ahmadiyya community?

Based on the above formulation of the problem, this article aims to see the contribution of the Ahmadiyah movement from Iskandar Zulkarnain's research to the modern Indonesian Islamic movement, which is free from the controversy of its teachings. Then, the author will explain the most important findings. From these findings, the author will analyze the attitude of Iskandar Zulkarnain,

---

<sup>1</sup> Iskandar Zulkarnain, *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*. (Yogyakarta: PTLKiS Printing Cemerlang, 2011). 34.

<sup>2</sup> Apriadi Richi Simamora, Abdul Hamid, and M Dian Hikmawan, "Diskriminasi Terhadap Kelompok Minoritas Jemaat Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI) Di Tangerang Selatan," *Ijd-Demos* 1, no. 1 (2020): 19-37.

whether he excluded knowledge in researching Ahmadiyya mass organizations using the lens of phenomenology Edmund Husserl, hoping that this research can provide input material and contributions to Islamic science in general and specifically Indonesian Islamic science. And, of course, it can be a foothold material, especially for those interested in writing or researching similar topics.

Furthermore, the author took several works related to Ahmadiyya, including The article written by Abdul Gaffar, which revealed that the state has committed violence against the Ahmadiyya community, either directly or indirectly, such as neglect and lack of law enforcement against people who commit violence against the Ahmadiyya Community as experienced by Ahmadiyah Muslim Lombok, and the MUI Fatwa also regulates, The Governor of East Java also appealed to the public for direct violence against the Ahmadiyya Jama'at, both in Surabaya and West Lombok, West Nusa Tenggara.<sup>3</sup> articles written by Apriadi Richi Simamora show a pattern of social practice created by anti-Ahmadiyya groups and their rulers in the structural cluster of domination, signification, and legitimacy. This social practice led to the establishment of routines that the Ahmadiyya community was unable to de-routine, so they were in a circle that made them discriminated against.<sup>4</sup>

Then, the article by Yusuf Pandam Bawono focuses on analyzing the work and actions of Djohan Effendi in his efforts to build conflict resolution among believers in Indonesia. From Djohan Effendi, we can learn that authentic faith is born from a long and continuous struggle, a tiring journey, and even potentially dragging into the abyss of atheism, as Djohan himself experienced when listening to Al-Ghazali and Ibn Rushd's debate about the immortality of nature and spiritual awakening. In a state of doubt, he was saved by Ahmadiyya theology, which combines rationality and a spiritual approach. But he did not become an Ahmadiyya.<sup>5</sup>

Abdul Mukti Ali's thesis, *The Muhammadiyah Movement: A Bibliographical Introduction*, was at McGill University, Monte Carlo, Canada, in 1957. This 209-page thesis to achieve a master's degree contains the Muhammadiyah movement. It covers the background of the emergence of the Muhammadiyah and Ahmadiyah movements and its development since the Dutch colonial period, supporting Japan until independence in 1956. In addition, it also talked about

---

<sup>3</sup> Abdul Gaffar, "Jamaah Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI) Dalam Perspektif Kekerasan Negara: Dua Kasus Dari Surabaya Jawa Timur Dan Lombok NTB," *Jurnal Sosiologi Islam* 3, no. 2 (2013): 28–50.

<sup>4</sup> Simamora, Hamid, and Hikmawan, "Diskriminasi Terhadap Kelompok Minoritas Jemaat Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI) Di Tangerang Selatan."

<sup>5</sup> Yusuf Pandam Bawono, "Djohan Effendi, Ahmadiyah Dan Pluralisme Dalam Buku Pesan-Pesan Al-Qur'an," *Jurnal An-nida'* 43, no. 2 (2019): 240–262.

Kyai Haji Ahmad Dahlan, the founder of this organization. Talking about Muhammadiyah brings up the relationship between Muhammadiyah and the one who entered Indonesia in 1924. Abdul Mukti Ali stated that Ahmadiyah Lahore has not significantly contributed to the development of modern Islamic thought in Indonesia.<sup>6</sup> The research method used by the author in this study is a type of research (*library research*). Data collection techniques relevant to this research are documentation studies, which lead to various kinds of literature related to the thoughts or concepts of the characters studied.

## DISCUSSION

### Ahmadiyah Movement in Indonesia

#### 1. Early emergence

##### a. Ahmadiyah Qodian

Ahmadiyah Qodian is known in Indonesia as Jama'at Ahmadiyah Indonesia in abbreviation (JAI). The Ahmadiyah movement first entered Indonesia through three young men from North Sumatra; the three young men were Abu Bakar Ayyub, Ahmad Nuruddin and Zaini Dahlan; they left for India on orders from the teacher,<sup>7</sup> because India had become a country that had become the centre of modern Islamic thought, not long studied in the country and then returned to Indonesia carrying Ahmadiyah doctrine. Even though the three young men originally intended to study in Egypt, at that time, the country of Pharaoh (Egypt) had long been the centre of the development of Islamic studies.

Summer had arrived in July 1923; the Ahmadiyah leader of Lahore, Maulana Muhammad Ali, pledged allegiance to the three young Indonesians: Abu Bakar Ayyub, Ahmad Nur ad-Din and Zaini Dahlan. Since officially becoming Ahmadiyah members, their lives have changed drastically. To the extent that they loved Imam Mahdi, the three young men took the initiative to make a grave pilgrimage to the founder of Ahmadiyah, Mirza Gulan Ahmad, in Qadian (his homeland). They left for Qadian at the end of 1923. They travelled by train to Batala, about 70 miles from Lahore. They had an additional 11 kilometres to travel by horse-drawn carriage from the small village of Batala to Qadian.<sup>8</sup>

When the three young men arrived in Qadian, Khalifatul Masih II, Hazrat Haji Mirza Basyiruddin Mahmud Ahmad immediately took them to

<sup>6</sup> Abdul Mukti Ali, *The Muhammadiyah Movement: A Biblio-Graphical Introduction Di Universitas McGill, Montreal, Canada* (Canada, 1957). 88.

<sup>7</sup> Zainuddin Labay el Yunusiah, *Zainuddin Labay El Yunusiah Dari Dinniyah School Padang Panjang Dan Syekh Ibrahim Musa Parabek, Ulama Terkemuka Di Bukittinggi*. (Bukittinggi, 2016). 107.

<sup>8</sup> Gaffar, "Jamaah Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI) Dalam Perspektif Kekerasan Negara: Dua Kasus Dari Surabaya Jawa Timur Dan Lombok NTB."

Bai'at. They were the first Indonesian citizens to recognize Ahmadiyah as the true teaching. With the completion of Bai'at, these three young men will eventually change the face of the Islamic community in the archipelago.

Hazrat Khalifatul Masih II Mirza Basyiruddin Mahmud Ahmad visited Europe in July 1924 and went to London to attend a religious conference. On November 24 1924, Hazrat Khalifatul Masih travelled to London before returning to Qadian, where the general public welcomed him home as usual. The Indonesian youths invited Hazrat Khalifatul Masih II and about 40 other Jamaat youths to a tea banquet on the recommendation of Maulana Abdur Rahman Jat. Ahmad Nuruddin recited verses from the Qur'an, Abdul Qoyyum recited verses from Hadhrat Masih Mau'ud as and Haji Mahmud delivered a speech in Arabic at the tea with Khalifatul Masih II. The main message of the welcome was a request made on behalf of all the youth of the archipelago, asking Hazrat Khalifatul Masih to design to visit the East, especially the Nusantara, as he had done for the West.

Since Hazrat Khalifatul Masih II could not visit Nusantara,<sup>9</sup> he was forced to send Maulana Rahmat Ali instead. Hazrat Khalifatul Masih II released Maulana Rahmat Ali and his companions on August 17, 1925, when the first flowers of autumn were about to begin falling. They travelled from Qadian to Batala, then Calcutta, and finally sailed to Indonesia. He entered Penang, continued to Sabang, and landed in Tapaktuan Aceh on October 2, 1925. Early Ahmadiyya seeds were planted at this location.

#### b. Ahmadiyah Lahore

Ahmadiyah Lahore was first recognized in Indonesia in 1924 under the name Gerakan Ahmadiyah Indonesia di Briefly (GAI)<sup>10</sup>, twelve years after the establishment of Muhammadiyah. Ahmadiyya Lahore has previously been known in Java right in the city of Yogyakarta. Information about the background of the Ahmadiyya arrival in Java is not as clearly described as the Ahmadiyya arrival in Sumatra. The arrival of two missionaries from Hindustan Maulana Ahmad and Mirza Wali Ahmad Baig there was no information from Indonesian students who were studying in Lahore, Punjab about the arrival of the two missionaries to Java. Wali Ahmad Baig said he really wanted to travel to Manila but was forced to remain in Indonesia because of lack of funds for daily needs.

According to different sources, Wali Ahmad Baig and Maulana Ahmad initially planned to travel to Indonesia for a short visit before continuing on

<sup>9</sup> Iskandar Zulkarnain, *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*.

<sup>10</sup> G.F. Pijper, *De Ahmadiyah in Indonesia in Bingkisan Budi* (Leiden: Sijthoff's Uitgevermaatschappij N.V, 1950). 45.

to China. However, two preachers of the Ahmadiyya movement in Lahore changed their plans after learning that Christianity was being spread in Java with great power and was successful both in Singapore and Java. As a result, they canceled their plans to travel to China and settle there. In addition to asking to be allowed to stay in Indonesia and send a second da'i to China as a substitute.<sup>11</sup>

The claim that Lahore-based Ahmadi preachers were brought to Indonesia specifically as missionaries was made by an Indian Muslim scholar who taught at Muhammadiyah while in Indonesia in 1927.<sup>12</sup> The Muhammadiyah group initially provided support for the Ahmadiyya Lahore entry into Yogyakarta. It is certain that Wali Ahmad once lived in Kauman, the house of Hajj Hilal, the birthplace of Muhammadiyah and the place where the majority of Islamic activities took place in Yogyakarta. Due to Wali Ahmad Baig's inability to speak English fluently, Maulana Ahmad was given the privilege of addressing the congress in Arabic.

Other reports claim that Wali Ahmad Baig introduced himself as a representative of the Ahmadiyya community from Lahore who felt compelled to promote Ahmadiyya to Lahore and the rest of the world in his speech. Ahmadiyya first united Muslims from all over the world under the banner of Islam, i.e. true Islam, and promoted the religion of Islam as one that was in harmony with global human events.

## 2. Legal Basic of Ahmadiyah Qadian and Ahmadiyah Lahore

The Ahmadiyya Jama'at Indonesia was established in 1925 and is recognized by the government of the Republic of Indonesia *cq.* Minister of Justice of the Republic of Indonesia as a legal entity. It was stated in the decree dated March 13, 1953 number JA.5/23/13. This was amended by the deed of amendment promulgated in the State Gazette Number 3 of 1989 and Supplement to the State Gazette Number 65 dated August 15, 1989, and announced in the State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia Number 22 dated March 31, 1953. The declaration of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia of March 11, 1968, regulating the right to life of all religious organizations in Indonesia for those whose Articles of Association have been formally ratified by the Minister of Justice as legal entities, attests to this recognition.

However, the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) opposed the Second Munas held in Jakarta from May 26 to June 1, 1980, due to the issuance of a fatwa which among other things stated that Ahmadiyah was an unaffiliated,

<sup>11</sup> A.K Pringgodigdo, *Sejarah Pergerakan Rakyat Indonesia*, (Jakarta: Dian Rakyat, 1980). 56.

<sup>12</sup> Deliar Noer, *Gerakan Modern Islam Indonesia 1900-1942* (Jakarta: LP3ES, 1980). 102.

heretical, and deceptive gathering. The Indonesian Ulema Council has not recognized the existence of the Qodian Ahmadiyya sect. According to the Ahmadiyya Jama'at Indonesia, the MUI's stance is contrary to Pancasila, the 1945 Constitution, other laws and regulations, as well as statements and directions from government officials including the President of the Republic of Indonesia, the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, Republic of Indonesia, and other religious figures.<sup>13</sup>

Since the first precept of Pancasila is "The One and Only God", the prohibition is considered contrary to Pancasila for this reason. The point of this precept is to affirm that anyone or anything who believes in God Almighty is guaranteed the continuity of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia. Whether the Supreme God exists inside or outside Islam, inside or outside Christianity, inside or outside Buddhism is not something decided by Pancasila. The first precepts of the Pancasila compendium cover everything.<sup>14</sup> Article 29 affirms that "the state is based on the One True Godhead" and paragraph 2 states that "the state guarantees the freedom of every citizen to profess his own religion and to worship according to his religion and belief". The statement contradicts the 1945 Constitution. Ahmadiyya was also founded on the justification of article 29 paragraph 2 which states that the right to freedom of religion is one of the human rights.

### 3. Supporting and Inhibiting Developmental Factors<sup>15</sup>

#### a. Developmental Factor

The following authors describe some of the factors supporting the development of Ahmadiyya, namely: *First*, a rational approach to Islam, one of the main projects of the Ahmadiyya Movement is that they have a desire to renew and restore the identity of Muslims by improving the mindset and attitude of understanding in practicing the teachings of Islam itself, which is in accordance with the changing times which according to Iqbal is the appearance of religious teachings according to the view of modern views. This needs to be done to counter the onslaught of Hindus, Christian missionaries, and Western civilization that is increasingly pervasive into Indian Muslim society. *Secondly*, the militancy of Ahmadiyya figures, in line with this statement. There is no doubt that the Ahmadiyya movement in Indonesia cannot be separated from Maulana Rahmat Ali for Ahmadiyah Qadian and Wali Ahmad Baig for Ahmadiyah Lahore.

<sup>13</sup> Rabbihim, "Penjelasan JAL."

<sup>14</sup> Rabbihim, "Penjelasan JAL."

<sup>15</sup> Iskandar Zulkarnain, *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*. (Yogyakarta: PTLKiS Printing Cemerlang, 2011). 36.

*Third*, the publication and translation of Ahmadiyya books. This translation activity had no small impact on Indonesian Muslims, especially young Western-educated Islamic intellectuals who were members of the Jong Islamieten Bond, the impact was based on the fact that the writings of Ahmadiyya figures published in *headless magazines*, for example, contained many Ahmadiyya teachings. *Fourth*, the government's neutral stance, the Ahmadiyah movement itself was a religious movement that was first present in Indonesia in 1924. His attitude towards jihad was considered not contrary to the policies of the Dutch colonial government. War as jihad, in the Ahmadiyya view, is no longer appropriate. The new idea is that Ahmadi should submit to and support the government to which they belong.

b. Developmental Inhibiting Factors

*First*, the controversy in the field of theology, various religious views such as prophetic issues, revelation, the death of the prophet Isa Alaihissalam, Al-Masih and Al-Mahdi which Ahmadiyah views as a view of renewal turned out to be in different values from the beliefs of the majority of Indonesian Muslims even this caused controversy and strong reactions. *Second*, the looseness of the organization, since 4 years Ahmadiyah Lahore entered Indonesia in 1928, the general management of Ahmadiyah Lahore did not stop to develop their doctrine, so that 8 months later after its emergence in Indonesia, they reissued and then became an organization incorporated under the name of the Ahmadiyah Indonesia movement Centrum Lahore, in terms of structure The first Articles of Association in 1930 did not mention articles on branches and branches even though it was formed also branches that are not based on the statutes because there are Ahmadi in that area.

*Third*, Muhammad Sabib's entry into the PKI, although the Ahmadiyya movement recognized the value of political struggle, as already mentioned, Ahmadiyya was not a political movement and did not interfere in political conflicts. Therefore, the Ahmadiyya movement will not restrict the political rights of its adherents as long as it does not conflict with the principle of the One True Godhead.<sup>16</sup>

## Iskandar Zulkarnain's Findings on the Influence of Ahmadiyah on Islamic Research in Indonesia

### 1. Academic Debate on the Ahmadiyya Movement

Iskandar Zulkarnain's research on "Religious Institutions" in his concentration on the Ahmadiyya movement in Indonesia found a

<sup>16</sup> Uwes Fatoni, "Respon Da'i Terhadap Gerakan Jemaat Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI)," *Jurnal Dakwah XV*, no. 1 (2014): 49-65.

hegemonic center of the Ahmadiyya movement in the country. That there has been a demarcation that negates the important role of Ahmadiyah as an influential organization for Islamic thought in Indonesia. Iskandar Zulkarnain presented historical facts that prove Ahmadiyah had an important portion of Indonesian Muslim intellectuals in his time.

Iskandar Zulkarnain's research also responds to the thesis of H.A Mukti Ali, former Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia entitled "*The Muhammadiyah*", along with the opinion of Deliar Noer who agreed that Ahmadiyah Lahore and Qadian have no contribution to modern Islamic thought in Indonesia, and the quantity is also small compared to other organizations.<sup>17</sup>

For Iskandar Zulkarnain the two opinions above contradict the findings of H.J. Benda and W.F Wertheim, that Ahmadiyya both Lahore and Qadian have contributed distinctive Islamic ideas through the publication of their prolifically published works, including their propagandist mission.<sup>18</sup> That young Islamic intellectuals from Indonesia in the period 1922 to 1925 were contaminated by Ahmadiyah with their distinctively liberal reasoning. The two theses of Benda and Wertheim, which contradict Mukti Ali and Deliar Noer, became academic problems in Islamic research and its development.

Responding to differences of opinion, Iskandar Zulkarnain tends to continue a thesis that is oriented towards enriching modern Islamic insights, including in Islamic studies, especially in Indonesia if examined more deeply. There is a hidden enigma and needs to be examined for coherence through authentic evidence from Indonesian intellectuals. To observe an Islamic narrative or ideas, it should be underlined that ideas are never born naked, there must be ideological legitimacy and empirical evidence that confirms the birth of an idea. And only through a written work can we visualize someone's idea.<sup>19</sup>

## 2. Collection of Ahmadiyah Literature in Lahore and Qadian that influenced Indonesian Muslim Intellectuals

Ahmadiyah Lahore and Qadian made great contributions through their books, especially the matter of comparative religion or Christology being the main reference and the first time studied by Indonesian Muslims, including:

- a. Sudewo published the book "*De Bronnen van Het Christendom*" in 1932.

<sup>17</sup> Iskandar Zulkarnain, *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*.

<sup>18</sup> Iskandar Zulkarnain, *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*.

<sup>19</sup> Iskandar Zulkarnain, *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*.

- b. Sudewo translated Basyarat Ahmad's book into Dutch entitled "*De Geboorte van Jezus in Het Licht van den Heligen Qoer'an*" which was published in Yogyakarta.
- c. M. Sadiq HA published "*Jesus In Bijbel*" and "*Jesus the Son of God?*" in 1937.
- d. Maulana Rahmat Ali also published "*The Truth of the Prophet Muhammad According to Bijbel*" and "*Nabi Jesus According to Bijbel*" in 1937.
- e. Djarwani Hadikusumo published two books namely "*Christology*" and "*Around the Old Testament and New Testament*" issued by the *Central Leadership of Muhammadiyah*.
- f. Hasbullah Bakri wrote "*Prophet Isa in the Qur'an and Prophet Muhammad in the Bible*" as well as several brochures belonging to the Islamic Broadcasting Foundation (YAPI) Surabaya, which was productive in producing good writings about Islam at that time, this brochure was almost partly driven by Qadian Ahmadiyya youth such as Sakeh A. Nahdi, it is not surprising that the content of his ideas was the aspiration of Islamic propagandists.<sup>20</sup>

If Iskandar Zulkarnain's opinion, about the movement of Islamic literature that focuses on Christology is considered not a new finding, simply because the inspiration from Christological narratives in the global scope was first introduced by Muhammad Abduh, Rashid Rida or Jamaluddin Al-Afghani. It is true that they were the ones who started, but Iskandar Zulkarnain found a special specification born from the Ahmadiyya circle, say Maulana Muhammad Ali, explicitly criticizing Christian teachings as well as books that explain the old or new testament. For him, Ahmadiyya figures also impressed as the legitimate ideological heir of Al-Shahrastani with his phenomenal book *Al-Milal wa al-Nihal* when it comes to comparative religion.

### 3. Collection of Indonesian Muslim Literature Inspired by the Ahmadiyya Movement

Indonesian Islamic intellectuals refer to many books from India, a legacy that is so biased if the influence of Ahmadiyah is buried in the history of the development of Islam in the country. Here are some findings of Iskandar Zulkarnain that prove that Muslim thinkers from Indonesia in writing their ideas cite many Ahmadiyah ideas and some even seem to plagiarize:

- a. H.O.S Tjokroaminoto in writing "*Islam and Socialism*" was inspired by Muhammad Ali's ideas. And his work "*Tarikh Agama Islam*" can be said

<sup>20</sup> Iskandar Zulkarnain, *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*.

to be the adoption of Muhammad Ali in his book "*Mohammad The Prophet*". In fact, he also translated "*The Holy Qur'an*" parts I to III, Juz Amma with the title "*Qoer'an Sutji*" and also involved Haji Agus Salim as his introduction.

- b. Moh Natsir in writing a book on "*Prayer*" his footnotes cite many sources from Maulana Muhammad Ali
- c. Agus Salim in writing "*Isra' Mi'raj*" printed by Tintamas in 1966 is a composition of the book "*The Holy Qoer'an*" by Maulana Muhammad Ali.
- d. Bachrum Rangkuti translated a book by Mirza Basyiruddin (Caliph II Ahmadiyya Qadian) entitled "*The Basis of the World Economy*" in 1949.
- e. The Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia which publishes *the Qur'an and its translations* not only cites *the book "The Holy Qur'an" by Maulana Muhammad Ali and Yusuf Ali, but also contains a copy of Mirza Basyaruddin Ahmad from his book entitled "The Introduction to the Study of the Holy Qur'an"*. The Indonesian daily, confirmed that the translation project from the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, which was divided into two teams, one each from Jakarta and Yogyakarta in the temple seemed to violate academic rules, by not including sources from Ahmadiyah Lahore or Qadian was fatal in writing ethics.
- f. Sukarno gave an appreciative statement that Ahmadiyah inspired many Islamic treasures in the modern era, not least he also made the works of Ahmadiyah figures as a reference for his learning.

Based on Iskandar Zulkarnain's findings above, many reasons for quantity or liberal doctrine that contradict Islamic teachings, such as considering Mirza Gulam Ahmad as a Prophet or considering non-Ahmadiyah as infidels, cannot dishonor the vital role of Ahmadiyah whose thoughts inspire many Muslim intellectuals in Indonesia. By opening new perspectives, this research becomes an important finding to enrich the insight of research, development and renewal in Islam, especially in Indonesia.

### **Phenomenological Review of Edmund Husserl on Iskandar Zulkarnain's Attitude**

In this discussion, the author will try to analyze the attitude of Iskandar Zulkarnain in researching Ahmadiyya community organizations using Edmund Husserl's Phenomenology. Still, before that, the author wants to introduce phenomenology briefly. Historically, it began with the zeal of scholars, such as Jacques Waardenberg, to position religion not only as a doctrine of divinity, but as a scientific study. The consequence is that the nature of scientific study must be inherent in religion itself. The two properties include empirical and rational.

Empirical is a trait based on knowledge obtained based on scientific discoveries. Usually, this empiricism clashes with social and natural sciences, so the test includes social structure and human behaviour. As for rational, it refers to the study of human behaviour by scientific discoveries. The positioning of religion as a scientific study is what makes phenomenology an approach that is believed to make a great contribution.<sup>21</sup> This is based on the early birth of phenomenology as a scientific discipline. Its main purpose is to provide a comprehensive understanding of religion as a rational activity so that it is understood as a realm of knowledge. Such a view will eliminate the assumption of outdated religion.

Based on this goal, phenomenology has the task of showing that religion needs to be reviewed with diligence and seriousness. The other side of the task of phenomenology is to contribute to understanding humanity in an affirmative and actual way. As mentioned earlier, phenomenology focuses on a rational study indicated by visible phenomena or phenomena. This correlates with the beginnings of phenomenology as a philosophical term constructed by Edmund Husserl (1859-1938). Husserl's philosophy not only reveals a phenomenon but seeks meaning behind the phenomenon. This search for meaning requires a methodological frame of mind towards existing religious phenomena. This nature of phenomenology confirms what Clive Erricker called the "evaluation of antecedents" (the approach that preceded it). Starting from a way of philosophizing, there is a spirit of building approaches that are different from others (such as theology) to the realization that phenomenology is one model of approach to religious studies.<sup>22</sup>

Related to the problem in this study, regarding Iskandar Zulkarnain's attitude as a researcher, the author wants to see if Iskandar Zulkarnain is not partial to other Islamic community organizations, in researching Ahmadiyya, the organization has always been stigmatized negatively by both writers and society. To analyze the problem, Edmund Husserl offers two tools used to understand this phenomenological model, i.e. "epoche" and "eidetic". *Epoche* is a term Husserl uses to mean suspicion or control over decision-making. The key words in understanding this *epoche* are suspicion and control.<sup>23</sup> Husserl used the term *epoche*, meaning to suspend assessing religious phenomena and truths so as not to show an attitude of participation, listening well to achieve a correct

<sup>21</sup> Johana Ruadjanna Tangirerung and Kristanto Kristanto, "Pemaknaan Ibadah Live Streaming Berdasarkan Fenomenologi Edmund Husserl," *DUNAMIS: Jurnal Teologi dan Pendidikan Kristiani* 6, no. 2 (2021): 442-460.

<sup>22</sup> Arif Wasim, "Titik Temu Islam Nusantara Berkemajuan Dalam Perspektif Fenomenologi Edmund Husserl (1859 - 1938)," *An-Nur Jurnal Studi Islam* X, no. 1 (2020): 47-72, [http://www.husserlpage.com/hus\\_](http://www.husserlpage.com/hus_).

<sup>23</sup> Edmund Husserl, *The Idea Of Phenomenologi*, (New York: Acumen, 1859), h. 40

understanding of other/external religious phenomena.<sup>24</sup> The omission of such prejudices or conjectures is not expected to affect the outcome of understanding.<sup>25</sup> Through this attitude, it will be easier for researchers to find essences related to the religious facts or phenomena studied. After a researcher uses the view of *epoche*.

Furthermore, *eidetics* gives the ability to think about the essence objectively. Eidetic will be present when the *epoche* method is used first. *Eidetic* also negates the action of *epoche*, presenting the capacity to look at phenomena objectively. Through this *eidetic*, an intuitive understanding of a phenomenon can also be defended as objective knowledge.<sup>26</sup> After the author describes two analytical tools from Edmund Husserl before entering the analysis stage, the author will reveal the fact that Iskandar Zulkarnain is not part of the Ahmadiyya followers, as evidenced when he gave a lecture for one semester to the author at one of the universities located in Yogyakarta, at least he never gave doctrine to the author and also classmates to join the organization (Ahmadiyah), for this reason the author strongly believes that Iskandar Zulkarnain was not a Kiyai or Ustaz of the Ahmadiyya group.

Then the author continues about the attitude of Iskandar Zulkarnain as an Ahmadiyya researcher; it turns out that Iskandar Zulkarnain *succeeded in applying the attitude of Epoche in conducting research; he succeeded in stripping off the organizational knowledge he professed, leaving it off in the sense of avoiding subjective research, meaning by Epoche will automatically provide truly objective research that is by the actual findings of fact, and does not raise any suspicion of any organization, Iskandar Zulkarnain wants to reveal the real historical facts. In his writings, he does not give judgment to the Ahmadiyya doctrine, which is considered liberal by the majority of Indonesian Islamic groups.*

It is proven that when a researcher practises an *epoche* attitude, he is like a newborn baby with no knowledge so this attitude will produce objective research. The author reiterates that giving birth to an objective researcher is very difficult because of the many external and internal pressures related to life. Still, it is not impossible when you want to become an independent researcher, with a note for those novice researchers who are obliged to read Edmund Husserl's work

---

<sup>24</sup> Mujiburrahman, "The Phenomenological Approach in Islamic Studies: An Overview of a Western Attempt to Understand Islam," *Muslim World* 3 (2001): 430, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-1913.2001.tb03725.x>.

<sup>25</sup> Abdul Mujib, "Pendekatan Fenomenologi Dalam Studi Islam," *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 6, no. 176 (2015).

<sup>26</sup> Fadhilah Rahmawati, "Sikap Masyarakat Arab Terhadap Perancis Pasca Kemunculan Karikatur Nabi Muhammad Saw Dalam Majalah Charlie Hebdo Edisi September Tahun 2020: Studi Fenomenologi Edmund Husserl," *JURNAL AL-AZHAR INDONESIA SERI HUMANIORA* 7, no. 1 (2022): 1.

on *epoche* and *eidetic* theory. To become an independent researcher without intervention from groups, groups or individuals. With *eidetic*, we can assess the essence objectively. *Eidetic* will be present when the *epoche* method is used first. *Eidetic* also negates the action of *epoche*, presenting the capacity to look at phenomena objectively.

Through *eidetic* is also able to provide an intuitive understanding of a phenomenon that can be defended as objective knowledge, Iskandar Zulkarnain managed to use two tools offered by Edmund Husserl, both *epoche* and *eidetic*, as evidenced in his work, Iskandar Zulkarnain wanted to express the contribution of Islamic thought from the Ahmadiyya Movement organization, he did not want to see the slightest controversy regarding the teachings of Ahmadiyah as carried out by mass organizations or communities that say that Ahmadiyah is a cult (deviant), but he succeeded in showing that Ahmadiyah contributed to contributing to Indonesian Islamic Science, as evidenced through Iskandar Zulkarnain's research, many historical facts that support Ahmadiyah are of interest to Muslim intellectuals in the country. Through Islamic works written by figures from Indonesia, indications can be traced that the idea of his work was inspired by literature belonging to Ahmadiyya figures, especially in comparative religious narratives and Christology. Suffice it with this evidence that the idea of Ahmadiyah is visualized in many intellectual works of Muslims from Indonesia.

## CONCLUSION

The beginning of the entry of Ahmadiyah teachings into Indonesia departed three young Indonesians to India. The three young men are Abu Bakar Ayyub, Ahmad Nuruddin, and Zaini Dahlan, all three from West Sumatra Padang Panjang. Leaving for India on the grounds of studying Islam, the three young men were captivated by the popularity of Ahmadi in both Lahore and Qadian. They then established their allegiance to Ahmadiyya Lahore in 1923, then in the same year these three students perfected their Ahmadiyya at the hands of Khalifatul Masih II, Hazrat Haji Mirza Basyiruddin Mahmud Ahmad (became Ahmadiyya Qadian).

Iskandar Zulkarnain successfully used two tools offered by Edmund Husserl, both *epoche* and *eidetic*, and managed to put aside his initial knowledge in order to obtain valid information from the Ahmadiyya community, as evidenced through Iskandar Zulkarnain's research, many historical facts that support Ahmadiyya are of interest to the Indonesian Muslim intellectual. Through Islamic works written by figures from Indonesia, there can be traced indications that the idea of his work was inspired by literature belonging to Ahmadiyya figures, especially in comparative religious narratives and Christology. Suffice it

with this evidence that the idea of Ahmadiyah is visualized in many works of Muslim intellectuals from Indonesia.

## REFERENCES

- A.K Pringgodigdo. *Sejarah Pergerakan Rakyat Indonesia*,. Jakarta: Dian Rakyat, 1980.
- Abdul Mujib. "Pendekatan Fenomenologi Dalam Studi Islam," *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 6, no. 176 (2015).
- Abdul Mukti Ali. *The Muhammadiyah Movement: A Biblio-Graphical Introduction Di Universitas McGill, Montreal, Canada*. Canada, 1957.
- Deliar Noer. *Gerakan Modern Islam Indonesia 1900-1942*. Jakarta: LP3ES, 1980.
- Fatoni, Uwes. "Respon Da'i Terhadap Gerakan Jemaat Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI)." *Jurnal Dakwah* XV, no. 1 (2014)
- G.F. Pijper. *De Ahmadiyah in Indonesia in Bingkisan Budi*. Leiden: Sijthoff's Uitgver-smaatschappij N.V, 1950.
- Gaffar, Abdul. "Jamaah Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI) Dalam Perspektif Kekerasan Negara: Dua Kasus Dari Surabaya Jawa Timur Dan Lombok NTB." *Jurnal Sosiologi Islam* 3, no. 2 (2013)
- Iskandar Zulkarnain. *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: PTLKiS Printing Cemerlang, 2011.
- — —. *Gerakan Ahmadiyah Di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: PTLKiS Printing Cemerlang, 2011.
- Mujiburrahman. "The Phenomenological Approach in Islamic Studies: An Overview of a Western Attempt to Understand Islam," *Muslim World* 3 (2001): 430. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-1913.2001.tb03725.x>.
- rabbihim. "Penjelasan JAI."
- Rahmawati, Fadhilah. "Sikap Masyarakat Arab Terhadap Perancis Pasca Kemunculan Karikatur Nabi Muhammad Saw Dalam Majalah Charlie Hebdo Edisi September Tahun 2020: Studi Fenomenologi Edmund Husserl." *JURNAL AL-AZHAR INDONESIA SERI HUMANIORA* 7, no. 1 (2022)
- Simamora, Apriadi Richi, Abdul Hamid, and M Dian Hikmawan. "Diskriminasi Terhadap Kelompok Minoritas Jemaat Ahmadiyah Indonesia (JAI) Di Tangerang Selatan." *Ijd-Demos* 1, no. 1 (2020)
- Tangirerung, Johana Ruadjanna, and Kristanto Kristanto. "Pemaknaan Ibadah Live Streaming Berdasarkan Fenomenologi Edmund Husserl." *DUNAMIS: Jurnal Teologi dan Pendidikan Kristiani* 6, no. 2 (2021): 442-460.
- Wasim, Arif. "Titik Temu Islam Nusantara Berkemajuan Dalam Perspektif Fenomenologi Edmund Husserl (1859 - 1938)." *An-Nur Jurnal Studi Islam* X, no. 1 (2020): 47-72. [http://www.husserlpage.com/hus\\_](http://www.husserlpage.com/hus_).

Yusuf Pandam Bawono. "Djohan Effendi, Ahmadiyah Dan Pluralisme Dalam Buku Pesan-Pesan Al-Qur'an." *Jurnal An-nida'* 43, no. 2 (2019)

Zainuddin Labay el Yunusiah. *Zainuddin Labay El Yunusiah Dari Dinniyah School Padang Panjang Dan Syekh Ibrahim Musa Parabek, Ulama Terkemuka Di Bukittinggi*. Bukittinggi, 2016.