THE UNCODIFIED HADITH
(Study on the Hadith Narration by ‘Abdullah Ibn Amru Ibn al-‘Aṣ)

Fahrizal Mahdi
Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia
fahrizal.mahdi@uinjkt.ac.id

Abstract
This article is inspired by the words of Abû Hurairah mentioning the number of hadiths Abdullah ibn ‘Amru received is more than what he acquired, considering he [Abdullah] had the luxury of writing everything he heard from Prophet Muhammad and the result of his writing has become a masterpiece called al-Ṣaḥîfah al-Ṣâdiqah. In fact, the number of the hadiths received by Abdullah which are codified are very limited, whereas the number of hadiths narrated by Abû Hurairah in the hadith books written by scholars such as al-Jawâmi’, al-Masânid, al-Sunan and others have bigger proportion. No wonder if he was known as a friend who narrated the hadiths the most. This article aims at examining the reason this could happen. As the result, it concludes the less number of hadiths Abdullah received is due to domicile factor which was not the main destination for hadith seekers and personal factor in which he spent most of his time for worship and anticipated other scholars not to narrate israiliyat. In addition, the hadiths narrated by Abû Hurairah did not all refer to the Prophet, but received from his companions.

Keywords: Hadith, Abdullah ibn ‘Amru, Codification of Hadith, Sahifah al-Sadiqah

Abstrak:
Artikel ini terinspirasi oleh perkataan Abû Hurairah yang mengatakan bahwa jumlah hadis Abdullah ibn Amru lebih banyak darinya, karena beliau [Abdullah] mendapat restu untuk menulis semua yang didengarnya dari Nabi Saw dan hasil tulisan itu menjadi karya agung yang diberi nama al-Ṣaḥîfah al-Ṣâdiqah. Namun, faktaanya jumlah hadis Abdullah yang terkodifikasi hanya sedikit, sedangkan hadis yang diriwayatkan Abû Hurairah di dalam kitab-kitab hadis yang ditulisi para ulama seperti al-Jawâmi’, al-Masânid, al-Sunan dan lainnya, jauh lebih banyak, sehingga beliau dinobatkan sebagai sahabat yang paling banyak meriwayatkan hadis Nabi Saw. Tulisan ini bermaksud untuk mengeksplorasi latar belakang kenapa hal itu bisa terjadi. Oleh karena itu, penelitian ini menyimpulkan bahwa penyebab riwayat Abdullah lebih sedikit karena faktor domisili yang bukan destinasi utama pencari hadis, faktor pribadi yang menghabiskan waktunya untuk ibadah dan antisipasi dari ulama agar tidak meriwayatkan israiliyat. Di samping itu, hadis yang diriwayatkan...
Abū Hurairah tidak semuanya bersumber dari Nabi, akan tetapi diriwayatkan melalui para sahabat.

Kata Kunci: Hadits, Abdullah ibn 'Amru, Kodifikasi Hadits, Sahifah al-Sadiqah

Introduction

The hadiths from Prophet Muhammad in the early period were recorded by his companions by memorizing (الحفظ في السدير) and writing (الحفظ في السعرين). Here, the companions memorized them more dominantly than writing them due to several factors: 1) Writing and collecting the words, actions, and interactions with Prophet Muhammad was difficult to complete during his 23 years of prophethood, 2) The number of human resources who had the ability to write the hadiths was very limited, particularly to carry out this difficult activity, so they focused on writing the Holy Qur’an as the main source which happened to experience gradual process of revelation at that time, 3) The strong tradition of memorization among the Arab community caused them to prioritize and rely on memorization rather than writing. According to Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani, there are two main reasons for not writing the hadiths during the time of the Companions and tabi’ in (followers). First, the fear of mixing up the hadiths and the Holy Qur’an caused Prophet Muhammad to forbid writing others but the Qur’an. Second, their skill of memorizing and the power of their memory and most of them could not write.

The method to record the hadiths by writing them unofficially and only for the personal interests of the writers had been carried out since the initial period by certain companions who had qualifications and got permission from Prophet Muhammad such as ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amr ibn ‘Āṣ (d. 65H), ‘Abdullah ibn Abī ‘Awfā (d. 86H), Abū Mūsā al-Asy’ārī (d. 50H), Ḥāfeer ibn ‘Abdullah al-Anṣārī (d. 78H), ‘Ali ibn Abī Ṭalīb, and others. Practically, a number of narrations mention the existence of hadith writing such as the instruction given by Prophet Muhammad to his secretary to write a letter to the king of Heraklius in Rome, the Coptic leader in Egypt, the Persian emperor, and others inviting them to embrace Islam. In addition, some companions like Ali ibn Abī Talīb, Sa’ad ibn ‘Ubadah (d. 15H), Anas ibn Malik (d. 93H), and the servant of Prophet Muhammad owned sahifah (sheet) and once showed it to him, and he said “Hadzihi ahaditsun sami’ta huwa wa katabtuhu min Rasulillah wa aradtuha’alaikh”. However, the compilation and modification of hadiths was officially made at the end of the first century by Khalīfah ‘Umar ibn ‘Abdul ‘Aziz (w.101H) by instructing Abu Bakr ibn Muhammad ibn Hazm and others to collect and write them.

---

2Mustafa al-Siba’i, al-Sunnah wa Makanatuhu fī al-Tasyrī al-Islāmī, third edition (Kairo: Dar al-Salam, 2006), 76.
In term of codification, the concerns given to hadiths are not as high as those given to the Holy Qur’an. Basically, the Qur’an was written perfectly long before Prophet Muhammad passed away, whereas the hadiths were not fully written.\(^{13}\) The Period of Life of Prophet Muhammad in his prophetic era for 23 years, both in Mecca and Medina results in many hadiths as regulations and commands to his people by interpreting the Qur’an or responding to questions about the life and religious issues faced by his companions. Here, they needed answers to the issues.\(^{14}\) In practice, the companions heard or witnessed the hadiths directly from Prophet Muhammad. In one occasion, many heard them during the pilgrimage of Wada’\(^{15}\) and in another only particular persons heard them in small amounts, such as the hadith regarding an advice delivered by the Prophet to Abdullah ibn ‘Abbas.\(^{16}\)

‘Abdullah ‘Amru ibn Al-‘As (d. 63H) was one of Prophet Muhammad’s companions, who recorded many hadiths both by memorizing (al-ḥifẓ fi al-sudur) and writing (al-hifz fi al-sutur). In term of amount, the number of hadiths recorded by ‘Abdullah has a bigger proportion exceeding the number narrated by Abu Hurairah (Radiyallah ‘Anh/May Allah be pleased with him). However, the hadith books such as al-Jawami’, al-Sunan, al-Masanid and others show the number of codified hadiths narrated by Abdullah is less compared to that received by Abu Hurairah. More importantly, the hadiths narrated by Abdullah, especially those mentioned in al-Sahifah al-Sadiqah, are direct narration from the Prophet with no intermediates and he was also granted the blessings and permission to write the hadiths, the permission which was not obtained by most companions back then. For this reason, this article attempts to examine the factors causing the number of codified narrations from Abdullah is less than those of Abu Hurairah. In addition, it also describes the significant position of al-Sahifah al-Sadiqah among other hadith books, especially those written after the early period.

The Figure of ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru

Abu ‘Abdurrahman, a tekonym given by Ibn Ma’in\(^{17}\), is better known as Abu Muhammad. He was a companion whose full name is Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ibn al-‘As ibn Wa’il ibn Hashim ibn Sa’id ibn Sahm, ibn ‘Amru ibn Husayis ibn Ka’ab ibn Lui ibn Ghalib al-Qursi al-Sahmi.\(^{18}\) He was the son of ‘Amru ibn al-‘As and Raytah bint Munabbih ibn al-Hajjah al-Sahmiyah and was born before the hijrah and named after al-As.\(^{19}\) Prophet Muhammad then changed his name into Abdullah after professing and embracing Islam and regarded his family as part of the Ahlu al-bayt (People of the House).\(^{20}\) The Prophet said: “ni’ma ahlu al-bayit ‘Abdullah, wa Abu ‘Abdullah, wa Ummu ‘Abdullah”.\(^{21}\) Imam Abu al-Zur’ah (d. 281H) in his History mentions Prophet Muhammad, Abdullah ibn ‘Amru along with others visited and showed condolences to a person who passed away. The Prophet while pointing Abdullah ibn ‘Amru asked: who is your name? He replied: my name is al-‘As. He asked again to him, “Do you have a son named al-‘As as well? Allah then said: “antum Abidullah (you are the servant of Allah). In the end, Al-As’ returned with the name given by the Prophet.\(^{22}\) Muhammad

---


\(^{14}\) Ibid.

\(^{15}\) Ahmad ibn Hanbal, Musnad, Vol. 3 (Bairut: Muassasat al-Rasalah, n.d.), 477.

\(^{16}\) Ahmad ibn Hanbal, Musnad, Vol. 4, 409-410.

\(^{17}\) A nickname starts with the word ‘ab (father) or um (mother) such as abi fulan (the father of someone) or umm fulan (the mother of someone). See: Abu ‘Abdullah Muhammad ibn Abi Bakr ibn Ayyub ibn al-Qayyim al-Jawziyah, Tahifat al-Mawjud bi Ahkam al-Mawlud, Ed. Utsman ibn Jum’ah Dumayriyah (Saudi Arabia: Dar ‘Alam al-Fawa’id, 1431 H), 199.


\(^{19}\) Al-‘Asqalani, Tahdhib al-Tahdhid, V ol. 4, 393.


\(^{21}\) Al-Imam ‘Abdurrahman ibn ‘Amru ibn ‘Abdullah ibn Safwan

Fahrizal Mahdi: The Uncodified Hadith (Study on the Hadith Narration by ‘Abdullah Ibn Amru Ibn Al-‘As)
ibn Sa’d (d. 230H) puts Abdullah ibn ‘Amru on the third tabaqah (level) under the category of al-muhajiruna wa al-ansaru mimman syahida al-khandaq wa ma ba’daha.23

‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru was a companion who had a special position besides Prophet Muhammad and preferred him to his father ‘Amru ibn al-‘As.24 Al-Imam Ibn Hajar describes him as an extraordinary figure and ‘alim (expert) who memorized the Qur’an and the previous holy revealed books. In addition, his memorization of the hadiths was so undoubtful that he was declared one of those who memorized hadiths the most. He was also considered as a companion who had the luxury of write everything he heard from Prophet Muhammad.25 He embraced Islam before his parents (‘Amru ibn al-‘As) received guidance on the 8th of hijriyah and spent his time to always worship and study. Al-Imam al-Mizi (d. 42H) says that ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru was a devout and persistent person in worship (mujtahidan fi al-Ibadah).26 This can be seen from his daily activities such fasting and performing the midnight prayers and hardly spending his time for anything else. One day, his parents came to the Prophet to complain and asked him to give advice. The Prophet then said to Abdullah ibn Amru: “there is a right for your eyes and family that you must give. Therefore, wake up and sleep or fast and break your fasting. Fast for three days each month as it is sawm al-dahr. ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru Answered, “I think I am strong enough to fast more than three days”. Finally, the Prophet said: “there is no fasting better than sawm al-daud (the fasting performed by Prophet Daud). He fasted one day and skipped another”.27 In another case, he also asked the Prophet to give him the opportunity to recite the Qur’an every day, but the Prophet only grant him to recite it every five days.28

In the scientific aspect, ‘Abdullah ibn Amru also earned superiority and a high position so that the ulama recognize the breadth and depth of his knowledge and insight by addressing him as a companion who had extensive knowledge (ghazir al-‘ilm).29 In addition, he could also speak Aramaic so he often read the books belonging to the Ahli Kitab (People of the Book) and narrated from them.30 In the hadith aspect, he showed a great attention to all of hadiths from Prophet Muhammad. He always tried his best to hear them directly from the main source, Prophet Muhammad and also narrated from other companions such as Abu Bakr al-Siddiq, ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab, ‘Amru ibn al-‘As, ‘Abdurrahman ibn ‘Awuf, Suraqah ibn Malik ibn Ju’shum and others. ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru once said: “hafitzu ‘an Rasul al-fa matsal”.31 His persistence in acquiring hadiths form the Prophet has made him become a reference and destination for other companions and tabi’in (followers) in seeking for the hadiths. Excitingly, the number of companions who associated their narrations with him is higher, such as Abu Umamah al-Bahili, Sufyan ibn ‘Awuf al-Qari’i, al-Miswar ibn Mukhramah, Abu Umamah ibn Sahal, Hanif, al-Sa’ib ibn Yazid and others. In the meantime, the tabi’in circles who narrated the hadiths from him include Sa’id ibn al-Musayyab, al-Qasim ibn Muhammad, ‘Urwah, Abu Salamah ibn Abdurrahman, Humaid ibn Abdurrahman,’Isa ibn Talhah ibn ‘Ubaidillah, Ikrimah and others.


Al-Sadiqah: Significant Work of Hadiths

The writing tradition has actually existed since the early period of Islam. Prophet Muhammad saw it as a serious problem to deal with. In this regard, he asked his companions who could read and write to teach others. He even granted an immunity deal for the prisoners of war who were willing to teach 10 children of the Ansar to read and write. Their ability to write was used to record the hadiths from the Prophet, so that works containing hadith collections have existed since the early period such as Sahifah Sa’ad ibn ‘Ubadah al-Ansari, Sahifah Abdullah ibn Abi Awfa, Sahifah Abu Musa al-Ash’ari (d. 50H), Sahifah Samrah ibn Jundub (d. 60H), Sahifah Jabir ibn Abdullah al-Ansari (d. 78H), Sahifah of the work by Abi Rafi’ mawla al-Nabi, the work of Abu Hurairah, Sahifah-Sadiqah, the work of ‘Abdullah ibn’ Amru ibn al-‘As (d. 65H) and others. In a special discussion, Mustafa Azami in his book entitled Hadits Nabawi dan Sejarah Kodifikasinya mentions the companions who wrote the hadiths, whether they directly narrated from the Prophet or obtained them from other companions, ones of whom included Abu Ayyub al-Ansari (w.52H), Abu Bakar al-Siddiq (w.13H), Abu. Rafi’ (d. 40H), Anas ibn Malik (d. 93H) and others.33

Imam Bukhari (d. 256H) illustrates four narrations on Chapter Kitabat al-‘Ilmi in his Sahih book regarding the writers of hadith such as ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Abbas (d. 68H), Abu Hurairah (d. 57H) and Abu Juhaifah Wahab ibn ‘Abdullah (d. 74H).34 One of the narrations which mention the hadith writing is the hadith narrated by Abu Juhaifah (d. 74H) who asked ‘Ali ibn Abi Talib by saying: “hal indakum kitab? (Do you have a book?) Ali replied: “la, illa kitab Allah awu fahmun u’tiyahu rajulun muslimun awu ma fi hadzihi al-sahifah”. He then asked again: “fama fi hadzihi al-sahifah?” (What’s in the sheet?) ‘Ali answered: al-‘aqlu wa fakak al-asir wa la yuqtal Muslim bi kafir.35 When explaining the hadith, Imam Ibn Hajar al-‘Asqalani (d. 852H) said the kitab means maktub (something written) from what was revealed to Prophet Muhammad. In the meantime, Imam Ali argues he has a book in the form of a fiqh book referring to the Holy Qur’an and Sahifah which contains the law and the provisions of diyat (compensation), the rule of prisoner release and la yuqtal muslim bi kafir.36

When commenting on the narration mentioned on chapter Kitabat al-‘Ilmi, Abu al-Hasan ibn Battal says the atsar (hadith) in the chapter confirms that it is permissible to write knowledge and bind it. This opinion is the most correct opinion considering the Prophet demanded his companions to write knowledge saying ukhbar li Abi fulan.37 Therefore, the Hadith writing during Muhammad’s prophethood is classified into two groups, first, the companion who wrote the hadith at the end of his life after the prohibition on writing hadith was annulled.38 Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ibn al-‘As is one of companions who received direct permission from Prophet Muhammad to write everything he heard from him. He carried out this noble work diligently as stated by Abu Qabi Yahya ibn Hani who mentioned that he heard Abdullah ibn ‘Amru said, “We are beside the Messenger of Allah to write what he said”.39 Seeing Abdullah

32Al-‘Umari, Buhuth fi Tarikh al-Sunnat al-Musharrafah, 287.
35Al-Bukhari, Sahih al-Bukhari, 40.
carrying out this activity caused the Quraysh to criticize him because, according to them, Prophet Muhammad was just a human being who sometimes spoke in various circumstances such as in a state of anger and a state of calm. However, Prophet Muhammad still asked Abdullah to write all the words he delivered. This story is told directly by Abdullah ibn 'Amru as narrated by Abu Daud in the following:

Meaning: 'Abdullah ibn 'Amru said: “I wrote everything I heard from the Messenger of Allah and memorized it. The Quraysh then forbade me to do it while saying: you wrote everything you heard from the Messenger of Allah while he spoke in a state of calm and anger. Then, I stopped writing and consulted it to him.He told me to be silent by hinting his hand to his mouth while saying: write. For the sake of my soul which is in His grasp, nothing comes out of my mouth except the truth” [H.R. Abu Dawud].

The hadiths written by 'Abdullah ibn 'Amru (d. 65H) are compiled in a single text and named after al-Sahifah al-Sadiqah. The inclusion of the word al-Sadiqah is due to the fact that the hadiths are narrated directly from Prophet Muhammad. This means they are considered as the most authentic narration. Mujahid once saw the Sahifah and asked about it. Abdullah ibn Amru answered, “This is al-Sadiqah. It contains what I’ve heard from the Messenger of Allah and no intermediary between me and him”. Therefore, this work has an important position for the author, more than his property and Abdullah ibn Amru directly said “There is nothing I want in this life except two things, al-sadiwah and al-waht. Here, al-sadiqah is the sahih that he wrote from the Messenger of Allah, whereas al-waht is a plot of land that was inherited by Amru ibn al-’As and located in the Taif area. Further, the sahih was passed on to his children and descendants, so that the most valid sanad (the chain of narrators) from Abdullah is what narrated by Amru ibn Syu‘aib from his father and grandfather.

Although the above sanad is the most valid chain according to some scholars, some others still question it. If what is meant by ‘an jaddihi (from his grandfather) refers to the closest grandfather, Muhammad, then the status of the hadith is mursal (missing links in a chain of narrators) as the grandfather did not meet the Prophet. Similarly, if the grandfather here is Abdullah, then the status of the hadith is munqati’ (the chain of narrators is broken). Therefore, when Imam Abu Daud was asked about the history of Amru ibn Shu’aib from the link of his father and grandfather, he answered that his history could not be used as evidence. According to Imam al-Dhahabi in Tarikh al-Islam, the sahih should occupy the most valid position of all things because it was written by Abdullah ibn Amru directly from Prophet Muhammad and certainly such writing...
is stronger than memorization. This opinion is strengthened by the scholars who consider Amru ibn Syu‘aib to be a tsiqah (trustworthy) so that his history could be used as evidence. Imam Ibn Taimiyah in the Majmu’ Fatawa, for example, confirms that the majority of scholars such as Malik ibn Anas, Sufyan ibn ‘Uyainah and others have made the Hujjah hadith (proof) of Amru ibn Syu‘aib from his father and grandfather as a correct transmission or chain of narrations. Here, al-jadd (grandfather) referred to in the chain is Abdullah and Prophet Muhammad met him.

Imam al-Dhahabi finds a way out regarding this controversy stating the hadiths narrated by Abdullah which are compiled in sahifah is inherited. Therefore, the partial assumption of the weakness in his hadiths from the chain of Amru ibn Syu‘aib does not include the hadith in the sahifah. However, it is unfortunate that the work in this very significant hadith field does not reach us this time, but its contents have been collected in Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal as he has compiled them in this Musnad entitled Musnad Abdullah ibn ‘Amru.

‘Abdullah’s Narrations Versus Abu Hurairah’s

Abu Muhammad ibn Hazm al-Zahiri (d. 456H) in Asma’ al-Sahabah mentions the number of the history of 999 companions, starting from the narrators with the highest number of hadiths to those who have only narrated one hadith. As for the companions who narrated the hadiths include Abu Hurairah Hurairah (Radiyallah’Anh) from the first place with a total of 5374 narrations, Abdullah ibn ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab with 2630 narrations, Anas ibn Malik 2286 with narrations, ‘Aishah Umm al-Mu’minin with 2210 narrations, ‘Abdullah ibn al-‘Abbas with 1660 narrations, Jabir ibn Abdullah with 1540 narrations, Abu Sa‘id al-Khudi with 1170 narrations, and others respectively.

Al-Imam Zainuddin al-Iraqi (d. 806H) claims that Abu Hurairah, according to Ahmad ibn Hanbal and others, had the higher number of narrations than other companions, even though he only knew Prophet Muhammad for four years and a few months. However, if the number of narrations is clarified, the hadiths narrated by Abu Hurairah exceed 5000 hadiths including sahih (valid), dha’if (weak) and maudhu‘ (forged) hadiths. The number also covers mukarrar (repeated) hadiths and not all of those 5000 hadiths are narrated directly from Prophet Muhammad, but heard or adopted from other best companions.

In the seven narrators with the most number of hadiths, Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ibn al-‘As is not mentioned as the hadiths he wrote in al-sahifah al-sadiqah, according to Azizah Fawwal Babti in Mausu’ah al-A’lam, equal to 1000 hadiths, but only 700 hadiths have come to us.
However, Abu Hurairah as the companion with the most number of hadiths has given testimony saying the number of hadiths narrated by Abdullah ibn 'Amru ibn al-As (d. 65H) has the large portion and exceeds those narrated by Abu Hurairah himself. This testimony is recorded by Imam al-Bukhari in his Sahih book as follows:

حَدَّثـَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ، قَالَ: حَدَّثـَنَا سُفْيَانُ، قَالَ حَدَّثـَنَا عَمْرٌو، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنِ وَهْبُ بْنُ مُنَبِّهٍ، عَنْ أَخِيهِ، مَا مِنْ أَصْحَابِ النَّبِِّ

Meaning: “There are no companions who narrated more hadiths than I except ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru. He wrote them while I did not” [H.R. Bukhari].

The activity of writing hadiths undergone by ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ibn al-‘As has led him to produce a book entitled al-Sahifah al-Sadiqah. He could collect the great number of hadiths which is seen from his statement saying he wrote all the hadiths he heard from Prophet Muhammad, whether he said them in a state of anger or in a state of calm. Although what he did was rejected by some of the Quraysh at first, but Prophet Muhammad affirmed that everything came from him is the truth, so it was worth writing. Therefore, Abu Hurairah acknowledged the number of narrations owned by ‘Abdullah exceeds the number of narrations he had. However, the facts that exist today are in contrast to what he said, the number of narrations Abdullah ibn ‘Amru narrated is only 700 hadiths while Abu Hurairah narrated 5374 hadiths.  

According to Shamsuddin al-Kirmani (d. 786H), a well-known hadith scholar in the eighth century who interpreted the Sahih book by Imam Bukhari says that the number of hadiths narrated by ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ibn al-As is less than those narrated by Abu Hurairah due to their area of residence. Here, Abdullah ibn’ Amr lived in Egypt which was not a priority area for hadith seekers, whereas Abu Hurairah lived in the city of Medina as the main destination for the seekers from various regions. Imam Ibn Hajar al-‘Asqalani (d. 52H) in Fath al-Bari bi Sharh Sahih al-Bukhari, and Abu Yahya Zakariya al-Ansari in Minhat al-Bari bi Sharh Sahih al-Bukhari quote and agree with this opinion. Furthermore al-Kirmani (d. 786H) describes istithna’ (exception) illa ma kana on the matan may be used as istithna’ munqati’ (invalid exception). Hence, the purpose of Abu Hurairah’s words is the number of narrations made by Abdullah ibn ‘Amru is more than that of Abu Hurairah who did not write, because according to the custom, two people who learn and listen to the hadiths of a sheikh, that who writes the hadiths would have more narration than that who does not write. However, if the cause is that Abu Hurairah did not write, such cause contradicts to the hadith narrated by Hasan ibn ‘Amru ibn Umayyah al-Damri when delivering a hadith he had heard from Abu Hurairah, but Abu Hurairah denied it saying: “if you have heard the hadith from me, then it’s written on my note.” Abu Hurairah then showed his book about the hadith and found it in the book. From the quality aspect, the above hadith narrated by Hammam ibn Munabbih is more powerful (asahhu) than that narrated by Hasan ibn Amru. These two

---

contradictory hadiths are connected by Imam Ibn Hajar al-‘Asqalani concluding Abu Hurairah did not write the hadith at the time of Muhammad’s prophethood, but soon after he wrote it, or perhaps he was not the one who wrote it, but someone else.\textsuperscript{67}

According to Imam Ibn Hajar al-‘Asqalani (d. 852H),\textsuperscript{68} the exception to the matan (actual wording of the hadith) refers to a continuous exception (istithna muttasil), which means the Abu Hurairah’s statement is not in accordance with the number of narrations made by ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ibn al-‘As due to the following factors:

First, ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru was an expert in worship who always spent more time worshiping than teaching, which causes the narrations he had were transferred to others.

Second, the subjugation by Muslims over non-Muslim territories causes ‘Abdullah ibn Amr live in the colonies, Egypt or Tha’if, the two areas which were not the main destinations for people to seek hadiths as they did in the city of Medina long ago. In the meantime, Abu Hurairah continued giving fatwas and narrating hadiths to those who studied hadiths in the city of Medina until the end of his life, so it is not surprising that the number of narrations made by Abu Hurairah is more than that of ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru. Imam Bukhari mentions there were about 800 people from the tabi’in (followers) circle, who narrated hadiths from Abu Hurairah.

Third: The privilege granted to Abu Hurairah through the prayer of Prophet Muhammad asking him not to forget what he narrated as mentioned in the following hadith:

\[ \text{عَنْ أَبيِ هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قُلْتُ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، إِنِّ أَسَْعُ } \]
\[ \text{»} \]
\[ \text{ابْسُـطْ رِدَاءَكَ } \]
\[ \text{مِنْـكَ حَدِيثًـا كَثِـيرًا أَنْسَـاهُ؟ قَـالَ } \]
\[ \text{ضُمَّـهُ } \]
\[ \text{فَبَسَـطْتُهُ، قَـالَ: فَغَـرَفَ بِيَدَيْـهِ، ثَُّ قَـالَ } \]
\[ \text{رواه البخاري}. \]

Meaning: Abu Hurairah (May Allah be pleased with him) said: “O Messenger of Allah, I’ve heard many hadiths from you, but I forget them. The Messenger of Allah then replied: spread your turban. I immediately spread it, but the Messenger took it with both hands while saying: hug it, then I will hold it and after that, I will not forget a bit” (H.R. Bukhari).

Fourth, ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Amru arrived on the land of Sham carrying the books belonging to the People of the Books (ahlul kitab) and he read these books and narrated the contents to others. This caused many of the senior tabi’in avoid and leave the narrations coming from him.

Conclusion

The life of Prophet Muhammad for twenty-three years during his prophethood, both in Mecca and Medina, has produced many good hadiths through his words, actions, and provisions for his friends. These hadiths are not all written by his companions as they recorded and wrote the Holy Qur’an back then, but only some companions gathered and wrote his hadiths as the majority of them could not write or did not get permission from him. Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ibn al-‘As was one of the people who had the opportunity to write the hadiths. This opportunity to write is what made the number of his narrations more than any other companions at first. Abu Hurairah even admitted it and declared him as a friend who had the most number of hadiths and it exceeds the number of his hadiths.

The factors causing the number of narrations made by Abdullah ibn ‘Amru ‘As fewer than that narrated by Abu Hurairah are classified into two; one factor was caused by Abdullah ibn ‘Amru himself and the other came from Abu Hurairah. In Abdullah’s part, the factors include 1). Domicile factor in which Abdullah ibn ‘Amru spent his life until he died in Egypt and this city was not the main destination or even destinations for hadith seekers. Consequently, not many of his

\textsuperscript{67}Al-‘Asqalani, \textit{Fath al-Bari}, Vol. 1, 261.

\textsuperscript{68}Ibid.
friends narrated from him. On the contrary, Abu Hurairah lived in the city of Medina as the center destination for people to seek hadiths as many companions who lived in this city after the death of the Prophet. 2). Individual Factor, in which Abdullah was known as an expert in worship and always spent his time in worshiping Allah. This causes him to have little time to transfer and narrate the hadith that he wrote, 3). Precautionary factor. Here, Abdullah ibn ‘Amr used to read the books belonging to the People of the Book (ahl al-kitab) and tell the contents to others. This made the hadith seekers begin to be cautious of the narrations coming from him to anticipate that they did not narrate news from the People of the Book or israiliyat.

At last, the factor coming from Abu Hurairah is the hadiths he narrated are not all from the Prophet Muhammad, but in many occasions he narrated from other companions. Consequently, the number of the narrations he made includes sahih (valid), dha’if (weak) and maudhu’ (forged) as well as mukarrar (repeated) hadiths.

References


al-Bukhari, Abu ’Abdullah Muhammad ibn


